ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, June 20, 2023. This meeting is open to the public and will be held in Common Council Chambers, Third Floor, City Hall, 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY, and also conducted remotely using videoconferencing technology. In-person attendance at City Hall may be limited and will be permitted on a first-come, first-served basis. Members of the public are strongly encouraged to participate remotely. Virtual participation in public meetings is authorized by Part WW of Chapter 56 of the Laws of 2022 of New York State and Local Law 2022-05. More information, including the written procedures governing the use of videoconferencing technology, is available at http://www.cityofithaca.org/339/Boards-Committees.

For remote viewing/attendance: A live stream of the proceedings is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtJN1P_RFaFW2IVCnTrDg; a recording will made available through the same link following the conclusion of the proceedings. If you are a member of the public wanting to observe the meeting, please simply watch the live stream. If you are an applicant or member of the public wishing to comment during the proceedings, you should both follow the meeting via the live stream and join the meeting via Zoom. (You will be placed in a waiting room until your allotted time to speak.) Members of the public wishing to be heard are strongly encouraged to register by 3:00 PM on the day of the meeting. To register, please send your name and physical address to mmclain@cityofithaca.org, subject line: “ILPC Speaker Registration – June 2023”. Written comments may be submitted to the aforementioned email address no later than 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting. Use the subject line: “ILPC Comments – June 2023,” and include your legal name and physical address along with your comments in the body of the email. Each comment is limited to three minutes and will be read aloud at the meeting.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

II. NEW BUSINESS
   A. 200 Highland Avenue, Cornell Heights Historic District – Early Design Guidance
      https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/View/15433/ILPC-Pre-App-Presentation-2023-06-09-200-Highland-Ave
   B. 601 East State Street, East Hill Historic District – Early Design Guidance
      https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/View/15434/ILPC-Pre-App-Presentation-2023-06-09-601-E-State-St
   C. Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, Cornell Arts Quad Historic District - Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness Approval

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   • 05.16.2023

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
IV. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS
A. 2023 Historic Ithaca Preservation Awards: Nominations due July 24, 2023

V. ADJOURNMENT

ACCESSING ONLINE MEETING MATERIALS:
Online meeting materials, like applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness and supporting materials, are available electronically via the “Document Center” on the City web site (www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter), under “Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission” > “Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness” and in the relevant address folder. Please do not hesitate to contact our office if you have any questions or you need any assistance accessing the meeting materials.
MLR 200 HIGHLAND
ILPC PRE-APPLICATION PRESENTATION
June 20, 2023
Modern Living Rentals, Charlie O’Connor
200 Highland Ave
Ithaca, NY, 14850
PROJECT DESCRIPTION

As a feasibility study for the property located at 200 Highland Avenue, we have explored a new construction/renovation scenario that aims to maximize the lot’s potential and bring the property to its highest and best use.

There is one primary structure currently on the lot listed as a 1 unit apartment building, functioning as a cooperative household legal for up to 15 unrelated occupants.

The existing lot coverage is less than one-third of the maximum allowed, meaning a larger multiple dwelling structure could be built by right as long as the unit count does not exceed 5 units. Additionally, the site is provided with 10 parking spaces to accommodate a larger number of occupants within multiple dwellings, depending on the unit distribution.

Sited in the Cornell Heights Historic District, any new construction must be designed to compliment the character of the surrounding historic buildings and be approved by the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commision.

Although a zoning variance to build a second primary structure on this site would be unlikely, an addition to the existing structure is allowed by right. Any addition, however, will have to be sensitive to the existing building and the surrounding neighborhood in order to gain the approval of the ILPC. Guidelines for designing additions to historic buildings limit the scale and location of the new construction to maintain the prominence of the original construction.

To maximize unit count and occupancy on this site, an addition would have to be of a similar scale to the existing building. The following plan avoids competition with the existing building by proposing a seemingly separate new building that is connected underground to the full basement of the existing building. The intended outcome is a large site with two homes of similar scale that share historic sensibilities in massing, detailing, and proportion.

While the Cornell Heights Historic District was historically less densely developed, conceived as a romantic, park-like suburban area near the Cornell Campus, there is some precedent for more tightly spaced houses nearby. The property at 200 Highland Ave is at the head of Heights Court, a stretch of closely spaced single family and multi-family houses in the same district.

The existing building is intended to be renovated without disturbing any exterior features.
# ZONING REVIEW

**Address:** 200 Highland Ave, Ithaca, New York 14850

**Parcel No:** 500700-8.-1-4

**Zone:** Residential Multifamily R-U, Cornell Heights Historic District Overlay

**Lot Size:** 20,038 SF

**Allowable Uses:**
- Multifamily Dwelling
- Cooperative Household

**Max Lot Coverage:** 30% or 6,000 SF
- Existing Building Area: 1,850 SF
- Remaining Buildable Area: 4,150 SF

**Max Height:** 40’ & 4 Stories

**Min Front Yard:** 25’

**Min Side Yard:** 10’

**Min Rear Yard:** 32’

**Min Lot Size:**
- Multiple dwelling, New construction: 16,500 SF for 1st 1-3 units and +1,500 SF for each additional unit
- Cooperative Household: 16,500 SF

**Parking:**
- Existing Parking: 10 Spaces (verified with Ithaca Bldg Div)

---

**Proposed Scenario:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unit 1-3</th>
<th>Unit 4-5</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16,500 SF</td>
<td>3,000 SF</td>
<td>19,500 SF Required Lot</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Total Unit Distribution:**
  - (1) six-bedroom unit: 3 Parking Spaces
  - (3) five-bedroom units: 6 Parking Spaces
  - (1) three-bedroom units: 1 Parking Spaces

*No Variance for Lot Size required
*No Variance for Parking required

The existing building will undergo interior renovations to provide:
- (1) six-bedroom unit
- (1) five-bedroom unit

Subtotal: 11 bedrooms

The new construction will provide:
- (1) three-bedroom unit
- (2) five-bedroom units

Subtotal: 13 bedrooms

**Total Bed / Unit Count: 24 beds / 5 units**
SITE PLAN - EXISTING

SCALE = 1:30

Building Footprint: 1,350 SF
SITE PLAN - PROPOSED

SCALE = 1:30

Addition Footprint: 1,715 SF
Below Grade Footprint: 215 SF
FLOOR PLANS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

FIRST FLOOR PLAN
FLOOR PLANS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

SECOND FLOOR PLAN
FLOOR PLANS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

THIRD FLOOR PLAN
BASEMENT PLAN

The underground passageway connecting the addition to the existing building is intended to be constructed as a concrete tunnel and covered with soil and vegetation to allow the addition to appear as a separate structure entirely.
SUMMARY

Given its close proximity to the existing historic home, this new structure has been designed with sensitivity to scale, proportions and roof style. The front porch and finer grained massing of the addition face the existing structure to avoid overwhelming its presence on the site.

The broader elevation facing the side street, Westbourne Ln, features a regulated facade, embracing design principles of repetition, proportion, and balance that bridge between contemporary and historic philosophies. Subtle playful shifts of the fenestration that break its pattern are an attempt to empathize with the surrounding historic buildings, products of alterations of their own over the years, and eschew an image of “high design” superior to design of the past.

Similar to the existing building, the addition has three stories of apartment units. The third floor is designed within the roof attic space to accommodate a roof line that evokes a lower, two-story structure.

Detailing is kept simple to maintain a sense of newness and avoid imitating historic details with modern finishes. Materials include architectural shingle roof, composite wood siding (prefinished LP Smartside), Marvin aluminum clad wood windows, Wood entry door with transom, and a stucco parge for any exposed foundation.
3D VIEWS

FROM NORTHEAST
3D VIEWS

FROM EAST
3D VIEWS

FROM SOUTHEAST
3D VIEWS

FROM NORTHWEST
3D VIEWS

FROM WEST
ELEVATIONS

SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

EAST ELEVATION
ELEVATIONS
SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

NORTH ELEVATION
ELEVATIONS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

WEST ELEVATION
ELEVATIONS
SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

SOUTH ELEVATION

BELOW GRADE PASSAGE TO EXISTING BUILDING
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger
YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y. TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713
ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** ** **
IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S):
2. COUNTY: Tompkins TOWN/CITY: Ithaca VILLAGE:
3. STREET LOCATION: 200 Highland Avenue
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[X]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Daniel M. Scheraga ADDRESS: Slaterville Springs, N.Y.
6. USE: Original: residential Present: residential
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[X] No[ ]
   Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard[X] b. stone[ ] c. brick[ ] d. board and batten[ ]
   e. cobblestone[ ] f. shingles[X] g. stucco[ ] other:

9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   (if known)
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]
   b. wood frame with light members[X]
   c. masonry load bearing walls[ ]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other

10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent[ ] b. good[X] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]

11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site[X] b. moved[ ] if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

See Continuation Sheet

13. MAP

[Map image]
14. THREATS TO BUILDING:  
   a. none known[X]  
   b. zoning[ ]  
   c. roads[ ]  
   d. developers[ ]  
   e. deterioration[ ]  
   f. other:  

15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:  
   a. barn[ ]  
   b. carriage house[ ]  
   c. garage[ ]  
   d. privy[ ]  
   e. shed[X]  
   f. greenhouse[ ]  
   g. shop[ ]  
   h. gardens[ ]  
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet  
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet  

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):  
   a. open land[ ]  
   b. woodland[ ]  
   c. scattered buildings[X]  
   d. densely built-up[ ]  
   e. commercial[ ]  
   f. industrial[ ]  
   g. residential[X]  
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet  

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:  
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)  
   See Continuation Sheet  

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE  
   (including interior features if known):  
   See Continuation Sheet  

SIGNIFICANCE  

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: ca. 1905  

   ARCHITECT: unknown  

   BUILDER: unknown  

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:  
   See Continuation Sheet  

21. SOURCES:  
   See Continuation Sheet  

22. THEME:  
   See Continuation Sheet
11.

15i. A large side lawn extends down to Highland Avenue and back to Westbourne Lane. There is a flowering bush at the northeast corner of the porch and a single shade tree at the opposite end. Tall conifers and shade trees border the property on the south.

15j.

16h.

17. This building is set on a slight rise and oriented perpendicular to Highland Avenue. There are other period houses across at the intersection of Highland Avenue and Heights Court; diagonally across on Highland Avenue is a large modern fraternity house. The house is one of approximately 150 buildings in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District, an early-twentieth century residence park and suburban development in the northeast section of the city of Ithaca.

18. This two and one-half story residence has a front facing gable roof with deep, closed eaves that overhang wall surfaces. Pent roofs enclose gable ends. There are gabled dormers along north and south elevations. A one-story side wing extends northward from the main (east) facade. A one-story veranda with flat roof and square wood columns runs the full-width of the main facade and extends across the east wall of the adjacent side wing. The building is sided in clapboard on the first floor and is sheathed in coursed wood shingles on upper levels and in the dormers. Entrance is through a small entry vestibule that projects out onto the veranda. It features a double wood door in a simple wood enframement. A two-story cutaway bay window extends upward into the gabled dormer along the south elevation. The same feature is found on the north facade except that the bay window is squared. Other windows throughout the building are varied. They include a combination of single and paired 1/1, 12/1, 6/1, and 15/1 double-hung sash of differing sizes and configurations. There are also paired verticle casements and a ribbon of multi-pane casement windows on the one-story side wing. The house rests on an uncoursed rubble foundation.
This house was built for Chief William B. Smith, an Ithaca attorney. It is not clear if Smith ever lived here. The first resident at this address is not actually listed in city directories until 1909. At that time it was the Bandhu Fraternity and the following year the house was listed as the "Cornell Alumni House.” The Phi Epsilon Pi fraternity subsequently occupied the house until 1918 and the Delta Zeta Sorority was here for a time in the 1920’s. The house has been occupied by Cornell University students since at least the 1950’s.

MLR 601 STATE
ILPC PRE-APPLICATION PRESENTATION
June 20, 2023
Modern Living Rentals, Charlie O’Connor
601 E State St
Ithaca, NY, 14850
PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The property at 601 E State St, owned by the client, has enough square footage to support two separate multi-family dwellings by right. This project aims to maximize the lot’s potential and bring the property to its highest and best use. The plan is to build a new multi-family dwelling facing Ferris St in the open space next to the existing historic multi-family dwelling facing State St. Sited in a designated Historic District, the new construction will be designed to compliment the character of the surrounding historic buildings in form and function. The project has the potential to enhance the historic district by providing appropriate infill along Ferris St. Without having to replicate historic details, the new construction should exist in harmony with those sensibilities of the past.

As proposed, this project will require an Area Variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA) and the approval of the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation commission (ILPC). The parking requirement for the new apartments will be satisfied by providing the appropriate number of spaces off site within 500 ft of the lot, so no parking variance will be required.

The ILPC adopted design guidelines for historic districts on May 14, 2013, that emphasize the importance of placement and orientation as well as scale and massing. This project accommodates the historic visual characteristics of the street on which it fronts in regards to the rhythm of solid and void, position of the primary entrance, and general size and geometry. In following these design guidelines, the project encroaches on the required rear yard.

It is likely that the ILPC will not approve a project that does not violate the rear yard setback.
ZONING REVIEW

Address: 601 East State Street, Ithaca, New York 14850
Parcel No: 68.-10-2
Zone: Residential Multifamily R-3A, East Hill Historic District Overlay
Lot Size: 14,374 SF

Allowable Uses:
- Multifamily Dwelling (Over 4 Unrelated or over 3 Dwelling Units)

Max Lot Coverage: 35% ~ 5,030 SF
- Existing Building Area: 2,000 SF
- Remaining Buildable Area: 3,030 SF

Min Green Space: 25% ~ 3,594 SF

Max Height: 40' & 4 Stories
Min Front Yard: 10' - Corner lot with two front yards
Min Side Yard: 10' & 5'
Min Rear Yard: 20% of Depth = 0.2 x 175' = 35'

Min Lot Size:
- Multiple dwelling, New construction: 6,000 SF for 1st 1-3 units and +750 SF for each additional unit
- Additional 500 SF for ea room let for profit not applicable

Max Unit Count:
- Existing Lot Size: 14,374 SF
- Existing Building: 2 Units, 6,000 SF min lot size
- Remaining Lot SF for new Multifamily Dwelling: 8,374 SF
- Unit 1-3: 6,000 SF
- Unit 4-6: (750 SF * 3 Units) = 2,250 SF
- Total: 8,250 SF
- 6 Units Max in new Multifamily Dwelling allowable by right

Min Parking Count:
- Existing Building:
  - (1) Four Bedroom Unit: 2 Spaces
  - (1) Five Bedroom Unit: 2 Spaces
- New Building:
  - (6) Three Bedroom Units: 6 Spaces

Total: 10 Spaces
Existing on City File: 4 Spaces
6 Off-Site Spaces will be required for proposed construction
DISTRICT PLAN

The site is located at the corner of E State Street and Ferris Place. Looking at a map of the building footprints in this area of the East Hill Historic District, it is possible to imagine the appropriate massing and placement for a new building on this site, shown here as a rough outline on the south end of the site. The design is intended to provide sensible urban infill and continue the rhythm and scale of the houses on Ferris Place.

The following page shows the site plan at a larger scale and demonstrates that a building in this location would not be compliant with current zoning setback regulations. It is worth noting that the setback regulations on this site are not amenable to the surrounding historic building fabric due to the nature of how yards are determined for corner lots.
SITE PLAN - EXISTING
SCALE = 1:30
SITE PLAN - PROPOSED
SCALE = 1:30
FIRST FLOOR PLAN

Based on our Code Review, the new building may have 6 units. This design distributes 6 units across 3 stories. The grade of the site allows one of these stories to be a walk-out basement, accessed from the path to the basement of the existing multi-family building on the same lot. The most efficient way to organize the units will be 2 units per floor with three bedrooms each.
FLOOR PLANS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

SECOND FLOOR PLAN
FLOOR PLANS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

BASEMENT PLAN
SUMMARY

The design takes inspiration from the adjacent historic buildings with its distinctive hip roof, oriented along the street facade to emphasize the building’s horizontality and break down its scale. This is further reinforced by the trim bands at the base, second floor and roof edge.

The window proportion and rhythm is in sync with the adjacent buildings. Casement windows with a more unique muntin pattern help the building straddle the line between modern and historic.

We’ve also chosen a monochromatic palette with dark gray siding and trim, to simplify. The porch helps break down the weight of the facade and connect it to the street; natural wood trim and structural elements provide warmth as well. The porch is imagined as modern interpretation of the traditional front porch with its flat roof, and cleaner timber elements.

Materials include architectural shingle roof, composite wood siding (prefinished LP Smartside), Marvin aluminum clad wood windows, Wood entry door, and a stucco base course.
3D VIEWS

FROM NORTH
3D VIEWS

FROM EAST
3D VIEWS

FROM SOUTH
3D VIEWS

FROM SOUTHEAST
3D VIEWS

FROM SOUTHWEST
ELEVATIONS
SCALE: 3/32" = 1'-0"

EAST ELEVATION
ELEVATIONS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

NORTH ELEVATION
ELEVATIONS
SCALE: 3/32” = 1’-0”

WEST ELEVATION
ELEVATIONS

SCALE: 3/32” = 1'-0”

SOUTH ELEVATION
Continuation Sheet: 1
Address: 601 East State Street
Local Historic District: East Hill

View: North & East Facades

View: North Facade

Documentation: John Auwaerter
Date: 2/92
Alterations:
2. 601 E. State St. (Prior to 1900, it was 161 E. State St.)
3. Private.
4. 
5. 
6. residence. residence.
7. (Ext.)yes. (Int.)no, private home.
8. a. b. (foundation) f. (under gable the pediment section; the shed roof at the front (N.) of the house; and below the railing sections of the 2 front porches. *except at the gable at the back (S.) of the house.)
9. 
10. b.
11. a. c: Between 1898 and 1904, the roof of the front porch was changed from slate (or tin) to shingles.
   - Sanborn Map did not show complete section of this house until 1910. At that time, there were 2 out buildings at the back yard of the house: a 1¾ level shed to the east, and a 1-level garage to the west. Both are nonexistent now.
   - Between 1904 and 1910, the back porch was added.
   - All according to Sanborn Maps.
12. 
13. 
14. a.
15. 
16. 
17. g. 
18. The house is located on a corner lot formed by E. State St. to the north and Ferris Place to the east. This house is similar in structural system and scale to most other houses in the neighborhood. Nonetheless, it is much further set back into the yard than its neighbors.
19. There is a triple stain glassed stair windows on the east facade. The much enclosed 2 small front porches each has shingle siding below the hand rail, and pattern wood grill on transverse level.
20. Prior to 1873 when for the first time appeared in city directory. Accordingly, this house is the earliest establishment in this block.
21. This house is likely the earliest known structure in the block. The first known tenant from 1873 to 1893 is Benjamin Ferris, who was a distinguish attorney by profession. He was also the President of Cornell Library (date unknown), and the President of the Village (of Ithaca?) from 1841 to 1852. It’s possible that the name of the street next to the house was named after him.
22. The 2nd known tenant from 1900 to 1916 is Willard Georgia who was a bookkeeper and his family continued to live in this house until 1946.
23. Obituaries and city directories at DeWitt Historical Society.
June 12, 2023

Letter Request for Extension of Certificate of Appropriateness granted on June 15, 2021

Dear Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission:

We are writing pursuant to City Code §228-8 to request an extension of time for the Certificate of Appropriateness issued by the ILPC on June 15, 2021 that allowed Cornell University to proceed with certain work on and near Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza. I am including a copy of the Certificate for your convenience. The library is a non-contributing structure in the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District, and ILPC approved the installation of an aluminum entrance door, construction of a concrete terrace, and placement of two granite benches.

Cornell University has hired the architecture firm, Goody Clancy, and the design is currently in the Design Development Phase. The current schedule is to have bids in hand in November 2023 and for the contractor to complete construction of the overall project in July 2025. It is likely that the work covered by the Certificate of Appropriateness will be complete before that date.

Given the approval expires on June 15th, we are submitting a formal request to ILPC for a 2-year extension to allow adequate time for the finalization of construction documents and completion of the work covered by the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

J. Shermeta, AIA LEED AP
Associate University Architect
Cornell University
j.shermeta@cornell.edu
607 255 6870
Re.: Building Permit #TBD

At the regular monthly meeting held on June 15, 2021, the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission approved the following work at Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, as more particularly described in the attached resolution:

- The installation of an aluminum entrance door, the construction of a concrete terrace, and the placement of two granite benches at the third bay east from the northwest corner of the first story of the north elevation.

Conditions of approval (if any):

- None

The Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission appreciates your efforts to preserve the historic and architectural character of the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District.

Please note the work approved under this Certificate of Appropriateness must be completed within twenty-four months of the date of the meeting at which the work was approved.

Bryan McCracken
Historic Preservation Planner
Secretary to the Commission
RESOLUTION: Moved by S. Stein, seconded by D. Kramer.

WHEREAS, Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, is located within the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1990, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated May 26, 2021, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by J. Shermeta on behalf of property owner Cornell University, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); and three sheets of design drawings, dated June 27, 2021, and titled “Cover Sheet” (CS), “New Work Floor Plan & Exterior Elevation” (A101), and “New Work Interior Section & Rendering” (A201), and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, and the City of Ithaca's Cornell Arts Quad Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the installation of an aluminum entrance door, the construction of a concrete terrace, and the placement of two granite benches at the third bay east from the northwest corner of the first story of the north elevation, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant has provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a public hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on June 15, 2021, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

The period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Arts Quad is identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Arts Quad Historic District Summary Significance Statement as 1868-1919.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, was constructed to replace Boardman Hall in 1960 and is
considered a non-contributing resource within the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District.

Although it was constructed outside of the period of significance and is considered a non-contributing resource, the architect-designed Olin Library is now over fifty years old and is likely eligible for individual listing on the State and National Registers of Historic Places. Designed by the architecture firm of Warner, Burns, Toan, and Lunde, the building reflects the high visual and material quality of the contributing buildings within the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District. The rusticated, random ashlar base replicates the wall treatment of Boardman Hall (demolished, 1958) and complements the stonework of Stimson Hall and Uris Library; the design of the lead-coated copper, mansard roof echoes the roof cladding of McGraw Tower; and the regularized and vertically oriented fenestration reflects the traditional configuration and proportions of windows in the surrounding historic buildings.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

As a non-contributing structure, Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, by definition, does not possess historic materials or features that are subject to protection under the Principles enumerated in Section 228-5 of the Municipal Code or the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The ILPC’s evaluation of the proposed work is therefore limited to the assessment of the impact of the proposed work on adjacent historic structures in the district and on the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District as a whole, with the guiding principle being that the proposed work must not further reduce the compatibility of the non-contributing structure with its historic environment.
With respect to Standard #9, the proposed entrance, terrace and benches are compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features of their historic environment.

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal meets criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC approves the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: S. Stein
Seconded by: D. Kramer
In Favor: S. Stein, D. Kramer, E. Finegan, S. Gibian
Against: K. Olson
Abstain: 0
Absent: A. Smith
Vacancies: 1

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner's representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
WHEREAS, Olin Library, 161 Ho Plaza, is located within the Cornell Arts Quad Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1990, and

WHEREAS, a Certificate of Appropriateness was issued by the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) for the installation of an aluminum entrance door, construction of a concrete terrace, and placement of two granite benches on the north elevation of the building on June 15, 2021, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-7 of the Municipal Code, “if the construction of a project approved for a Certificate of Appropriateness has not commenced within twenty-four (24) months of the date of approval, such approval shall expire, unless an extension has been granted by the Landmarks Preservation Commission following a written request by the applicant,” and

WHEREAS, work on the above described project did not commence within the twenty-four (24) month period, and

WHEREAS, a written request for an extension of Certificate of Appropriateness approval for this project was submitted to the ILPC for review by J. Shermeta, AIA LEED AP, on behalf of property owner Cornell University on June 15, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC APPROVES/DENIES the request for an extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness approval for a period of twenty-four months.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: XXX
Seconded by: XXX
In favor: XXX
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0
BUILDING STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY
UNIQUE SITE NO. ____________________________
QUAD ____________________________
SERIES ____________________________
NEG. NO. ____________________________

YOUR NAME: Mary Donohue
DATE: 9/20/78

YOUR ADDRESS: 111 Cascadilla Ave.
TELEPHONE: 277-0486

ORGANIZATION (if any): Cornell University

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S): Olin Library
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
TOWN/CITY: Ithaca
VILLAGE:
3. STREET LOCATION: South End of Cornell Arts Quadrangle
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public [ ] b. private [x]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Cornell University
ADDRESS: Ithaca, NY
6. USE: Original: Library Present: Library
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes [ ] No [ ]
Interior accessible: Explain Yes = Library

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard [ ] b. stone [ ] c. brick [ ] d. board and batten [ ]
   e. cobblestone [ ] f. shingles [ ] g. stucco [ ] other [ ] concrete
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints [ ]
   b. wood frame with light members [ ]
   c. masonry load bearing walls [ ]
   d. metal (explain) steel
   e. other
10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent [x] b. good [ ] c. fair [ ] d. deteriorated [ ]
11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site [x] b. moved [ ] if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

12. PHOTO:

   HP-1

CORNELL UNIVERSITY
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known  X b. zoning  c. roads  
d. developers  e. deterioration  
f. other: ____________________________

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:  
a. barn  b. carriage house  c. garage  
d. privy  e. shed  f. greenhouse  
g. shop  h. gardens  
i. landscape features: ____________________________  
j. other: ____________________________

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):  
a. open land  X  b. woodland  
c. scattered buildings  X  
d. densely built-up  e. commercial  
f. industrial  g. residential  
h. other: ____________________________

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:  
(Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)  
Olin Library is located at the south edge of the Arts Quad between Uris Library on the west and Stimson Hall on the east. It occupies the site of Boardman Hall, designed by William Henry Miller, and intended for the Law School. Boardman Hall featured one of his finest interiors and was demolished in 1958.

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE (including interior features if known):  
This new building makes a conscious effort to relate to its neighbors by employing regular fenestration, the same height for the cornice line, a modified mansard roof, and a gray slate roof which has a pattern similar to the one on McGraw Tower of Uris Library.

SIGNIFFICANCE
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: Completed 1960

ARCHITECT: Warner, Toan, and Lunde

BUILDER: ____________________________

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:

21. SOURCES:

22. THEME:
Alterations: Construction currently underway on north-east end of building for connection to the underground Kroch Library.
Alterations: Construction currently underway on north-east end of building for connection to the underground Kroch Library.