ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, April 18, 2023. This meeting is open to the public and will be held in Common Council Chambers, Third Floor, City Hall, 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY, and also conducted remotely using videoconferencing technology. In-person attendance at City Hall may be limited and will be permitted on a first-come, first-served basis. Members of the public are strongly encouraged to participate remotely. Virtual participation in public meetings is authorized by Part WW of Chapter 56 of the Laws of 2022 of New York State and Local Law 2022-05. More information, including the written procedures governing the use of videoconferencing technology, is available at http://www.cityofithaca.org/339/Boards-Committees.

NOTICE: The elevator in City Hall is out of service and the meeting room is accessible by stairs only. Remote participation is available and encouraged, however, if you require additional accommodations, please contact Planning & Development at 607) 274-6550 or mmclain@cityofithaca.org

For remote viewing/attendance: A live stream of the proceedings is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtIN1P_RFaFW2IVCnTrDg; a recording will made available through the same link following the conclusion of the proceedings. If you are a member of the public wanting to participate in the proceedings, you should both follow the meeting via the live stream and join the meeting via Zoom. (You will be placed in a waiting room until your allotted time to speak.) Members of the public wishing to be heard are strongly encouraged to register by 3:00 PM on the day of the meeting. Use the subject line: “ILPC – April 2023.” Written comments may be submitted to the aforementioned email address no later than 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting. Each comment is limited to three minutes and will be read aloud at the meeting.

I. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. 319 North Tioga Street, DeWitt Park Historic District – Proposal to Replace Asphalt Shingle Roofing with Standing Seam Metal Roofing. [Application Material Previously Distributed.]

B. 934 Stewart Avenue, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal Remove Two Elevated Metal Walkways on the Primary (East) Façade and Construct a Metal Stairway
   https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/View/15150/ca-app-230418-934-Stewart-Ave

C. 711 East Seneca Street, East Hill Historic District – Proposal to Replace Replacement Windows Installed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
   https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/View/15151/ca-app-230418-711-E-Seneca-St

II. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
III. OLD BUSINESS
   A. 702 East Buffalo Street, East Hill Historic District – Retroactive Request for Approval for the Removal of Railroad Tie Retaining Walls and Landscape Stairs as well as Non-historic Flagstone Walkways in the Front Yard, Regrading the Front Yard, and the Installation of a Concrete Walkway [Application Material Previously Distributed.]

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   • 03.21.2023 [Under Separate Cover]

V. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS
   A. Ithaca Gun Smokestack Public Input Survey – Final Results
   B. Historic Ithaca 2023 Preservation Awards – Nomination deadline: Monday, July 24, 2023, at 5:00 PM

VI. ADJOURNMENT

ACCESSING ONLINE MEETING MATERIALS:
Online meeting materials, like applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness and supporting materials, are available electronically via the “Document Center” on the City web site (www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter), under “Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission” > “Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness” and in the relevant address folder. Please do not hesitate to contact our office if you have any questions or you need any assistance accessing the meeting materials.

"An Equal Opportunity Employer with a commitment to workforce diversification."
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 319 North Tioga Street is located in the DeWitt Park Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1971, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1971, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness dated February 28, 2023, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Stephen Fisher on behalf of property owner Anne Brous, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); and (2) a sample of the proposed material, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 319 North Tioga Street, and the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, the proposed project involves replacing the existing asphalt shingle roofing with standing seam metal roofing, with 16” pans and a light gray color, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on April 18, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the DeWitt Park Historic District is 1820-1930.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Free Classic Queen Anne style residence at 319 North Tioga Street was constructed before 1888.

Constructed within the period of significance of the DeWitt Park Historic District and possessing a high level of architectural integrity, the property is a contributing element of the DeWitt Park Historic District.
In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the replacement of the asphalt shingle roofing with standing seam metal roofing (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (and will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2 and Standard #9, the proposed metal roofing (is/is not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]

RESOLVED, that, based on findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the 319 North Tioga Street and the DeWitt Park Historic District as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further
RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) the criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following condition(s):

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner's representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff, any deviation from the approved plans, including, but not limited to, changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses may result in the issuance by the building department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: ______________ Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): _______________________

Applicant’s Name: Siegara Fisher Phone: 607-277-9960

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): littleheavensprings@gmail.com

Property Address: 319 W. Tioga St., Ithaca

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): Anne Brooks

Owner’s Mailing Address: 293 Curtis Rd., Ithaca

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
☐ New Construction ☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Addition ☐ Signage
☐ Accessory Structure ☐ Demolition
☒ ALTERATION: Primary Structure ☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Remove existing layers of asphalt shingles and install synthetic roof underlayment. Install 26 gauge 10" wide panels of 40 yr. warranty standing seam roofing. A light grayish color. All necessary finish roof trim work included.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Existing shingle roof has met its life expectancy. Roof is worn out and needs to be changed before leak occurs.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner's representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18"×23":

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: SMCCREACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

- photographs of existing conditions
- site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
- drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
- description of design details and materials to be used
- samples of proposed materials
- scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
- historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
- statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
- other (specify):

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): [Signature] Date: 4-28-23

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: _______________
Staff Review: ◐ yes ◐ no  Approved: ◐ yes ◐ no  Referred to ILPC: ◐ yes ◐ no
ILPC Review: ◐ yes ◐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ____________
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Mary Donohue
DATE: 10/30/78

YOUR ADDRESS: 111 Cascadilla Avenue
TELEPHONE: 277-0486

ORGANIZATION (if any): Landmarks Commission of Ithaca, NY

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S): Larkin Insurance
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
TOWN/CITY: Ithaca
3. STREET LOCATION: 319 North Tioga Street
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public b. private [X]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Larkin, Clarence F.
ADDRESS: 319 North Tioga Street
6. USE: Original: Private Residence Present: Offices
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes [X] No [ ]
Interior accessible: Explain Open during business hours

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL: a. clapboard [X] b. stone [ ] c. brick [ ] d. board and batten [ ]
e. cobblestone [ ] f. shingles [ ] g. stucco [ ] other:
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM: a. wood frame with interlocking joints [ ]
b. wood frame with light members [X]
c. masonry load bearing walls [ ]
d. metal (explain) [ ]
e. other [ ]
10. CONDITION: a. excellent [X] b. good [ ] c. fair [ ] d. deteriorated [ ]
11. INTEGRITY: a. original site [X] b. moved [ ] if so, when?
c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
1910 Open porch added to rear

13. MAP:
14. THREATS TO BUILDING:  
a. none known ☑  
b. zoning ☐  
c. roads ☐  
d. developers ☐  
e. deterioration ☐  
f. other:  

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:  
a. barn ☐  
b. carriage house ☐  
c. garage ☐  
d. privy ☐  
e. shed ☐  
f. greenhouse ☐  
g. shop ☐  
h. gardens ☐  
i. landscape features:  
j. other:  

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):  
a. open land ☐  
b. woodland ☐  
c. scattered buildings ☐  
d. densely built-up ☑  
e. commercial ☑  
f. industrial ☐  
g. residential ☐  
h. other:  

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:  
(Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)  
The 300 block of North Tioga was originally a residential area. The buildings on the west side of the street have been replaced with modern construction between 1930 and 1967, but the residences on the east, with 2 exceptions, have been retained and converted into offices. The structure was included in the DeWitt Park Historic District which was nominated to the National Register in 1971.  

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE (including interior features if known):  
This 2½ story, clapboarded house has a long, rectangular plan which follows the shape of the lot. On the north side the house shares a party wall with a row of three brick rowhouses. The facade contains a stained glass window, oval, on the second level at a handsome porch with paired columns on the first.  

SIGNIFICANCE  
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION:  
        c. 1890  

ARCHITECT:  

BUILDER:  

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:  
The house is well maintained example of late nineteenth century eclectic design and it occupies an important position in the block.  

City Maps show that the house was occupied by Frank Eschenburg from 1893 to 1910. City Directories give his occupation as proprietor of the New Ithaca Hotel, Barbershop, and Bath rooms.  
The buildings facade is a handsome composition which features a porch with paired columns on the first floor. The columns are translated into paired pilasters on the second level and pilasters are used to surround the windows of the second level. An irregular roofscape and a variety of window shapes add complexity to the composition. Window shapes include Palladian, oval, and rectangular.  

1. SOURCES:  
City Maps, City Planning Department, 1893, 1899, Ithaca, NY  
Sanborn Maps, 1904, 1910  
City Directories-1898, 1903, 1909  
Real Property Valuation Report, Tompkins County, 1972, Number 61-3-22
Continuation Sheet: 1
Address: 319 North Tioga Street
Local Historic District: DeWitt Park

View: West Facade

View: West Facade

Documentation: John Auwaerter
Date: 2/92
Alterations: Front stairs replaced
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 934 Stewart Ave. is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated March 30, 2023, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by David Elwyn on behalf of property owner Frost Travis, Travis Hyde, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); and (2) two sheets of drawings prepared by Elwyn Palmer, Consulting Engineers, PLLC, dated March 30, 2023, and titled “Existing Conditions and Reconfigured” (S1) and “Proposed Reconstruction Plan and Section” (S2), and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 934 Stewart Ave., and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the demolition of two elevated walkways on the north elevation and their replacement with a two-story stairway, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant has/has not provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on April 18, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.
As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, 934 Stewart Ave. was constructed between 1946 and 1956.

Constructed outside the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, the property is a non-contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

As a non-contributing structure, 934 Stewart Ave., by definition, does not possess historic materials or features that are subject to protection under the Principles enumerated in Section 228-5 of the Municipal Code or the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The ILPC’s evaluation of the proposed project is therefore limited to the assessment of the impact of the proposed work on adjacent historic structures and on the Cornell Heights Historic District as a whole, with the guiding principle being that the proposed work must not further reduce the compatibility of the non-contributing structure within its historic environment.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the demolition of the elevated walkways and the construction of a metal staircase [will/will not] remove distinctive materials and [will/will not] alter features and spaces that characterize the Cornell Heights Historic District.

Also with respect to Standard #9, the proposed stairway [is/is not] compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment.
RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal will/will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal meets/does not meet criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC approves/denies the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following condition:

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 3/30/2023
Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): #44186

Applicant’s Name: David Elwyn
Phone: (607) 272-5060

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): DLE@ElwynPalmer.com

Property Address: Edgecliff Apartments, 934 Stewart Ave.

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): Frost Travis, TravisHyde
Owner’s Mailing Address: ftravis@travishyde.com

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
☐ New Construction
☐ Addition
☐ Accessory Structure
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure
☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Signage
☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 21 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the third Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
**Description of Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):

The proposed work would consist of the replacement and reconfiguration of the East exterior exits from the second and third levels of the building to the sidewalk along Stewart Ave.

The existing exits from the second and third floor levels consist of two separate, steeply-sloped exterior elevated ramps connecting to the raised City sidewalk in two separate locations.

The reconfigured exit would join the second and third level building exits with a new exterior steel stair structure, connecting to a single common landing, with a short nearly-level ramp to the raised City sidewalk.

**Reasons for Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):

The two existing exterior ramps have deteriorated to the point of being unsafe and have been closed to use.

The current paths of egress that these ramps are a part of are not accessible, nor are they code compliant. The exterior ramp slopes greatly exceed the maximum allowable slope of 1 on 12, and the paths or egress within the building leading to the exterior doorways are not accessible due to interior stairways within the corridor connecting levels within the same story.

The reconfigured exterior exit stairway and ramp would be code compliant.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRAKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ____________________________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): __________________________ Date: 3/30/23

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ______________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ____________
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM
DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger
DATE: 05/15/87

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y. TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S): Edgecliff Apartments
2. COUNTY: Tompkins TOWN/CITY: Ithaca
3. STREET LOCATION: 934 Stewart Avenue
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[X]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Cliffside Properties Co.
6. USE: Original: apartment building Present: apartment building
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[X] No[ ]
   Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard[ ] b. stone[ ] c. brick[ ] d. board and batten[ ]
   e. cobblestone[ ] f. shingles[ ] g. stucco[X] other:
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   (if known) a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]
   b. wood frame with light members[X]
   c. masonry load bearing walls[ ]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other
10. CONDITION: a. excellent[ ] b. good[X] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]
11. INTEGRITY: a. original site[X] b. moved[ ] if so, when?
   c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
      See Continuation Sheet

13. MAP:
15i. Large parking area to rear.

15j.

16h.

17. This building abuts Stewart Avenue and sits partially below the grade of that street. There are a few period homes on adjacent property and a large fraternity house to the west at the end of Edgecliff Place. The building overlooks a steep hillside with tall stone retaining wall (east). The apartment building is an intrusion in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District.

18. A four-story apartment building with flat roof. The building is covered in stucco with the exception of a rough-cut stone surface at the northeast corner of the first floor; there is a hooded bay window here with 4/1 and 8/1 double-hung windows. Other windows are primarily multi-pane casements although there are also a few 6/1 double-hung sash. A three-car garage is integrated into the foundation of the building to the rear. There are long sheds used as garages on either side of a rear parking area.

20. This structure was built as an apartment building. It replaced a house built ca. 1903 (home of Clarence A. Martin, prominent local architect and former Dean of the College of Architecture at Cornell University).

21. Ithaca City Directories

22.
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known[ ] b. zoning[ ] c. roads[ ]
   d. developers[ ] e. deterioration[ ]
   f. other:

15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ] b. carriage house[ ] c. garage[ ]
   d. privy[ ] e. shed[ ] f. greenhouse[ ]
   g. shop[ ] h. gardens[ ]
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ] b. woodland[ ]
   c. scattered buildings[ ]
   d. densely built-up[ ] e. commercial[ ]
   f. industrial[ ] g. residential[ ]
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1946-1956
   ARCHITECT: unknown
   BUILDER: unknown

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
    See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
    See Continuation Sheet

22. THEME:
    See Continuation Sheet
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 711 East Seneca Street is located in the East Hill Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1988, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1986, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated March 28, 2023, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Gregory Tumbarello on behalf of Modern Living Rentals, Charlie O’Connor, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); and (2) [list attachments], and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 711 East Seneca Street, and the City of Ithaca’s East Hill Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves replacing vinyl replacement windows that were installed without a Building Permit or a Certificate of Appropriateness, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on April 18, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s East Hill Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the East Hill Historic District is 1830-1932.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Queen-Anne-Style residence at 711 East Seneca Street was constructed c. 1880.
Constructed within the period of significance of the East Hill Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the East Hill Historic District.

The property’s original wood window sash were replaced without a Building Permit or a Certificate of Appropriateness c. 2010. The vinyl replacement, insert-style windows replicate the light configuration and cottage-style proportions of the originals. However, many of the other characteristics of the original sash were not replicated in the replacements.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. When the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the replacement of historic wood windows with vinyl windows removed distinctive materials and altered features and spaces that characterize the property. The installed vinyl replacement windows alter the historic planar relationship between the window sashes and wall surface, and reduce the size of exposed exterior sills. Although the historic muntin patterns of the historic windows were replicated in the insert units, the grill's placement between the panes of glass in the double glazing does not replicate the characteristic shadow lines of historic muntins. In addition to the change in material, the replacement windows themselves do not replicate the characteristic molding profiles or the glazed-to-solid proportions found in the original sash.

With respect to Principle #2 and Standard #6, the Commission was unable to assess the condition of the original sash to make a determination about the severity of their deterioration and need for replacement. The original historic materials were removed from the property.

Also with respect to Standard #6, the existing vinyl replacement windows do not match the old in design, color, texture, materials, and other visual qualities.

With respect to Principle #2 and Standard #9, the replacement of the original wood windows with vinyl replacement windows has destroyed historic materials that characterize the property.

Also with respect to Principle #2, and Standard #9, the proposed Anderson 110 Series windows (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the 711 East Seneca Street and the East Hill Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by:  0
Seconded by:  0
Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 3/28/23 | Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): 43675
Applicant's Name: Gregory Tumbarello | Phone: 9146469585
Applicant's E-Mail address (REQUIRED): Greg@modernlivingrentals.com
Property Address: 711 E Seneca St, Ithaca, NY 14850
Owner's Name (if different from Applicant): Charlie O'Connor
Owner's Mailing Address: PO Box 6707 Ithaca, NY 14851

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
- New Construction
- Addition
- Accessory Structure
- ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- Signage
- Demolition
- ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 21 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the third Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer's data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Roughly 10 years ago the previous owner of the property at 711 E Seneca St did a window replacement job replacing 58 windows on the building. The work was not approved by the ILPC. We recently acquired the rights to the building and are doing some extensive interior renovations shown on the architectural drawings and have been asked to address the issue of the window replacements. The preferred scenario would be to seek approval for the existing replacement windows to remain as part of the building renovation, however if the City cannot approve the existing windows we are prepared to replace them with windows that are approved by the ILPC. Doing a walkthrough with my contractor and materials provider we believe a full replacement would be difficult as some of the windows were installed in difficult ways to measure for replacements. The windows that were replaced matched the original grids and sashes of the original windows on the property.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The reason for the change is to remain in compliance and good standing with the city and to make sure we are doing out best to keep the property historically appropriate.

Existing products were installed by South Seneca Vinyl Windows, it is their 1000 series double hung: https://southsenecawindows.com/vinyl-replacement-windows/double-hung-replacement-windows/

If we cannot get these windows approved as existing, the product line we are looking to use for replacement is the Andersen 100 Series:

https://andersen.appdateroom.com/download/v/2414e1f524be6a82aa261ca20cf2b39adcc9d57350891

We own the building next door at 707 E Seneca St. It was newly built about 6-7 years ago and the 100 Series from Andersen was approved for the new construction and I believe would compliment nicely on the building at 711 E Seneca St
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMCCREACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:
I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify):

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ____________________________ Date: 3/28/23

---

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ________________

Staff Review:  ☐ yes  ☐ no  Approved:  ☐ yes  ☐ no  Referred to ILPC:  ☐ yes  ☐ no

ILPC Review:  ☐ yes  ☐ no

Date of Public Hearing: ________________
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY
UNIQUE SITE NO. 109-40-1253
QUAD
SERIES
NEG. NO.

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Kevin Murphy DATE: April, 1979

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St. TELEPHONE: 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): City Of Ithaca Planning and Development Dept.

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S):
2. COUNTY: Tompkins TOWN/CITY: Ithaca VILLAGE:
3. STREET LOCATION: 711 E. Seneca St.
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public □ b. private □
5. PRESENT OWNER: D. Boardman Lee ADDRESS: same
6. USE: Original: single family residence Present: residence w/ 1 rental unit
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes XX No □
   Interior accessible: Explain private

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard □ b. stone XX c. brick □ d. board and batten □
   e. cobblestone □ f. shingles XX g. stucco □ other:
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM: (if known)
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints □
   b. wood frame with light members XX
   c. masonry load bearing walls □
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other stone foundation
10. CONDITION: a. excellent XX b. good □ c. fair □ d. deteriorated □
11. INTEGRITY: a. original site □ b. moved □ if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
    c. 1930 building divided into 4 appts, one each floor.
    c. 1945 single residence with 1 apartment and underside of porch to west enclosed.

12. PHOTO:

13. MAP:

SCALE: 1" = 200'
711 E. Seneca St.

14. THREATS TO BUILDING:  
   a. none known ☒  
   b. zoning ☐  
   c. roads ☐  
   d. developers ☐  
   e. deterioration ☐  
   f. other: ____________________________

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:  
   a. barn ☐  
   b. carriage house ☐  
   c. garage ☒  
   d. privy ☐  
   e. shed ☐  
   f. greenhouse ☐  
   g. shop ☐  
   h. gardens ☐  
   i. landscape features: ____________________________  
   j. other: ____________________________

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):  
   a. open land ☐  
   b. woodland ☐  
   c. scattered buildings ☐  
   d. densely built-up ☐  
   e. commercial ☐  
   f. industrial ☐  
   g. residential ☒  
   h. other: ____________________________

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:  
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   An intact and relatively untouched building in an architecturally sophisticated 
   and diversified residential neighborhood. Unusual in being a single family 
   residence with rental unit in a neighborhood where most buildings are multi unit 
   apartments.

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE (including interior features if known):  
   This building exhibits a picturesque and random plan. The entrance facade, gable 
   ended to the north, varies from a one story porch to the west with a two story 
   roof slope to the 2½ story facade to the east. There is an upward material 
   transition from stone foundation to bevelled clapboard first story to shingled 
   second story and gables. The north and south gables both rise in the bracketed 
   (continued)

SIGNIFICANCE
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION:  
   c. 1880  
   ARCHITECT: Possibly Wm. Henry Miller  
   BUILDER: ____________________________

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:  
   This building is an architectural conglomeration of charm and expression. 
   It epitomizes the freedom and eclecticism of the late 19th century.

21. SOURCES:  
   Ithaca City Directories, Sanborn Maps: City of Ithaca,  
   Geoffrey Gyrisco, William Henry Miller, unpublished manuscript, Ithaca, N.Y.

22. THEME:
711 East Seneca St.

18. continued:

tiers, that on the south over a two story bay. The sliding sash windows are divided into numerous small panes in the upper sash, over single pane lower sash. A full width porch overlooks the western view and matches the spindle and panel "chalet" motif of the small shed front porch. The heavy bolection cove separating the first and second stories is an unusual feature.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>OCCUPANT</th>
<th>OCCUPATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1899</td>
<td>Prof. I.P. Church</td>
<td>Manager, Swift Brothers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>902 W. Seneca</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1903</td>
<td>Charles A. Elliott</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>Harry G. Morgan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1929</td>
<td>Leonard C. Urquhart</td>
<td>Professor at Cornell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>William Urquhart</td>
<td>retired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>Clifford M. Switzer</td>
<td>Lineman NYSEG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Carl T. Ault</td>
<td>Instructor, Cornell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John N. Cooper</td>
<td>Asst. Prof., Cornell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Norman J. French</td>
<td>Graduate student</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 702 East Buffalo Street is located in the East Hill Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1988, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1986, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated November 28, 2022, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owner Mark W. Haag, II, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) three sheets of photographs document original and existing conditions; and (3) a letter dated November 2, 2022 from the applicant to Bryan McCracken, City of Ithaca Historic Preservation and Neighborhood Planner and Secretary, Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission, regarding the application, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 702 East Buffalo Street, and the City of Ithaca’s East Hill Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves a retroactive request for approval for the removal of railroad tie raining walls and landscape stairs, the removal of non-historic flagstone walkways, regrading the property’s front yard, and the installation of a concrete walkway, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on February 21, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s East Hill Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the East Hill Historic District is 1830-1932.
As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Queen Anne style residence was constructed between 1898 and 1903.

Constructed within the period of significance of the East Hill Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the East Hill Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the hardscape improvements and concrete walkway (did/did not) remove distinctive materials (but did and did not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [Proposed language: Although the material used to construct the original walkway was non-historic, its orientation toward to the public sidewalk reflects historic pedestrian circulation patterns in the historic district and was a character defining hardscape feature of the property and historic district. With the reorientation of the front walkway toward driveway, the residence no longer directly engages the street. The ILPC finds the]
reorientation of the front walkway significantly changed the character of the property's historic hardscape.

Also with respect to Principle #2, and Standard #9, the regraded yard and concrete walkway (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not ]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the 702 East Buffalo Street and the East Hill Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:
- A walkway from the porch steps to the public sidewalk shall be installed, reestablishing the significant historic hardscape feature. The walkways shall be at least as wide as the porch steps and constructed of concrete to match the existing walkway.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Recuse: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner's representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 11/28/22   Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): ___________________

Applicant’s Name: HAAG Properties LLC   Phone: 607/277/2016

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): Mark@haagproperties.com

Property Address: East Buffalo Street 702 - - Ithaca NY 14850

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): Mark W. Haag II

Owner’s Mailing Address: PO Box 866 Ithaca NY 14851

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

- New Construction
- Addition
- Accessory Structure
- ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- Signage
- Demolition
- ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Description of proposed changes / Improvements

- Removed deteriorated / end of life - railroad ties from front yard
- Properly graded yard for safety and drainage
- Newly graded yard similar to adjacent properties
- Replace entry walk to building for safety - now level without trip hazards

-- Improved Safety
-- Improved aesthetics / curb appeal

--- Please see Exhibit A: communication of 2 November 2022, to Bryan McCracken for additional information

--- Please see Exhibit B: photo of re-installed front porch railing - Exhibit: B

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Reason for Proposed Changes:

- Greatly improve safety of tenants means of entrance to building / property
- Re-grade front yard to match adjacent properties
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner's representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18"x23":

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant's Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify):

Applicant's Signature (REQUIRED): ___________________________ Date: 28 November 2022

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ___________________________ Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ___________________________
November 2, 2022

City of Ithaca Historic Preservation Department  
ATTN: Bryan McCracken  
City Hall  
108 Green Street – 3rd Floor  
Ithaca New York 14850

RE: 702 East Buffalo Street, Ithaca, New York

Hello Bryan,

I am requesting your assistance to close out a COC to complete the sale of 702 East Buffalo Street, Ithaca. This property is under a sales contract pending resolution of this last open COC inspection issue. See Below:

General:

1. A retroactive building permit and ILPC approval are required for the front exterior stair railing installation, due to the historic designation of the property. Please complete the permit application online at http://www.cityofithaca.org/138/General-Permit#building. Fee and proof of insurance will be required to issue the permit. (IC 146-5A) [VID: 3]

Pertinent information and brief history during my stewardship:

- The entire front yard of the building has been re-landscaped – removing old railroad tie retaining walls, steps and grading yard to match neighboring properties. Safety and aesthetics have been greatly improved.
  - See Photos 1, 2, 3 and 4
- Project included removing very old, deteriorated slate stone piece walkway and replace with dyed poured concrete to create safe walkway and solid foundation to reinstall the front porch steps as they were when I purchased property.
  - See Photos 5 and 6
- The current temporary railing was erected for the landscaping / step re-installation project for safety.
  - See Photo 6 and 7
- I propose re-installing the original stair railings to satisfy and close out pending COC for property sale.
  - No building permit / no other requirements – simple reinstall will complete landscape project.
  - See Photo 8 (the original stair railings)

Please contact me with any questions – hoping to resolve this COC issue and close sale December 15, 2022.

Thank you for your assistance in resolving this matter.

Mark W Haag II  
HAAG Properties LLC  
607-272-8398
Exhibit B – Photo 9

- Re-Installed Original Stair Railing -
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Margaret Hobbie & Majorie Hermanson
DATE: July 1979

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 East Green Street
TELEPHONE: 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Planning and Development Department

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S): The Gray Hill House
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION: 702 E. Buffalo Street
4. OWNERSHIP: b. private
5. PRESENT OWNER: William Everts
6. USE: pr. single fam. residence
7. ADDRESS: 305 E. Falls Street, Ithaca
   Present: multi-unit apartments
8. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes ☑ No ☐
   Interior accessible: Explain No - private

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard ☑
   b. stone ☐
   c. brick ☐
   d. board and batten ☐
   e. cobblestone ☐
   f. shingles ☑
   g. stucco ☐
   other: wooden

9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints ☐
   b. wood frame with light members ☑
   c. masonry load bearing walls ☐
   d. metal (explain) ☐
   e. other ☐

10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent ☐
    b. good ☐
    c. fair ☑
    d. deteriorated ☐
11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site ☑
    b. moved ☐ if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

1947 - altered "for laundry and plumbing"; sleeping porch built 1932.

12. PHOTO:

13. MAP: Scale 1" = 200'

HP-1
14. **THREATS TO BUILDING:**
   a. none known ✗
   b. zoning □
   c. roads □
   d. developers □
   e. deterioration □
   f. other:

15. **RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:**
   a. barn □
   b. carriage house □
   c. garage ✗
   d. privy □
   e. shed □
   f. greenhouse □
   g. shop □
   h. gardens □
   i. landscape features:
   j. other:

16. **SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING** (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land □
   b. woodland □
   c. scattered buildings □
   d. densely built-up ✗
   e. commercial □
   f. industrial □
   g. residential ✗
   h. other:

17. **INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:**
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   Located on the edge of the East Hill Historic District which is a neighborhood of predominantly 19th century residences.

18. **OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE** (including interior features if known):
   The front door, with beveled glass and side lights, is placed under a railed porch with columned supports and a beaded cornice. A large pedimented gable rises above this main block of the building, and there is a smaller one at the third floor level on the west side of the street facade above a pent roof. The gable on the east side is similarly treated.

**SIGNIFICANCE**

19. **DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION:** 1890 - 1903 *(comparison of Sanborn maps, city directories)*

   **ARCHITECT:**
   **BUILDER:**

20. **HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:**
    Once part of a single family neighborhood, this house now sits in a neighborhood made up of primarily student occupied apartments. This house displays some features of Queen Ann architecture. This house exhibits features of both the Queen Anne and Colonial Revival styles of architecture. The inappropriate siding and possible alterations make it difficult to determine its original appearance. It was occupied by and may have been built for Mrs. Clara A. Willey in 1903-04. By 1919 it is listed as being vacant. In 1929 a Gerrit C. Winne is listed as the occupant and in 1940 Ray C. Wafer, an employee at Allen Wales Adding Machine Co., is shown as the occupant. By 1957, it was known as the Gray Hill House and had been converted to apartments.

21. **SOURCES:** Sanborn Maps of Ithaca, NY: 1890
   City Directories
   Building Permits

22. **THEME:**
   East Hill