ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, October 17, 2023. This meeting is open to the public and will be held in Common Council Chambers, Third Floor, City Hall, 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY, and also conducted remotely using videoconferencing technology. In-person attendance at City Hall may be limited and will be permitted on a first-come, first-served basis. Members of the public are strongly encouraged to participate remotely. Virtual participation in public meetings is authorized by Part WW of Chapter 56 of the Laws of 2022 of New York State and Local Law 2022-05. More information, including the written procedures governing the use of videoconferencing technology, is available at http://www.cityofithaca.org/339/Boards-Committees.

For remote viewing/attendance: A live stream of the proceedings is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtJN1P_RFaFW21VCnTrDg; a recording will made available through the same link following the conclusion of the proceedings. If you are a member of the public wanting to observe the meeting, please simply watch the live stream. If you are an applicant or member of the public wishing to comment during the proceedings, you should both follow the meeting via the live stream and join the meeting via Zoom. (You will be placed in a waiting room until your allotted time to speak.) Members of the public wishing to be heard are strongly encouraged to register by 3:00 PM on the day of the meeting. To register, please send your name and physical address to mmclain@cityofithaca.org, subject line: “ILPC Speaker Registration – October 2023”. Written comments may be submitted to the aforementioned email address no later than 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting. Use the subject line: “ILPC Comments – October 2023,” and include your legal name and physical address along with your comments in the body of the email. Each comment is limited to three minutes and will be read aloud at the meeting.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

II. NEW BUSINESS
   A. Presentation - Alterations to the Picnic and Dance Pavilions at the State and National Register-listed Stewart Park.

III. OLD BUSINESS
   A. 300 Fall Creek Drive, Cornell Heights Historic District – Review Modifications to the Sidewalk Project Approved on May 18, 2021, For Which Work is Already Complete. [Information will be presented at the meeting.]

   B. 601 East State Street, East Hill Historic District – Proposal to Construct a Two-Story, Wood-Framed, Multi-Family Residence in the Rear Yard of the Property.

   C. 711 East Seneca Street, East Hill Historic District – Proposal to Replace Replacement Windows Installed Without a Certificate of Appropriateness, Approved on May 30, 2023. [Project will be discussed at the meeting.]

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   A. 05.16.2023
   B. 06.20.2023 [under separate cover]

V. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
A. 522-34 Thurston Avenue, Cornell Heights Historic District – Request for an Extension of Certificate of Appropriateness Approval

VI. ADJOURNMENT

ACCESSING ONLINE MEETING MATERIALS:
Online meeting materials, like applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness and supporting materials, are available electronically via the “Document Center” on the City web site (www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter), under “Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission” > “Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness” and in the relevant address folder. Please do not hesitate to contact our office if you have any questions or you need any assistance accessing the meeting materials.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 10/9/23
Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): n/a

Applicant’s Name: Jennifer Ahrens, Bero Architecture, PLLC
Phone: (585) 262-2035

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): jahrens@beroarchitecture.com

Property Address: Stewart Park, 1 James Gibb Drive, Ithaca, NY

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): City of Ithaca
Owner’s Mailing Address: 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY 14850

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☒ New Construction
☒ Addition
☒ Accessory Structure
☒ ALTERATION: Primary Structure
☒ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☒ Signage
☒ Demolition
☒ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 21 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the third Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

As part of a multi-phased project to rehabilitate the Wharton Studio Building (currently housing the City of Ithaca, Department of Public Works), Phase 1 of the project includes an addition to the south side of the Picnic Pavilion to provide storage for the Youth Bureau summer camp equipment. The addition, approximately 42' wide by 22' deep, extends south from the Picnic Pavilion with its exterior material and detailing matching existing construction - asphalt shingle roofing, cedar wall shingles, and wide overhangs with shaped rafter tails.

The roof eave of the addition is lower than the main structure in order to differentiate the addition from the historic building and to reduce the massing of the added space. An overhead door and swing door exit to the east to provide for convenient access to the lake front and to avoid pedestrian traffic toward the parking area. A new concrete walk and steps with railing details to match existing railings are provided for circulation from the addition finish floor to the existing Porch. Proposed windows are wood double-hung Marvin Ultimate series to be finish painted to match historic windows remaining.

At the Wharton Building, a restroom screen wall is proposed to conceal the utilitarian appearance of the two existing restroom doors at the west elevation of the building. The screen wall is designed to allow for a visual improvement to this facade, but to allow for a secure use of these doors throughout the year. The detailing of the screen wall is to be compatible with both the existing Wharton Building and Picnic Pavilion, and to have the heavy timber structure to be primed and painted. It is the intention that the screen wall, parking lot elevation, may be a place to celebrate the history of the building and the site.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The multi-phased project incorporates a phase for the relocation of the Youth Bureau summer camp equipment, from the north bay of the Wharton Building, into the proposed storage addition. The following phase of development will be to provide for a year-round cafe and exhibit space in the north bay of the Wharton Building with an exterior patio along the north elevation that engages the lakefront trail and provides for a public gathering space. The final phase of the master plan reimagines the lakefront transition through potential board walks and a scenic overlook.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18"x23":

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ____________________________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): __________________________ Date: 10/9/2023

____________________________

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no  Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no  Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ____________
Wharton Building, Restroom Screen wall, Southwest view
Wharton Building (R) and Picnic Pavilion (L) - Early view

Wharton Building (R) and Picnic Pavilion (L) - Postcard view of site
Wharton Studio Building - 1918-ish - Looking south
EXISTING CONDITIONS PLAN
SCALE 1"=20'

EROSION & SEDIMENT CONTROL PLAN
SCALE 1"=20'

PROTECT TREE WITH ORANGE CONSTRUCTION FENCING
TEMPORARY CONSTRUCTION FENCE 6' TALL CHAIN LINK AND GATES AS NEEDED

STAGING AREA
SILT LOG (TYP.)

EXISTING CONDITIONS AND EROSION AND SEDIMENT CONTROL PLANS APRIL 17, 2023

© 2023 Bero Architecture, PLLC
SAW-CUT EXISTING PAVEMENT EDGE

CONTRACTOR SHALL PROVIDE DUST CONTROL IN ACCORDANCE WITH

CONTRACTOR SHALL MAINTAIN EROSION CONTROL MEASURES UNTIL

THE CONTRACTOR & ITS SUBCONTRACTORS ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR

EROSION AND SEDIMENT CONTROL NOTES:

4. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL BE RESPONSIBLE FOR KEEPING THE STREET

ERODED OR WASHED OUT SLOPED AREAS.

FOR URBAN EROSION AND SEDIMENT CONTROL" AND THE NYSDEC'S

REPLACING DAMAGED OR SILTED IN SILT LOGS, AND STABILIZING

DEVELOPMENT".

5. INSTALL CONCRETE WASHOUT.

6. EXCAVATE FOR AND INSTALL FOUNDATION.

7. COMPLETE SITE AND UTILITY IMPROVEMENTS.

8. FINE GRADE, SEED, AND MULCH ALL DISTURBED LAWN AREAS WITHIN

SILT LOGS SHALL BE UTILIZED ONLY AS A TEMPORARY MEASURE.

9. REMOVE TEMPORARY SILT LOGS ONLY AFTER SITE IS COMPLETELY

STABILIZED AND ALL DISTURBED LAWN AREAS HAVE ACHIEVED 80%

VEGETATIVE GROWTH.

10. CONTRACTOR SHALL PROVIDE DUST CONTROL IN ACCORDANCE WITH

THE LATEST EDITION OF THE NEW YORK STATE

GUIDELINES FOR URBAN EROSION AND SEDIMENTATION CONTROL.

1. INSTALL SILT LOGS AS SHOWN ON PLAN PRIOR TO BEGINNING

2. REMOVE ALL TREES, STUMPS, AND BRUSH PRIOR TO BEGINNING

EARTHWORK OPERATIONS.

3. STRIP AND STOCKPILE TOPSOIL.

4. TOOLED JOINT WIDTH TO BE

5. TOOLED JOINT WIDTH TO BE

6. EXPANSION JOINTS: INSTALL AT 3

7. WALK EDGES: FINISH WITH 2" PICTURE FRAME.

8. LIGHT BROOM FINISH ALL WALK SURFACES.

9. REMOVE TEMPORARY SILT LOGS ONLY AFTER SITE IS COMPLETELY

STABILIZED AND ALL DISTURBED LAWN AREAS HAVE ACHIEVED 80%

VEGETATIVE GROWTH.

APPLY TACK COAT (ITEM 407.0102) BETWEEN ALL ASPHALT COURSES.

3. BINDER COURSE - 19.0 F9 BINDER COURSE HMA 80 SERIES COMPACTION.

2. TOP COURSE - 9.5 F3 TOP COURSE HMA 80 SERIES COMPACTION.

4. CURB REVEAL TO BE 1" AT DRIVEWAY ENTRANCES.

BOLLARD, NOT TO SCALE

ASPHALT, NOT TO SCALE

CONCRETE WALK, NOT TO SCALE

STONE DUST WALK, NOT TO SCALE

GRANITE CURB, NOT TO SCALE

CROSSWALK, NOT TO SCALE

CONCRETE WASHOUT, NOT TO SCALE
Alternate No. 3
Restroom Screen Wall

Scale: 1/8" = 1'-0"
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 601 East State Street is located in the East Hill Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1988, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1986, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated August 30, 2023, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Michael Barnoski on behalf of property owner Modern Living Rental, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); and (2) a 29-page presentation containing a zoning analysis, a district plan, photographs of neighborhood conditions and site context, an existing site plan, proposed site plan, proposed floor plans, 3D views of the proposed residence, and elevations and

WHEREAS, revised application materials, including a 16-page presentation containing renderings of the proposed new residence and associated site improvements, were submitted by the applicant on October 10, 2023, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 601 East State Street, and the City of Ithaca’s East Hill Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the construction of a two-story, wood-framed, multi-family residence in the southeast corner of the rear yard of the subject property, and as indicated in the revised application materials, the construction of the patio area, retaining walls, and walkways in the northeast corner of the property, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on September 19, 2023, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:
As identified in the City of Ithaca’s East Hill Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the East Hill Historic District is 1830-1932.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, 601 East State Street was constructed before 1873.

Constructed within the period of significance of the East Hill Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the East Hill Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #3 New construction located within an historic district shall be compatible with the historic character of the district within which it is located.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

With respect to Principle #3 and Standard #9, the proposed two-story, multi-family residence and associated site improvements [is/is not] compatible with the historic character of the East Hill Historic District, and more specifically, with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [Proposed language if new residence is compatible] The two-story height and massing of the proposed new building is consistent with the height and massing of larger contributing resources within the district. Its placement close to the sidewalk and its orientation toward Ferris Place reflects the characteristics of adjacent residences along this minor street. The building’s articulated wall surfaces, projections and recesses, and low roof slope allow it to maintain a human scale consistent with other properties in the neighborhood. Furthermore,
its materiality and detailing reflect the quality and characteristics of the neighborhood’s architectural vocabulary.

Also with respect to the Standard #9, the proposed two-story, single-family residence and associated site improvements [will/will not] be differentiated from surrounding historic structures through the use of contemporary construction techniques and materials. Exterior materials to be used include:

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the 601 East State Street and the East Hill Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following condition(s):

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
MLR 601 STATE
ILPC APPLICATION PRESENTATION - DESIGN UPDATE
October 18, 2023
Modern Living Rentals, Charlie O’Connor
601 E State St
Ithaca, NY, 14850
DESIGN UPDATE

SUMMARY

For this update, our overall massing, detailing and scale of building has changed. We made minor modifications to the building design including moving to a light gray siding, to better match the adjacent building on Ferris Place. We have slightly darker gray trim, to provide a bit of contrast, and then black windows to provide a pop. We've also added muntins to the windows to further increase the resolution of detail.

The major design change here is the development of the landscape around the building. We understand losing the green space in the rear yard of the existing building has been an issue. While we can't remedy this, with further analysis we did realize there is still a significant green space on the corner of East State Street & Ferris Place. This is currently buried with some older trees in really bad shape.

We think we could activate, and beautify this space through the creation of a terraced, pocket park, consisting of low stone walls, stone dust paths and planting beds containing a mix of small flowering trees, bushes and smaller plantings.
SITE PLAN
SCALE: 1" = 30'-0"
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
3D VIEWS
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, Zeta Psi at 534 Thurston Avenue is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, Certificates of Appropriateness were issued by the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) for the full in-kind replacement of the graduated slate roof, rehabilitation of steel casement dormer windows, and removal of two historic steel-framed skylights on the north roof slope on April 19, 2022, and June 21, 2022, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-7 of the Municipal Code, “if the construction of a project approved for a Certificate of Appropriateness has not commenced within twenty-four (24) months of the date of approval, such approval shall expire, unless an extension has been granted by the Landmarks Preservation Commission following a written request by the applicant,” and

WHEREAS, the roof replacement project at Zeta Psi will not commence within the twenty-four (24) month period following the issuance of the Certificates of Appropriateness, and

WHEREAS, a written request for an extension of Certificate of Appropriateness approval for this project was submitted for review by the ILPC by J. Shermeta, Associate University Architect, Cornell University on behalf of property owner Cornell University on September 20, 2023, including a lettered addressed to the Commission and its Secretary and the original Certificate of Appropriateness application materials, and documentation of the projects prior approval by the Commission, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the scope and design of the project HAS/HAS NOT changed since the Certificate of Appropriateness was issued on April 19, 2022 and June 21, 2022, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC APPROVES/DENIES the request for a two-year extension of the Certificate of Appropriateness approval.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: XXX
Seconded by: XXX
In favor: XXX
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0
September 20th, 2023

Letter Request for Extension of Certificate of Appropriateness granted on June 21, 2022

Dear Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission:

We are writing pursuant to City Code §228-8 to request an extension of time for the Certificate of Appropriateness issued by the ILPC on June 21, 2022 that allowed Cornell University to proceed with certain work on the Zeta Psi Fraternity House at 534 Thurston Ave. I am including a copy of the Certificate for your convenience.

The building is a contributing structure in the Cayuga Heights Historic District, and ILPC approved the largely in-kind replacement of the graduated slate roof on the building. The replacement includes new slate, new flashing, new gutters and downspouts and insulation improvements, as well as the removal of (2) skylights.

Cornell University has completed design with the Architecture Firm Labella, and has already bid out the project to qualified contractors in the area. We are expecting that Weathermaster Inc will complete the work in September of 2024.

Given the approval expires on June 21st, we are submitting a formal request to ILPC for a 2-year extension to align with the planned schedule for construction.

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

J. Shermeta, AIA LEED AP
Associate University Architect
Cornell University
j.shermeta@cornell.edu
607 255 6870