Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m., Thursday, October 10, 2019, in the Second Floor Conference Room, City Hall, 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY.

I. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. 2 Ridgewood Road, Cornell Heights Historic District — Proposal to Demolish a Basement Entrance Enclosure and Construct New Concrete Entrance Stairs.

B. First Presbyterian Church, 315 North Cayuga Street, DeWitt Park Historic District – Proposal to Install an Illuminated 42- by 50-inch Glass and Metal Sign Cabinet on the North Elevations.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

III. OLD BUSINESS

• 115 West Green Street, Henry St. John Historic District - Review Railing Design (pursuant to July 9, 2019 Certificate of Appropriateness condition) & Design Modifications

• Clinton House – Review Railings Design (pursuant to September 10, 2019 Certificate of Appropriateness condition)

IV. NEW BUSINESS

• 411-415 College Avenue – Presentation and Discussion of Redevelopment Proposal

• East Hill Historic District Projects - Updates

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

• 09/10/19

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

• National Alliance of Preservation Commissions CAMP Training

VII. ADJOURNMENT

ACCESSING ONLINE MEETING MATERIALS:

Online meeting materials, like applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness and supporting materials, are available electronically via the “Document Center” on the City web site (www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter), under “Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission” > “Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness” and in the relevant address folder. Please do not hesitate to contact our office if you have any questions or you need any assistance accessing the meeting materials. You are also always welcome to visit the Planning Division at any time during regular office hours (8:30-4:30, Mon.-Fri.) to view original hardcopy materials.

Out of consideration for the health of other individuals, please try to refrain from using perfume/cologne and other scented personal care products at City of Ithaca meetings. Thank you for your cooperation and understanding.

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 2 Ridgewood Road is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated September 23, 2019, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Ray Canzler on behalf of property owner Phi Delta Theta Fraternity, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) two photographs showing original (c. 1922) conditions and existing conditions; (3) an annotated photograph outlining the proposed scope of work; (4) a letter from the City of Ithaca Building Division to Shipman and Goodman LLP, dated September 30, 2019, regarding the subject property and area of proposed work; (5) six sheets of drawings by SPEC Consulting, dated September 10, 2019 and titled “Title Sheet” (T1), “Stair Layout” (A1), “Roof Plan” (A2), Elevations (A3), “Sections” (A4), and “3D Views” (A5), and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 2 Ridgewood Road, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the demolition a basement entrance enclosure at the southeast corner of the building and the construction of a concrete entrance stair, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant has/has not provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on October 10, 2019, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:
As identified in the City of Ithaca's Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.

As indicated in the New York State Building Structure Inventory Form, 2 Ridgewood Road was designed by William McLeish Dunbar and constructed in 1921-1922 for the Phi Delta Theta Fraternity.

Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

The basement entrance enclosure appears to be an assemblage of elements from different building campaigns. While some elements suggest an early period of installation, others are clearly constructed contemporary building materials. It is unclear when each component was added.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Principle #3 New construction located within an historic district shall be compatible with the historic character of the district within which it is located.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.
Standard #4  Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Standard #6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. When the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #4, the basement entrance enclosure [has/has not] gained significance in its own right. Proposed additional language if not significant: As illustrated in the c. 1922 photograph submitted with the application, the oldest appearing elements of enclosure were not a part of the original completed building. Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps indicate that roof structures were not added until after 1929.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the [project] (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

(Only applicable if the basement entrance enclosure is found to have gained significance in its own right) With respect to Principle #2 and Standard #6, as shown in the submitted photograph and observed by Commission members, the severity of the deterioration [of what feature] requires its replacement. The proposed new work (will/will not) match the old in design, color, texture, materials and other visual qualities. [if material will not match, explain why not and why that’s acceptable].

Also with respect to Principle #2, Principle #3, and Standard #9, the proposed concrete stairs (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]
With respect to Standard #10, the concrete stairs (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 9-23-20

Applicant's Name: RAY CANDLER
Phone: 607-342-2195 CELL

Applicant's E-Mail address (REQUIRED): canzlerray@yahoo.com

Property Address: 2 RIDGEWOOD RD.

Owner's Name (if different from Applicant): PHI DELTA THETA FRaternity

Owner's Mailing Address: 

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
- [ ] New Construction
- [ ] Addition
- [ ] Accessory Structure
- [X] ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- [ ] Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- [ ] Signage
- [ ] Demolition
- [ ] ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer's data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
ELECTRONIC SUBMISSIONS: You must provide electronic versions of ALL submitted documents. LARGE FILES: Incoming e-mails to the City must be under 10 MB in size (incl. message envelope), so either provide CD-ROM, flash/thumb drive, use a free file-sharing web site, like: www.hightail.com, www.dropbox.com, www.google.com/drive, etc., or split documents into smaller parts and send multiple e-mails/files to: cyvotti@cityofithaca.org and/or bmccracken@cityofithaca.org

Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

1. **ELIMINATE ROOF SYSTEM**
2. **INSTALL NEW CONCRETE STEP W/ HAND & GUARDRAILS TO CODE**
3. **SEE FULL SET OF P.E. STAMPED PRINTS.**

Remove deteriorated roof, crumbling concrete walls and unsafe concrete steps. Replace with new concrete walls, code-compliant stairs and wrought iron guard rail.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

*CITY BUILDING DEPT. HOUSING INSPECTION VIOATIONS.*

Existing roof and concrete walls are deteriorating and are currently unsafe. Existing concrete stairs present safety hazard for delivery personnel. Returning exterior of building to previous state.
Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner's representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $10.50 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18"x23":

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMccracken@CityofIthaca.org, 607-274-6555.

Applicant's Statement:
I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ________________________________

Applicant's Signature (REQUIRED): ________________________________ Date: 9/3/2019

STAFF USE ONLY:
Date Received: ________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ________________
1922 Archive Photo.

July 2019 Existing Conditions.
Black wrought iron safety guard/railing to be installed here
Leaking roof to be removed completely
Wooden wall with clapboard siding to be removed
Concrete chain support pier to remain
Crumbling Concrete Walls
Winder stairs don't meet code, difficult for delivery drivers to navigate → unsafe condition
Stairway width doesn't meet code
Curved, decorative concrete wall (mirrored on opposite side of building), added after 1922, to remain
September 30, 2019

Shipman & Goodman LLP C/O Phillip Bartels
289 Greenwich Avenue - 3rd Floor
Greenwich, CT 06830-6595

RE: Inspection of 2 Ridgewood Road, Ithaca, NY 14850

Dear Phillip H. Bartels,

An inspection was scheduled for your building at 2 Ridgewood Road, Ithaca, NY 14850, Phi Delta Theta on, September 30, 2019 for a Certificate of Compliance inspection.

I have listed below the conditions that do not meet the health and safety standards of the Multiple Residence Law (MRL), City of Ithaca Municipal Housing Code (HC), NYS Building Code (BC), NYS Fire Code (FC), NYS Property Maintenance Code (PMC), and/or other applicable codes:

**General:**

1. The exterior siding requires maintenance. The stucco is separating from the cement enclosure of the kitchen egress stair, remove and replace damaged parging. Exterior repairs require a permit and ILPC approval due to the historic designation of the property. (IPMC 304.2) (HC 210-16B) *(VID: 5)*

2. The roof awning over the kitchen egress stair on the front of the building is in need of repair, remove vegetation from the awning as required. (IPMC 304.7) (IPMC 304.9) *(VID: 6)*

Please note that a Certificate of Compliance cannot be issued if there is an outstanding warrant/ticket for a violation of any section of the Exterior Property Maintenance Code of the City of Ithaca. To verify that there is not an outstanding warrant/ticket, please call City Court at (607) 216-6660.

I have scheduled a re-inspection on 10/31/2019, at 9:00 AM. However, if this time is inconvenient or not acceptable, please call the Building Department at least seven (7) days prior to the scheduled re-inspection. If this re-inspection is scheduled for the receipt of forms and the
RE: Inspection of 2 Ridgewood Road, Ithaca, NY 14850

forms are returned to our office prior to the re-inspection date, this appointment will be canceled upon receipt of the required forms.

Since we must inspect all areas of the building, the tenants’ permission is required to enter their apartment for this inspection. It is the Building Department's policy to not enter a tenant’s apartment without 24 hours notice.

Please remember that there is a fee associated with this inspection. The fee schedule includes a basic room fee, administrative fee, and a violation charge. These charges are outlined in the Ithaca Housing Code (HC), Section 210-43F. The document is available online or by calling the Building Department at 274-6508 and requesting the above document. To view the complete Housing Standards Ordinance visit www.cityofithaca.org and select "City Code".

Thank you for your cooperation.

Respectfully,

Julie Daum
Housing Inspector

Enclosure
cc: Canzler Contracting
NOTES:

1. Verify all dimensions in field. Notify engineer immediately if any actual dimensions differ from the print dimensions by more than 4".
2. All connectors and fasteners in contact with PT lumber must be hot dip galvanized or otherwise treated for use with PT lumber.

3. New floor drain

Block door to existing room below with 8" CMU and waterproof it on the exterior. Insulate using 2" of rigid foam on both sides of CMU. Cover interior foam with 1/2" MR drywall. Fill the room with #2 stone.

4. 4" New concrete wall with #4 vertical and horizontal rebar at 16" O.C. centered in the wall. Wrap horizontal rebar around corner. Leave #4 L-bent rebar at floor level extending 12" into concrete floor and 12" up into the wall.

5. 8" New concrete wall with #4 vertical and horizontal rebar at 16" O.C. centered in the wall. Wrap horizontal rebar around corner. Leave #4 L-bent rebar at floor level extending 12" into concrete floor and 12" up into the wall.

6. 5" New thick concrete floor with #4 rebar both ways at 16" O.C. Tie into L-bent Rebars of the walls.

7. 8" New concrete wall with #4 vertical and horizontal rebar at 16" O.C. centered in the wall. Wrap horizontal rebar around corner. Leave #4 L-bent rebar at floor level extending 12" into concrete floor and 12" up into the wall.

8. 5" New thick concrete floor with #4 rebar both ways at 16" O.C. Tie into L-bent Rebars of the walls.

9. 8" New concrete wall with #4 vertical and horizontal rebar at 16" O.C. centered in the wall.

Dowel and epoxy in place 4" into existing wall.
Existing roof to be removed

Railing on top of concrete wall. Height from upper landing to top of railing to be 42" min

36" tall rail attached to the side of existing wall

36" tall rail attached to the side of new concrete wall

Existing roof to be removed

No Slope
7-1/2"x10" Footing under walls. Two (2) #4 longitudinal rebars 2" up from bottom of footing and 2" long 16" up into wall above. (TYP all walls)

2 Cross Section  
1/2" = 1'-0"

2 Longitudinal Section A  
1/2" = 1'-0"

3 Longitudinal Section B  
1/2" = 1'-0"
PROJECT ADDRESS: 838 Peruville Rd
Groton, NY 13073
607.227.4886
gbush@specconsulting.com

CLIENT: Phi Delta Theta
3 Demo
2 Existing
1 New Construction

3D Views
Stair Reconstruction

DATE: 09/10/2019
SCALE: AS NOTED
DRAWN BY: RL
JOB: 19-034
SHEET: A5
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

UNIQUE SITE NO. 0
QUAD 0
SERIES 0
NEG. NO. 0

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger DATE: 05/15/87

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y. TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S): Phi Delta Theta
2. COUNTY: Tompkins TOWN/CITY: Ithaca VILLAGE:
3. STREET LOCATION: 2 Ridgewood Road
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[X]
6. USE: Original: fraternity house Present: fraternity house
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[X] No[ ]
   Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard[ ] b. stone[X] c. brick[ ] d. board & batten[ ]
   e. cobblestone[ ] f. shingles[ ] g. stucco[X] other:

9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]
   b. wood frame with light members[X]
   (if known) c. masonry load bearing walls[ ]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other

10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent[X] b. good[X] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]

11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site[X] b. moved[ ] if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

   See Continuation Sheet

13. MAP:

   [Map of the building area]
14. THREATS TO BUILDING:  a. none known[X]  b. zoning[ ]  c. roads[ ]
   d. developers[ ]  e. deterioration[ ]
   f. other:

15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ]  b. carriage house[ ]  c. garage[ ]
   d. privy[ ]  e. shed[ ]  f. greenhouse[ ]
   g. shop[ ]  h. gardens[ ]
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ]  b. woodland[X]
   c. scattered buildings[X]
   d. densely built-up[ ]  e. commercial[ ]
   f. industrial[ ]  g. residential[X]
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1921-1922
   ARCHITECT: unknown
   BUILDER: unknown

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
   See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
    See Continuation Sheet

22. THEME:
    See Continuation Sheet
15i. A parking area occupies much of the property immediately in front of the house. There are large full shrubs surrounding the main entrance. For the most part, however, the lot is unlandscaped but takes advantage of the area's natural foliage which includes tall shade trees and conifers which surround the house on the north, south, and west.

15j.

16h.

17. This house is built on a high ridge overlooking lower Thurston Avenue to the south and Stewart Avenue to the west. Ridgewood Road itself is a secluded, wooded roadway in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District. There are only four other large residences along the street, all now used as fraternity and sorority houses.

18. This large fraternity house is built into a hill that slopes sharply downward to the rear. The bulk of the house extends westward, terracing down this hillside. The house is three stories in height with a very low hipped roof. The central block of the house is flanked by two-story hipped side wings. The facade is rather austere, covered in a light brown stucco with small windows and large expanses of wall space. A central entrance is set in a recessed arch. Large double wood doors are surmounted by a glazed arched panel. Second floor windows are set very high on the wall. They are lancet-like windows set in an arcade of narrow arches supporting a shallow balcony with stuccoed parapet wall above. The eave extends over the balcony covering third floor windows. Windows on this facade are primarily single-paned casements. The house extends deep to the rear. A portion of the rear foundation wall is of rough-cut, random-coursed stone with wide mortar joints. On the north wall of this extension are three large stained glass arched windows, each flanked by stone piers. Tabs of cut stone project from the arches into the surrounding wall giving a quoin-like effect. There are also some narrow, multi-paned arched casement windows (some protected with iron grating) along this facade.
20. This house was built as a fraternity house for the Phi Delta Theta Society.


22.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, First Presbyterian Church, 315 North Cayuga Street, is located in the DeWitt Park Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1971, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1971, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness dated September 10, 2019 was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Susanne Scholten on behalf of property owner First Presbyterian Church of Ithaca, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) two renderings of the proposed project; (3) product specifications for proposed materials; (4) a site plan showing the location of the proposed project; and (5) a scope of work from an electrician for the installation of the proposed product, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for the First Presbyterian Church, 315 North Cayuga Street and the City of Ithaca's DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, the proposed project involves the installation of a wall-mounted, illuminated 42”x 50” metal cabinet sign on the north elevation of the church, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on October 10, 2019, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the DeWitt Park Historic District is 1820-1930.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, [address] was designed in the Richardsonian Romanesque Revival Style by noted New York City architect J. Cleveland Cady and was constructed in 1900. It is the third church structure to occupy the site.
Constructed within the period of significance of the DeWitt Park Historic District and possessing a high level of architectural integrity, the property is a contributing element of the DeWitt Park Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the proposed sign (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (and will and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2, and Standard #9, the proposed sign (is/is not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]
With respect to Standard #10, proposed sign (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the [property] and the DeWitt Park Historic District as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) the criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following condition(s):

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner's representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff, any deviation from the approved plans, including, but not limited to, changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses may result in the issuance by the building department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

PLEASE PRINT OR TYPE

Date: 9/10/19

Buildling Permit Application # (REQUIRED): ___________________________

Applicant’s Name: First Presbyterian Church
Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): Suzanne@firstpresithaca.org

Phone: 607-272-2800

Property Address: 315 N. Cayuga Street

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): ___________________________

Owner’s Mailing Address: _________________________________________

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☐ New Construction
☐ Addition
☐ Accessory Structure
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure
☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Signage
☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

FPCI would like to showcase their community offerings in a glass/metal sign. The main change would be where the sign would be placed for appearance of the building. The photo of the sign is attached to this document for your viewing purposes. It would be attached to the building through the mortar joints. The church will hire a contractor who we have worked with in repointing our building in the past to ensure the professionalism of the job. We have also attached the estimate for the electrical portion of this job. There is a section at the top where our name is that can be placed on a timer from sundown to midnight to assist people in seeing our name and information posters.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

FPCI is a downtown church with a lot of street traffic. We have four doors and not one door that showcases what events are going on inside. The door, where we would like to place the sign, is one of the main entrances for our community activities. Open Doors English is housed here on the 3rd floor and is a welcoming place for people from all over the world. Open Doors English and FPCI co-hosted a table at the Festival of Nations this past weekend. Neither one of us was able to do our own table but in collaboration we found enough volunteers to “person” the booth for the whole day. It was amazing to see the number of people come to ask questions about both English Classes and the Church. I feel this is a perfect example for what the sign would do for us, bring people together and inside the doors.

There are so many events happening that people don't know about as they walk by or go through to the park. We never know what will bring a person into an event, but having a sign of welcome and invitation will allow all people to know they are welcome here at FPCI. We would also like to share some of our photos from past events to assist the community around us in “seeing” and getting to know us. First Presbyterian Church of Ithaca is a community center where all can gather and this is what we want to show the passersby.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $10.50 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☑ photographs of existing conditions
☑ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☑ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☑ description of design details and materials to be used
☑ samples of proposed materials
☑ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typface, and illumination details
☑ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☑ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☑ other (specify): ____________________________________________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): Suzanne Scholten ___________________________ Date: 09/24/2019

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ________________
Suzanne,

Here is the scope and price for the work we discussed.

1. Install a circuit for a new sign.
2. Install a 24 hour battery backup timer to turn the sign off at predetermined time.
3. Drill through stone wall behind sign.
4. Install a photo cell to sense dusk and turn sign on.
5. Make connections to sign.
6. Sales tax exempt.

$1,400.00

Please respond with any questions or to schedule the work.

Thank you

Dave

---

Suzanne Scholten <janene24680@gmail.com>  
May 31, 2019, 7:57 AM  
to David

Hi,
Thank you for getting this to me so quickly. I’ll talk it over w my Sr. Pastor.

In Service,

Suzanne Scholten

Director of Christian Education
cell: 712-212-4819
Suzanne@firstpresithaca.org

315 N Cayuga
Ithaca, NY 14850
www.firstpresithaca.org

from my iPhone, please excuse typos
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Mary Donohue
DATE: July 1979

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 East Green Street
TELEPHONE: 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Planning and Development Department

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S): The Presbyterian Church
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION:
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public  [ ]  b. private  [X]
5. PRESENT-OWNER: Presbyterian Church
6. USE: Original: Church
   Present: Church
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes  [X]  No  [ ]
   Interior accessible: Explain open during business hours

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard  [ ]  b. stone  [X]  c. brick  [ ]
   d. board and batten  [ ]
   e. cobblestone  [ ]
   f. shingles  [ ]
   g. stucco  [ ]
   other:
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints  [ ]
   b. wood frame with light members  [ ]
   c. masonry load bearing walls  [X]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other
10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent  [X]  b. good  [ ]
    c. fair  [ ]
    d. deteriorated  [ ]
11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site  [X]  b. moved  [ ]
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
      Replacing steps on Cayuga St. (W) entrance - 1979
      Moving podium forward - 1979
      Creating vestibule on Park (S) entrance - 1979
12. PHOTO:
13. MAP: Scale 1" = 200'

N. CAYUGA ST.
DEWITT ST.
COURT ST.
N. CAYUGA ST.
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known x b. zoning □ c. roads □
   d. developers □ e. deterioration □
   f. other: ____________

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn □ b. carriage house □ c. garage □
   d. privy □ e. shed □ f. greenhouse □
   g. shop □ h. gardens □
   i. landscape feature: DeWitt Park on south
   j. other: ____________

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land x b. woodland □
   c. scattered buildings □
   d. densely built-up x e. commercial x
   f. industrial □ g. residential x
   h. other: ____________

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   The building is a pivotal structure on DeWitt Park, Ithaca's original
   Public Square. The large mass balances the mass of the DeWitt Building at
   the south end of the Park. The structure is in the DeWitt Park Historic
   District, a national and local designation.

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE (including interior features if known): (See attached sheet)

SIGNIFICANCE
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1900

   ARCHITECT: J. Cleveland Cady, New York City

   BUILDER: ____________

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE: (See attached sheet)

21. SOURCES:
   Historic Ithaca, DeWitt Park Historic District Walking Tour.

22. THEME:
The massive stone work and heavy proportions of this building reflect the late 19th century interest in early medieval church design; the double apse plan was favored in German Romanesque churches of the 12th and 13th centuries. This is the third structure the Presbyterian congregation has built on this site. The first was built in 1816, in the Federal style and faced into the Park which at that time was called the "Public Square." In mid-century it was replaced by a beautiful Gothic structure designed by James Renwick, a distinguished architect who built Grace Church in New York.

The present church was built in 1900 from a design by J. Cleveland Cady, a noted architect who designed the old "Met" in New York, only recently demolished after a long preservation battle. The most striking feature is the western apse which curves out to Cayuga Street and contains handsome stained glass windows, seen in all the glory from the interior.

Inside, polished yellow marble columns support round-arched vaulted forms, the capitals are in the sixth century manner, the coffered ceiling over a massive bracketed cornice is in the Roman manner. This eclectic interior is further enhanced by the tabernacle-like setting for the largest organ pipes.

The curved windows of the west apse are especially colorful and vibrant when the sun shines through them in the late afternoon; their design is in the Pre-Raphaelite style. The lighting fixtures appear to be original, the one in the entrance is combined gas and electric with the gas jets on the outside.

This handsome edifice, with its skillful combination of style features from many periods, is a strong large feature on the north rim of the Park and balances the mass of the high school across the Park.

Information from Historic Ithaca, Inc.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 115 West Green Street is located within the Henry St. John Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 2013, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an accessible ramp to a basement entrance in the landscape along the east side of property’s north elevation was approved at the regular Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) meeting on July 9, 2019, and

WHEREAS, a condition was placed on that Certificate of Appropriateness, requiring the applicant to submit design and/or shop drawings illustrating the proposed metal handrails… to the ILPC for review and approval, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has received a submission from Noah Demarest, dated October 1, 2019, illustrating the proposed handrail and a few minor alterations to the approved ramp layout, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed this submission for the purpose of evaluating the impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC finds that the railings and minor site alterations [are/are not] compatible with the architectural features of the property and its environment and are approved for use, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the original condition placed on the project’s Certificate of Appropriateness [has/has not] been satisfied, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the following conditions placed on the original Certificate of Appropriateness remain unresolved:

• The applicant shall submit… design specifications for the proposed wood door and associated door surround modifications to the ILPC for review and approval.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, The Clinton House at 116 North Cayuga Street is located within the Clinton Block Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1980, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of metal handrails on the buildings east portico was approved at the regular Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) meeting on September 10, 2019, and

WHEREAS, a condition was placed on that Certificate of Appropriateness, requiring the applicant to submit shop drawings for the proposed metal railings for consideration by the Commission at a future meeting and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has received a submission from Sara Hayes, prepared by AccuFab Inc. and dated September 23, 2019, illustrating design details of the proposed handrails, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed this submission for the purpose of evaluating the impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC finds that the railings and minor site alterations [are/are not] compatible with the architectural features of the property and its environment and are [approved/disapproved] for use, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the original condition placed on the project’s Certificate of Appropriateness [has/has not] been satisfied, and be it further

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
NEW GUARDRAILS AND HANDRAILS
SEE ELEVATIONS BELOW

NEW GUARDRAILS
SEE ELEVATIONS BELOW

PORCH END GUARDRAIL
SEE ELEVATION ON CH-F2

2 1/4" MOLDED TOP RAIL W/ 1 1/2" x 1 1/4" x 1 8" CHANNEL LAMBS TOUNGE EACH END ( TYP )

1 1/4"SQ. x 11GA. TUBE STEEL POST W/ 1 1/4" x 4" x 4" BASE PLATE AND ( 4 ) 5/16"Ø CONCRETE ANCHORS

1 1/2" x 1 1/4" x 1 8" BOTTOM CHANNEL 5/8"Ø ROUND ROD PICKETS ( TYP )

EQ 3'-0"
EQ 3'-6"

3'-23 16"
3'-61 8"

3'-23 16"
3'-61 8"

3'-0"
3'-6"

4'-01 4"
4'-81 8"

AccuFab Inc.
232 CHERRY ST.
ITHACA NY 14850
FAX: 607-277-8295
office@accufabinc.com
www.accufabinc.com

Travis - Hyde
Clinton House Porch and Stair Railings

09/23/19
248219

PLAN AND ELEVATIONS
MEMORANDUM

From: Bryan McCracken, Historic Preservation and Neighborhood Planner
To: Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission
Date: October 3, 2019
Subject: Advisory Involvement – Redevelopment of 411-415 College Avenue

The purpose of this memo is to outline the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission’s advisory involvement in the review of the redevelopment of 411-415 College Avenue.

In the 2017, the ILPC’s recommendation to locally designate 411-415 College Avenue, also known as the Chacona Block, an individual local landmark was denied by Common Council. 411-415 College Avenue is not a locally designated historic resource and has no protections under the Landmarks Ordinance. However, the building was determined to be eligible for listing in the State and National Registers of Historic Places by the New York State Historic Preservation Office. As an identified historic resource, the redevelopment of the site requires a heighten level of review under both State and local environmental review laws. The Planning and Development Board has requested the ILPC’s involvement as part of this review.

Attached are materials submitted by the project development team and the Historic Resource Inventory Form for 411-415 College Avenue.
HISTORIC RESOURCE INVENTORY FORM

NYS OFFICE OF PARKS, RECREATION
& HISTORIC PRESERVATION
P.O. BOX 189, WATERFORD, NY 12188
(518) 237-8643

IDENTIFICATION
Property name(if any) Chacona Block
Address or Street Location 411-415 College Avenue
County Tompkins Town/City Ithaca Village/Hamlet:
Owner Student Agencies, Inc. Address 409 College Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850
Original use mixed-use Current use mixed-use
Architect/Builder, if known John M. Wilgus Date of construction, if known 1911-12

DESCRIPTION
Materials -- please check those materials that are visible

Exterior Walls: ☐ wood clapboard ☐ wood shingle ☐ vertical boards ☐ plywood
☐ stone ☐ brick ☐ poured concrete ☐ concrete block
☐ vinyl siding ☐ aluminum siding ☐ cement-asbestos ☒ other: stucco

Roof: ☐ asphalt, shingle ☐ asphalt, roll ☐ wood shingle ☐ metal ☐ slate

Foundation: ☐ stone ☐ brick ☐ poured concrete ☐ concrete block

Other materials and their location:

Alterations, if known: see continuation sheet Date:

Condition: ☐ excellent ☒ good ☐ fair ☐ deteriorated

Photos
Provide several clear, original photographs of the property proposed for nomination. Submitted views should represent the property as a whole. For buildings or structures, this includes exterior and interior views, general setting, outbuildings and landscape features. Color prints are acceptable for initial submissions.

Please staple one photograph providing a complete view of the structure or property to the front of this sheet. Additional views should be submitted in a separate envelope or stapled to a continuation sheet.

Maps
Attach a printed or drawn locational map indicating the location of the property in relationship to streets, intersections or other widely recognized features so that the property can be accurately positioned. Show a north arrow. Include a scale or estimate distances where possible.

Prepared by: B. McCracken address 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, NY 14850
Telephone: (607) 274-6555 email bmccracken@cityofithaca.org Date 8/8/17

(See Reverse)
PLEASE PROVIDE THE FOLLOWING INFORMATION

Narrative Description of Property: Briefly describe the property and its setting. Include a verbal description of the location (e.g., north side of NY 17, west of Jones Road); a general description of the building, structure or feature including such items as architectural style (if known), number of stories, type and shape of roof (flat, gabled, mansard, shed or other), materials and landscape features. Identify and describe any associated buildings, structures or features on the property, such as garages, silos, privies, pools, gravesites. Identify any known exterior and interior alterations such as additions, replacement windows, aluminum or vinyl siding or changes in plan. Include dates of construction and alteration, if known. Attach additional sheets as needed.

See continuation sheet

Narrative Description of Significance: Briefly describe those characteristics by which this property may be considered historically significant. Significance may include, but is not limited to, a structure being an intact representative of an architectural or engineering type or style (e.g., Gothic Revival style cottage, Pratt through-truss bridge); association with historic events or broad patterns of local, state or national history (e.g., a cotton mill from a period of growth in local industry, a seaside cottage representing a locale’s history as a resort community, a structure associated with activities of the "underground railroad."); or by association with persons or organizations significant at a local, state or national level. Simply put, why is this property important to you and the community. Attach additional sheets as needed.

See continuation sheet
The Chacona Block is a 3 ½-story, commercial-style, stucco-clad building constructed in 1911-1912 in the Renaissance Revival Style. Three plaques on the building’s façade depict lions’ heads and a Greek cross, a reference to builder John N. Chacona’s Greek heritage. The building occupies a prominent location in the heart of Collegetown at the edge of the Cornell University campus. It is among the earlier commercial-style buildings constructed in Collegetown to provide both rental apartments and commercial space.

Located at the corner of College and Oak Avenues at a prominent site adjacent to the campus of Cornell University, this representative of the commercial, Renaissance Revival Style is a mixed-use building housing commercial space in its three ground-floor storefronts and residential space in its upper stories. The building anchors the corner of a continuous row of mixed-use, commercial buildings on the southern side of the College Avenue Bridge. The Chacona Block and the Larkin Building, located in the same commercial row, were constructed in the early twentieth century and set the tone for the late-twentieth century buildings that complete the block today. Neighboring wood-frame buildings were replaced by these newer commercial buildings, appropriately-scaled and complimentary to the historic Chacona and Larkin buildings as well as their neighbor across the street, Sheldon Court. The Chacona’s location on a trapezoidal-shaped, corner lot allows for a large, outdoor gathering space on its north elevation, currently used as an outdoor dining area for Collegetown Bagels, which occupies the storefront of 415 College Avenue. This space is important to the neighborhood’s character, providing a gathering space for the Cornell University and Collegetown community in a neighborhood with little outdoor public space.

To the north of the Chacona Block, the historic stone arch College Avenue bridge across Cascadilla Creek connects the Collegetown neighborhood to the Cornell University campus. To the immediate east is St. Luke Lutheran Church at 109 Oak Avenue, constructed in 1923-24. Further along Oak Avenue are late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century homes, most
converted for student or fraternity housing, and the Cascadilla School on the corner of Oak and Summit Avenues. Across College Avenue to the west are Sheldon Court and Cornell’s Schwartz Center for the Performing Arts, with Cascadilla Hall further west. To the south along the 300 block of College Avenue are more commercial buildings, most of them dating from the late-twentieth and early-twenty-first centuries; along the 100 and 200 blocks of College Avenue are formerly single-family homes converted to student apartments, except for the Grand View House at 209 College Avenue, the last surviving of Collegetown’s great boardinghouses.

The Chacona Block is constructed of hollow clay tile and brick with a steel frame. The building’s three-bay, four-story principal façade (west) contains three storefronts in the first story, with a simple cornice dividing the first story from the upper stories of the building. Each bay of the second and third stories contains a group of three 6/1 windows, with the center window being slightly wider than the two flanking it. In the fourth story, the center windows of the north and south bays are replaced with a round lion’s-head plaque. In place of the center bay’s center window is a round plaque depicting a shield emblazoned with a Greek cross. The flanking windows on the fourth story are 4/1 and shorter than the windows of the stories below. The west façade is capped by a wide cornice and stepped parapet. Upper floor windows throughout the building lack moldings or ornament, with the exception of simple sills clad in the same pebble-dash stucco as the walls.

The northernmost storefront, designated as 415 College Avenue, consists of a central expanse of plate glass topped with several fixed sash each containing many small lights in a grid pattern of 9 units in width, 7 in height. This glazing pattern appears to be original to the building, and continues into the angled, sheltered storefront entrance shared by the entrance to the northern apartments’ stair hall as well as the entrance to the center storefront, designated as 413 College Avenue. The ceiling of the sheltered entrance is finished with pressed metal panels, likely original to the building. Surmounting the plate glass windows of the center storefront is an art-glass transom window, likely original to the building, partially visible behind a modern sign.

The southernmost storefront, at 411 College Avenue, departs in appearance from the northern two and was extensively altered sometime after 1975. Where it once had a sheltered entrance similar to the one shared by 413 and 415, it now has a vaguely Gothic-Révival style appearance, including windows with pointed-arch mullions, a round-arched entry door, and heavy wood paneling and moldings.

Brick pilasters mark the north and south corners of the west façade and delineate the 411 and 413 store fronts. In a 1975 photograph, these appear to be stuccoed and/or painted to match the exterior wall treatment of the upper stories.

The north façade of the Chacona Block consists of six bays, with single 6/1 windows on the second and third stories centered over first-story bays of large plate-glass windows each topped with two transom sash containing 6 lights. The exception to the pattern is in the second bay from the east, which contains paired 6/1 windows on the second and third stories over a glass

---

1 New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form photograph, 1975, Historic Ithaca, Inc., Ithaca, NY
2 Ibid.
greenhouse-type structure (added after 1975\textsuperscript{3}) within the first story bay which provides a second entrance to the commercial space. There are no fourth-story windows on the north façade. The brick wall and pilasters dividing the bays of the first story appears to have been originally stuccoed to match the upper stories. The wall terminates in a parapet which steps down towards the rear (east) of the building, disguising a low-slope shed roof. A palimpsest suggests that the height of the building was increased at some point prior to 1954.\textsuperscript{4}

At the rear (east) façade, a three-story partially-enclosed addition (at one time open porches) includes a fire escape. At the south, the single-story storefront of 409 College Avenue forms a continuous streetwall at the ground level. The upper floors of the south façade are similar to the north façade, except for the elevator shaft of 409 College Avenue which adjoins the Chacona Block about midway along the south façade, providing elevator access to both 409 and 411-415.

**Narrative Description of Significance:**

Chacona Block, 411-415 College Avenue, Ithaca, NY

The Chacona Block is architecturally significant as a nearly intact example of a local interpretation of the commercial form of the Renaissance Revival Style.

The Chacona Block is significant for its close association with the growth and development of Cornell University, as an example of the early-twentieth century response to the changing housing needs and preferences of those seeking to reside in proximity to the campus, and for its role in the development of Collegetown, particularly College Avenue, as an urban neighborhood separate from downtown Ithaca and with its own distinct character. Built in 1911-12 as a mixed-use, fireproof, commercial-style building replacing an earlier wood boardinghouse, the construction of the Chacona Block on a site adjacent to the campus of Cornell University established it as one of Collegetown’s most prominent and recognizable buildings. The Chacona Block has additional local significance for its association with John N. Chacona, the owner of a successful chain of confectionary and ice cream shops in Ithaca, as well as with the larger Greek business community in Ithaca.

The building’s designer, John M. Wilgus, was locally well-known in the late 19th and early 20th centuries as the architect of several Collegetown-area mercantile-residential buildings, including the McAllister Block at the corner of Eddy and Williams Streets (1907-08), the John J. Gainey Block (demolished) at the corner of College Avenue and Dryden Road (1899), and another Gainey Block at 315-317 College Avenue (1908), as well as the Chacona Block. Wilgus also designed the brick commercial building at 114¬118 S. Cayuga St. and several downtown residences, many of which are located within National Register districts.

\textsuperscript{3} Ibid
\textsuperscript{4} Tompkins County Department of Assessment, Tompkins County Tax Assessment photograph, 1954, Historic Ithaca, Inc., Ithaca, NY.
Wilgus’s father John B. Wilgus and uncle Henry L. Wilgus were successful merchants who erected the Wilgus Block at the corner of State and Tioga Streets.

Along with the rest of Collegetown and much of the present-day city of Ithaca, the Chacona Block property was part of the extensive holdings amassed by Simeon DeWitt following the allotment of lands within the Military Tract. The area now called Collegetown was settled relatively early due to the abundant water power provided by Cascadilla Creek. In 1827 Otis Eddy, for whom Eddy Street is named, established his cotton mill on the current site of Cascadilla Hall. Eddy had already constructed a dam in Cascadilla Gorge to direct water to his mill pond. Called Willow Pond, it endured until the 1890s, crossed by Huestis Street immediately north of the present-day sites of the Chacona Block and Sheldon Court.

Much of the land on East Hill was farmed or grazed during the early 19th century, and in 1857 the DeWitt farm north of Cascadilla Creek was purchased by Ezra Cornell, who would go on to donate 200 acres for the campus of his namesake university. To the south of the creek, much of present-day Collegetown was part of the 21-acre John and Samuel Giles estate. Possibly anticipating commercial and residential development after the opening of Cornell University in 1868, the Giles heirs divided the estate into urban-size parcels and sold them in the 1870s. The lot that would become 411-415 College Avenue was identified as Lot #4 of the John and Samuel Giles estate; the lot that would become 409 College Avenue was Lot #3.5

The shortage of student housing that continues to plague Cornell today began as soon as the University opened in 1868. At that time, the university provided only two lodging facilities: Cascadilla Hall and a portion of Morrill Hall. Cascadilla Hall was repurposed building designed (but never used) as a water-cure sanitarium located on the rim of the gorge across Cascadilla Creek from the campus. Morrill Hall was the first building designed and constructed for university use, and included both residential and instructional space. Those who did not lodge on campus rented rooms in homes downtown and endured multiple daily treks up East Hill before omnibus service began in 1876.

It appears that the first structure on the site of the Chacona Block was the boardinghouse constructed for Ellen M. Murphy in 1884 to cater to Cornell University students living off-campus in proximity to the student-oriented services beginning to flourish at the edge of campus. The house appears in an undated photograph prior to 1904 as a 2-story frame gable-and-ell structure with several projections and additions probably intended to maximize the number of rentable rooms.6 It was one of four large, wood frame, residential style buildings on the east side of the block. This prominently located property across from Sheldon Court was sought after as a

5 Deed conveying 413-415 College Avenue to Student Agencies Properties, Inc. from Lynn Breedlove and Gary Gut, May 19 1977, Office of the Tompkins County Clerk, book 557, page 467, Ithaca, NY. Deed conveying 411 College Avenue to John E. Van Natta from Giles heirs, April 8 1876, Office of the Tompkins County Clerk, book 9, page 325, Ithaca, NY.
6 Carol Sisler, Margaret Hobbie, and Jane Marsh Dieckmann, eds., Ithaca’s Neighborhoods, (Ithaca, NY: DeWitt Historical Society of Tompkins County, 1988), 168. The photograph also shows the Otis Eddy Mill Pond, which had disappeared by the time the publication of the 1904 Sanborn Maps company fire insurance map of Ithaca.
business location by the early 1900s, with a January 9, 1908 *Ithaca Daily News* article reporting that Ms. Murphy turned down an offer of $13,000 for the property amid speculation that the east side of the 400 block of College Avenue would soon be developed into one business block.\(^7\)

During the planning of the Chaona Block in 1911, it was noted that Mr. Chacona had not yet decided whether the existing boardinghouse building would be torn down or relocated.\(^8\)

The heyday of the Collegetown boardinghouses lasted from around 1880 to 1915. During this time, they provided meals to many who lodged elsewhere – downtown or within fraternity houses that lacked dining facilities. The advent of on-campus cafeterias sounded the death-knell for the boardinghouses, already losing business to the newer rooming-houses and apartment buildings appearing in Collegetown. By 1919 only one of the four early boardinghouses remained on the 400 block of College Avenue.

John N. Chacona purchased 411 and 413-415 College Avenue from Ellen Murphy on June 30, 1911. The Chaona Block was constructed to reflect the existence of the two parcels, with a masonry wall dividing the ground floor along the property line. For many years following Chaona’s ownership, the two parcels were held by different owners.

The plans for the new building were made public August 3, 1911\(^9\) and newspaper coverage followed the project until its completion in 1912. The cost of the building was estimated at $30,000-$40,000. It contained space on the ground floor for three shops, and three six-room flats on each of the second and third floors, all “strictly up-to-date with all modern conveniences,” including a vacuum cleaning system, steam heat, and electric light.\(^10\) The attic was designated for storage. The northern two apartments on each floor were accessible from a common, skylit stairway and hall, while the southern apartments were reached from a separate entrance and stair hall, lit by windows opening to a narrow light well between the southern and central units.

Masonry, structural steel and carpentry work was contracted to the Ithaca Contracting Company, plumbing and heating work were done by W. C. Dean, wiring and electrical work by Davis-Brown Electrical Company, “painters and decorators” were the firm of Vredenburg, Kelly & Bell, and the windows, plate glass, and builder’s hardware were supplied by Treman, King & Co.\(^11\)

The Chaona Block apartments were representative of flat-style apartment units, an urban housing mode that contained kitchen, bathroom, and living areas in one private unit. This type of apartment became popular in Ithaca during the first two decades of the twentieth century, particularly in Collegetown.

The building was designed by the locally prominent architect, John M. Wilgus, who enjoyed a more than forty-five year career in the field. In contrast to most of his professional contemporaries such as A. B. Dale, William H. Miller, Clinton Vivian, and the partners of the firm of Gibb & Waltz, John M. Wilgus was raised in Ithaca, where his family was actively

\(^7\) *Ithaca Daily News*, January 9, 1908, page 5.
\(^8\) *Ithaca Chronicle and Democrat*, August 17, 1911, page 5.
involved in the business and social life of the city from the mid-19th through the early-20th centuries. His father John B. and uncle Henry L. Wilgus commissioned the Wilgus Block, erected in 1867-68 at the southwest corner of State and Tioga Streets, home to the Wilgus Bros. retail firm and Wilgus Hall (later Wilgus Opera House), a site now occupied by a portion of the Center Ithaca building. Local newspapers regularly reported on activities and events associated with Wilgus family members, such as the February 5, 1880, wedding of John M. and Carrie Thompson, the daughter of Ithaca grocer Thaddeus Thompson, complete with a description of the bride’s attire, wedding gifts (including a calendar clock) and the presence of the “city orchestra” at the reception. The marriage in 1890 of John’s sister, Lois, to Cornell graduate J. Herbert Ballantine, a member of the noted New Jersey brewing company, was covered as “the nuptial event of the season.” The press followed the career of John’s brother, Charles, who purchased and consolidated two newspapers in Ravenna, Ohio, commissioning John to design a substantial new building there in 1904. The travels of John, Carrie and their daughter Amelia were also noted by the local papers, whether trips to visit friends in Auburn, New York, to the Pan-American Exposition in Buffalo in 1901 or to visit family in Pasadena, California in 1913.

John M. Wilgus began his architectural career in the mid-1880s, and as a member of an established family within the Ithaca community, he likely had numerous social and business connections that would bolster his long and successful career. Unlike some of his contemporaries, John M. Wilgus did not pursue architectural studies at Cornell University or work in the prestigious office of William H. Miller. After some limited design work on his own, he partnered with Alfred B. Dale, a well-known local architect during the last half of the 19th century. Dale’s works included the Boardman House at 120 E. Buffalo St. (DeWitt Park Historic District), the Griffin Block at 224 E. State St. (NR Ithaca Downtown Historic District), and the Andrus-Whiton House at 222 S. Aurora St. (Individual Local Landmark). Although this partnership was short-lived, it undoubtedly gave Wilgus valuable professional experience and exposure to potential clients within and outside of the community. In June 1887, Wilgus set up his own office in the Wilgus Block, and began designing buildings that ranged widely in terms of architectural style and programmatic use. His works included everything from single-family residences to three- and four-story mixed-use buildings to a least one religious structure. Some of his early residential works included the F. M. Bush House at 110 N. Albany St. (1889; Downtown West Historic District), E. P. Gilbert House at 518 E. State St. (c. 1893; East Hill Historic District), and C. A. Ives duplex at 204 N. Cayuga St. (1893; DeWitt Park Historic District). Wilgus’s mixed-use commercial and apartment buildings included the Livingston Apartments at 318 E. Seneca St. (1896), 114-118 S. Cayuga St. (1898; NR Ithaca Downtown Historic District), the McAllister Block at 418-426 Eddy St. (1894-95; redesigned and rebuilt 1908-09 after fire; East Hill Historic District), and the Gainey Block at 315-317 College Avenue.

---

13 Ithaca Democrat, September 25, 1890, page 1.
14 Ithaca Democrat, August 29, 1895, page 5; Ithaca Daily Journal, May 28, 1904, page 3, respectively.
15 Ithaca Daily Journal, June 16, 1904, page 3; October 5, 1901, page 3; February 3, 1913, page 6, respectively.
18 1888 Ithaca City Directory.
These buildings exhibit characteristics that reflect Wilgus’s pragmatic and economical approach to building design, specifically their relatively simple brick façades with limited ornamentation.

One of Wilgus’s more distinctive commissions, the First Church of Christ, Scientist again demonstrated his ability to meet the aesthetic, practical and financial needs of his clients. Located at the base of Cascadilla Park, an early-20th century planned residential development along Cascadilla Gorge, this Craftsman Style church was designed to meet the aesthetic requirements of this upscale development and the financial restrictions of the congregation that commissioned it. Built in 1910-11, the church’s simple design reflected the architectural quality of the surrounding residences, provided the programmatic space needed by the congregation, and proved buildable within the limited means of the organization.

The design of the Chacona Block at 411-415 College Avenue reflected this same practical approach to design as well as the architect’s consideration of the needs and wishes of his client. Reminiscent of his other mixed-use, commercial, and apartment buildings, Wilgus’s design for the Chacona Block included a relatively unadorned west façade and north elevation, a simple wood cornice and a stepped parapet. The building’s large windows openings, skylight over the central interior staircase and light well between 411 and 413-415 College Avenue admitted natural light into the interior spaces and reduced the need for artificial light, an expensive amenity in 1912. The original storefronts on the 413-415 College Avenue reflected this same design approach but on a much smaller scale. The large plate glass windows at street level on the west façade and north elevation allowed pedestrians to easily see the merchandise within the shops. The prism-glass transoms over the plate glass windows on the west façade provided ventilation through their casement openings and directed natural light into the deep commercial spaces, again reducing the need for artificial light. The wood cornice above the glazed storefronts and the recessed doors completed the simple, yet highly functional, storefront composition.

The client’s influence on the design was most distinctly represented in the pebble-dash stucco exterior, a unique feature of this design, and the west façade’s stone plaques. The building’s distinctive lion’s head and Greek cross decorative plaques at the fourth floor bore witness to John N. Chacona’s native land.

Wilgus’s design also addressed concerns about life-safety in the quickly urbanizing Collegetown neighborhood. Fires remained a tremendous threat in the neighborhood well into the early-20th century. This danger was the result of the lack of running water in some buildings, the continued use of kerosene and gas lighting, and the lack of organized fire protection for Collegetown. Although the Company No. 9 firehouse was established in 1895 and a better water supply secured, major fires continued to destroy properties on the hill. A 1907 fire damaged several Eddy Street buildings, including the locations of the John Chacona Candy Company store, the Student Agencies laundry, and a men’s clothing shop, possibly the Toggery Shops which moved

---


to the new Chacona Block along with the candy store in 1912. The modern rooming houses and apartment buildings constructed in the early 1900s – Sheldon Court, the Larkin Building and others – were constructed of fire-resistant materials, heated with steam, and illuminated with electric lights to reduce the danger of fire. Wilgus incorporated these features as well as structural terra cotta tile and stucco, steel framing and abundant sources of natural light into the design to reduce the threat posed by fire.  

The commissioner of the Chacona Block, John N. Chacona, was an active and influential member of the Greek-American business community in Ithaca at the turn of the 20th century. John N. Chacona was born in Sparta, Greece in 1884 and immigrated to the United States at the age of nine. He settled in the Ithaca area in 1899 and worked at the Chacona Candy Company on East State Street with his cousin, John P. Chacona. John P. Chacona was known as “Big John” and John N. Chacona was known as “Little John”. These nicknames were commonly known and frequently used to distinguish John P. from John N. in newspaper accounts of their business and family activities. The two operated successful confectionary stores together and independently, not only in Ithaca but also in Buffalo and Syracuse. When their partnership dissolved, John N. opened several independent confectionary shops, the first being at 416 Eddy St. He also operated the Sugar Bowl restaurant, a business he purchased from John P. Chacona.

With the completion of the Chacona block in 1912, John N. opened another confectionary shop in the storefront at 415 College Avenue. With its close proximity to Cornell University, Chacona’s confectionary shop at 415 College Avenue, and John N. Chacona, himself, became important parts of student life. In the April 26, 1918 issue of the Cornell Daily Sun, the satirical “Freshman Rules for 1918-19” referenced the store in rule number three: “no freshman shall be allowed in Chacona’s or downstairs in Candyland under any circumstances, nor upstairs in either, unless accompanied by an upperclassman.” References to the John N. Chacona and his candy shop appeared regularly in the Cornell Era, a student produced publication published between 1868 and 1924. A poem titled “Fame” by Morris Bishop, class of 1913 and later Cornell historian, in the 1912-1913 issue of this publication included these lines: “With the John N. Chacona Hussars/Then followed the Greeks of the Candy Trade./Their Martial rage to evince/And red-haired youths spoiled my drinks/(I’ve hardly recovered since).”

Apart from Chacona’s confectionary shop in 415 College Avenue, the storefronts at 411 and 413 College Avenue were occupied by numerous student-oriented businesses in the second and third decades of the 20th century, including The Toggery Shops, a billiards establishment, A & B

---

22 An announcement in a local newspaper awarding the bids for the construction of the building noted that the building was to be constructed of hollow tile with a stucco exterior, and that steel was to be used for girders and beams. The masonry, structural steel and carpentry contract was reported to have been let to Ithaca Contracting Company. Ithaca Chronicle & Democrat, August 17, 1911, page X. Upon completion of the Chacona Block, the No. 9 hook and ladder truck was called out to determine whether the extension ladder could reach the top of the new building; it exceeded the height of the building by five feet. Ithaca Daily News, May 17, 1912, page 3

23 “J.N. Chacona’s Twenty Years,” Ithaca Daily News, August 16,1919, page 5


25 Cornell Daily Sun, April 26, 1918

Stores selling student supplies, and the Orchard Tea Shop. Pop’s Place, the confectionary shop and, later, restaurant operated by John G. Papayanakos, replaced the Chacona shop in the corner space at 415 College Avenue. During this time, at least two physicians rented flats for use as offices, while they resided elsewhere. Several Chacona family members, including John N. Chacona, also lived in the building. Although it was in a prime location for attracting student renters, the building’s other early occupants were widows and professionals, including the principal of the Cascadilla School, suggesting that the six-room flats were beyond the means of most students at the time.27

The relocation of John N. Chacona’s confectionary shop from Eddy Street to College Avenue was part of a larger shift in student- and university-oriented businesses from Eddy Street to College Avenue in the early decades of the twentieth century. Other businesses that moved from Eddy Street to College Avenue at this time were L.C. Bement’s Toggery Shops, relocating to the Chacona Block, and the Taylor & Co. Book Shop, relocating to ground floor of Sheldon Court. While the nineteenth century saw student-oriented development both downtown and at the edge of campus with a concentration along Eddy Street, in the early twentieth century, the construction of large, commercial-style mixed-use buildings firmly established the 400 block of College Avenue as the heart of Collegetown. The construction of the Chacona Block was a key part of the area’s transformation from an extension of downtown housing and services to a vibrant neighborhood with a distinct identity. The distinct shift was documented in following passage in the October 16, 1912 issue of the Cornell Alumni News:

> Mercantile changes have taken place on the fringe of the campus. Right at the end of College Avenue (Huestis Street), near the campus entrance, across from Sheldon Court, Little John Chacona has built a big stucco block for stores and apartments. Little John sells candy and ice cream there. One of the stores in the block has been occupied by L.C. Bement, the hatter, hosier, etc., etc., who has given up his shop on Eddy Street. Taylor & Company also have closed their Eddy Street store and have doubled the size of the Triangle Book Shop in Sheldon Court. Business tends to seek the center of population, and the student center has moved up the hill in recent years. Hence the removals from Eddy Street. College Avenue now drains a big area of students every day, and it is lined with shops for two long blocks.28

The dual nomenclature of College Avenue in this passage alluded to a significant event that permanently marked this street as the geographic center of Collegetown. With support from the street residents and business owners, the City of Ithaca renamed Huestis Street as College Avenue in 1908.

Three years after opening his 415 College Avenue store, he sold the business to his brothers, Paul and Marcus, when he sailed to Greece to visit family. Upon his return to Ithaca in 1917, John N. purchased the confectionary back from his brothers and operated the business until 1919,

when he sold the shop and block and returned to Greece, this time to bring his wife and children back to Ithaca.\textsuperscript{29} He also established Cozy Corners, a “delicatessen lunch and imported food novelty shop,” at the corner of E Buffalo and N. Aurora Streets in 1926.\textsuperscript{30}

In 1919 John N. Chacona sold the Chacona Block and confectionary business to James P. and John G. Papayanakos, immigrants or their descendants hailing from the same Greek village as the Chaconas. Papayanakos’ business became known as Pop’s Place and operated at 415 College Avenue until 1977 under a series of owners, many of whom were Greek-American.\textsuperscript{31} In fact, the ownership of the building and proprietorship of tenant businesses at 413-415 College Avenue through much of the twentieth century appears to have been by immigrants and/or their descendants from the same village.\textsuperscript{32} The close business associations of these families were part of the national pattern of cultural and family ties maintained by Greek and other immigrant groups.

The southern portion of the Chacona Block, 411 College Avenue, came under different ownership in 1925 when it was sold to George F. Doll, the proprietor of a men’s clothing shop occupying the storefront of 411. In 1954 he sold the property to Emmet M. and Mabel Doane (Mabel operated the Hill Beauty Shoppe out of the storefront of 411), who in turn sold to Student Agencies Properties, Inc. in 1972. The owners of 413-415 College Avenue at that time, Lynn Breedlove and Gary Gut, sold the northern portion of the Chacona Block to Student Agencies in 1977, once again consolidating the two parcels’ ownership.

Student Agencies Properties, Inc. is a wholly-owned subsidiary of Student Agencies, Inc., the oldest independent student-run company in the United States. It was founded in 1894, providing laundry and other profitable services to the student population. For several years the company was sold from board to board, as students graduated and moved on, before it was finally incorporated in 1910. With over $2 million in annual revenues, Student Agencies is the second-largest employer of students after Cornell, and its services include shipping and storage, moving, campus promotions, note-taking, housing, and publication of the Cornellian Yearbook.\textsuperscript{33}

Student Agencies had made improvements and modifications to the Chacona Block over the last 30 years, including the installation of a sprinkler system. In the 1990s 411 and 413-415, which already shared a single fire escape, were consolidated into a single parcel.

\textsuperscript{29} Ithaca Daily Journal, February 15, 1917, page 5.
\textsuperscript{31} “Pop’s Place, Higher rent ends the experiment,” Ithaca Journal, June 9, 1977, page 20.
\textsuperscript{32} Directory of the Tsintzinian Heritage Society of America. Owners of 413-415 College Avenue included James P. and John G. Papayanakos (likely two of three brothers who settled in Ithaca in the mid-1920s), George P. Nickles (original name Nikolaides), Peter J. Poulos (a John J. Poulos reportedly came to Ithaca before 1913), and Constantine J. Manos (original name Voulomanos). Long-term leases on the candy shop were given to Constantine J. Manos and George Conomikes (originally Economikis).
Today, the tenants of the Chacona Block’s storefronths – two eateries and a store selling t-shirts and other Cornell-logo gear – reflect changes to the character of Collegetown and the orientation of its businesses in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. The variety of businesses catering to students and other residents once included bookstores, salons and barbershops, eateries, and clothing and shoe stores. Today, dining and entertainment are by far the largest proportion of business types in the neighborhood. The residential units within the Chacona block, reorganized to offer 1-bedroom to 5-bedroom apartments, remain highly desirable as student rentals.
October 1, 2019

Bryan McCracken
Historic Preservation Planner
Division of Planning and Economic Development, City of Ithaca
108 E. Green Street, 3rd Floor
Ithaca, N.Y. 14850

Re: 411-415 College Avenue Additional Information for Site Plan Review

Dear Bryan:
On behalf of the project team, attached please find copies of the 411-415 College Avenue Site Plan Review submission materials which have been submitted and presented to date. We plan to discuss with the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission during their upcoming meeting on October 10th as part of the Site Plan Review process.

This submission includes:

- Project narrative, describing the overall project approach – Pages 2 – 8
- Copy of the Memorandum of Commitment – Pages 9 – 11
- Site Boundary and Topographic Map – Page 12
- Limits of Disturbance Plan – Page 13
- Landscape and Site Design Conceptual Diagrams – Pages 14 – 20
- Landscape Plan with precedent images – Page 21
- Zoning Diagram – Page 22
- Architectural Design Conceptual Diagrams – Pages 23 – 26
- Architectural Elevations – Pages 27 – 28
- Architectural Renderings – Pages 29 – 31

The Planning Board declared Lead Agency for the project during their recent September 24th meeting, and we anticipate continuing our dialogue with the Board as part of the Site Plan and SEQR review process during the upcoming months. We understand that the ILPC is an advisory body to the Board, and we appreciate this opportunity to present the proposal to the Committee.

Should there be any questions ahead of the meeting, please do not hesitate to ask.

Sincerely,

Kate Chesebrough
Senior Designer, Whitham Planning & Design
Project Narrative – Site Plan Review Application

Originally submitted 8/22/19, Revisions as of 9/3/19

Project Overview

- The project proposed by Student Agencies Properties located at 411-415 College Avenue in the Collegetown district will introduce a newly constructed mixed-use commercial retail and residential building with an adjacent plaza open space. This project will create a new community-focused hub of activity in Collegetown while continuing to provide high-quality retail, residential, and public open space. This site is a cornerstone site of Collegetown life and the proposed project will introduce a new chapter of 411-415 College Avenue.

- The project combines the characteristics of a pedestrian friendly environment with the high-quality urban design elements that are outlined throughout Chapter 325, Article IX of the City of Ithaca code. At street level, the project will provide leasable tenant space for a use that is allowable by Section 325-45.3 for the MU-2 district as well as a large outdoor plaza that will include outdoor dining, informal gathering, and plantings.

- The existing conditions of the site are nearly identical to what is proposed: a mixed-use, multi-story building with ground floor retail and residential apartments above, with an existing outdoor dining and informal gathering space. The site is 0.32 acres in size and is within a Mixed Use 2 (MU-2) zoning district. The project is proposed as-of-right.

Conceptual Overview

- This design of this project is inspired by the site itself as it interprets its location as well as qualities of water.

- The character of College Avenue is a dynamic, vibrant commercial and mixed use corridor. This contrasts the character of Oak Avenue, which is straddled by quieter residential and institutional uses on one side and the Cascadilla Gorge trails and natural area on the other. College Avenue continues across the bridge into the Cornell campus, and Oak Avenue marks the western boundary of the Collegetown neighborhood. When considering these contextual relationships, the site can be considered a gateway focal point, an integral part of the Collegetown urban fabric, an ‘eddy’ of rest, and a pivotal moment of transition between the traditional Collegetown neighborhood and the innovative Cornell University campus.

- Various qualities of water are present as part of the site’s history and as part of the experience of the site today. Historic photos from the late 1800s to early 1900s of the area surrounding 411-415 College indicate a constructed mill pond, called Willow Pond, adjacent to a small industrial bridge that crossed Cascadilla Gorge. This street was named Huestis Street, which later became College Avenue and the existing bridge. The placid surface of Willow Pond was very different from the water carving its sinuous, rushing path through the Cascadilla Gorge today. The Cascadilla Gorge trail is a well-travelled, seasonally-used path connecting Fall Creek and downtown to Collegetown and the
Cornell campus, terminating within close proximity to the project site. Throughout the year, the sound of rushing water can be heard from the project site, and the seasonal changes of ice, meltwater, and fluctuating stream levels can be seen from a short distance to the project site.

Site Boundary Overview
- The project proposal includes improvements to property owned by Student Agencies, Inc., as well as to immediately adjacent property owned by Cornell University. Through a long-term ground lease between SA and Cornell, SA has the right to develop the outdoor plaza on this Cornell parcel.

Historic Status Overview
- This project honors the historic fabric of College Avenue while turning to the future. Over the course of 2017, the Ithaca Landmark Preservation Commission, the Planning and Development Board, the Planning and Economic Development Committee, and Common Council, together with Student Agencies Properties, studied in-depth the viability of preserving the existing structure located on the property, and it was ultimately concluded that the same was not feasible. In recognition of the historic character of the surrounding neighborhood, however, Student Agencies Properties committed itself to incorporating into the design of its project a number of features that contribute to and are reflective of the historical character of its surroundings, which commitment was memorialized as a Memorandum of Understanding between the Common Council and Student Agencies Properties ("MOU"). The commitments made by Student Agencies Properties in the MOU are fully honored by this project.
  - The MOU mitigates any potential negative environmental impacts that the project could have in terms of existing historic character of adjacent properties, as the project sponsor proposes developing the site in a way that does not detract from the historic character of College Avenue and surrounding neighborhood.
  - The MOU affects the proposed design of the project in a number of ways that are currently demonstrated in project drawings submitted to date and will continue to affect the project as further details are decided as part of the design process.
    - The proposed plaza will be comparable in scale and quality to the existing plaza; see Landscape Overview.
    - The project will extend the cornice line along the top of the fourth story and setting back the fifth and sixth story; see Architectural Overview.
    - Maintaining the strong streetwall of College Avenue by being contextual with materials and colors; see Architectural overview.
    - Fenestration patterns along the 400 block of College Avenue are referenced in the proposal; see Architectural Overview.
    - Integration of design elements including the lion’s head will be added to the façade; see Architectural Overview.
    - A commemorative plaque on the new building will be added; see Architectural Overview.
Architectural Overview

- This project gracefully responds to the historic fabric of College Avenue while also turning to face the future as the site is also immediately adjacent to the Cornell Campus. The project demonstrates high-quality architectural design that is sensitive to the historic urban fabric of College Avenue on one side of the façade and is also innovative and contemporary when the façade turns the corner onto Oak Avenue where it faces Cornell University and Cascadilla Gorge. This approach exemplifies some of the best contemporary architectural projects that interface with existing historic elements: by contrasting the new and the old, one is able to fully appreciate the details and intention of both styles. (Text added 8/29/19)

- The 5 stories above street level will provide a total of 56 student apartment units, which will be a mixture of Studios, 1 Bedroom units, 2 Bedroom units and 3 Bedroom units. The exterior design concept intends to highlight the unique perspective of Student Agencies Properties as both an organization with a rich 125 year history but also as an organization that is run by current, forward thinking Cornell University students.

- The total gross floor area [GFA] is approximately 59,000 sf.

- The College Avenue elevation continues the existing street wall and responds to the existing context of the street by utilizing a similar tripartite organization of a base, a vertically oriented center section and a cap. At the top of the fourth story, the plane of the College Avenue elevation will step back and change material in order to continue the existing cornice line along the street.

- The final materials, color and window proportions/types for the College Avenue façade will recall the existing urban fabric of neighboring buildings as demonstrated in attached architectural diagrams. As the project develops further, the team will look to incorporate the medallion elements from the existing building as well as determine a location for a plaque that will commemorate the history of the site.

- The Northern elevation (along Oak Avenue) is envisioned as mostly glass to represent the future of the organization. A large cantilevered “wedge” provides cover to the seating area below and creates a large outdoor urban space. The orientation of this elevation faces the gorge and the Cornell campus, and is intended to have a reflective quality that will provide an ever changing visual during different times of the day and/or year. The corner of these two elevations is shown as glass and is intended to provide a transition between the two stylistically different but related elevations.

Zoning Overview

- The following information illustrates how the project complies with the requirements of Chapter 325, Article IX. The maximum allowable building height in the MU-2 district is 80ft and/or 6 stories. The proposed project complies with both requirements with an estimated height of 72ft and a total of 6 stories. As the project develops, a mechanical penthouse may be needed. If a penthouse is added, it will not exceed the allowable height of 9ft as indicated in section 325-45.2B(14). Additionally, it is anticipated that one of the stairs will access the roof. This will also not exceed the allowable height of 9ft. In the MU-2 district, the minimum allowable floor to floor
heights are 12ft at street level, and 10ft at the upper levels. The proposed project will be designed to match the existing floor heights of 409 College Ave, which are 14ft at street level and 11ft at the upper levels, and are in compliance with the requirement.

- The maximum allowable lot coverage in the MU-2 district is 100% except as required for a rear yard. The required front yard setback is 0ft minimum and 2ft maximum, the required side yard setback is 0ft and the required rear setback minimum is 10ft. The proposed project complies with these requirements and provides an additional side yard setback along a significant portion of the Ground floor as shown in the attached site plan.
- The attached site plan includes zoning setback information.

Infrastructure Overview

- Existing utilities have capacity to support the proposed project as documented in the Full Environmental Assessment Form. These include existing sewer, water, electrical, and telecommunication lines that serve the existing building.

- Water - Two existing copper water services to the site from an existing 12-inch City main in the street on College Avenue will be disconnected in advance of starting demolition of the existing building. All remaining water piping and appurtenances will be removed from the site. Water service to the new building will be supplied by the City of Ithaca distribution system from their East Hill pressure grid. A new 6-inch ductile iron combined fire and domestic service main will connect to the City main in the street. In coordination with City DPW, the improvements are expected to include replacement of one fire hydrant near the street intersection and replacement of a relatively short section of the existing main near the northwest corner in the street. Normal static water pressure at the main is approximately 95 psi. The design average daily water demand for the new building is estimated to be approximately 5,600 gpd based on the 56 proposed bedrooms and an estimated water use of 100 gallons per day per bedroom. The existing distribution system is more than adequate to supply the estimated domestic water demands. Fire flow data provided by the City DPW from testing performed in 2003 indicates the available fire flows exceed 3,000 gpm which is more than adequate for the proposed building. A request to the DPW has been made to retest and confirm the data even through no significant changes to the system have been made since 2003.

- Sanitary Sewer - Sanitary sewer service to the site is currently provided by a 6-inch sanitary service connected to the City collection system at a manhole at the far northwest corner of the Oak Avenue/College Avenue intersection. Video inspection of the existing service will be undertaken to see if the existing service can either be reused in its current condition or improved (relined) and reused. Alternatively, a new service with exterior trap will be installed and connected to the existing sewer main on College Avenue to serve the proposed building. Based on correspondence with the City DPW, the existing collection system is adequate to carry the expected sanitary loads from the project. In the case of installing a new service, the existing service will be disconnected and abandoned in-place in coordination with the DPW.

Pumping of sanitary waste from the lower level of the building up to either the existing or new gravity service will be necessary given the elevation relative to the sewer mains in the street.
Treatment of all sewage is provided by the Ithaca Area Wastewater Treatment Facility (IAWWTF) on Third Street which has more than adequate reserve capacity to serve the project.

- Stormwater Drainage - The project site slopes down generally from east to west, and stormwater from the site drains mainly to the City storm sewer system on College Avenue with relatively smaller areas draining to a City drainage inlet on Oak Avenue. Almost all roof areas on the existing building drain through below grade roof leaders to the City system on College Avenue. Runoff from most of the site areas north and west of the existing building drains overland to the curb lines and is collected by inlets in the street. The collection system discharges to Cascadilla Creek at an outfall located south and east of the College Avenue bridge.

Stormwater runoff from the existing driveway off Oak Avenue and the area east the existing building is collected by a pair of inlets behind the existing building. The stormwater collected by the inlets is sewered in a 12-inch reinforced concrete sewer pipe installed below the ground-level floor of the neighboring building to the south at 409 College Avenue. The 12-inch piping is connected to the City storm sewer in the street on College Avenue. The condition of the existing piping under the building will be investigated and will either be improved or replaced within the footprint of the proposed building if necessary.

Runoff from areas above the site to the east is collected by the roof drainage system associated with the neighboring church and does not drain onto or through the project site.

Similar to the existing site, stormwater runoff from the areas north and west of the proposed building will continue to flow overland to the curb line and collected by the City storm system on College Avenue and Oak Avenue. Roof runoff from the proposed building will be served by interior roof leaders connected below grade to the City storm sewer in the street, again, similar to the existing building. Improvements east of the building to relocate and reconnect one of the 2 existing inlets will also be necessary. Groundwater from the foundation drains for the lower level of the proposed building will be pumped up to the gravity roof leader piping inside the building.

- Stormwater Management - The total area of soil disturbance on the site will be approximately 0.32 acres and the projects will not be required to complete a 'Full' Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) or submit a Notice of Intent to obtain permit coverage for stormwater discharges from the NYSDEC. The project will exceed certain thresholds in the City of Ithaca stormwater regulations that will require a 'Basic’ SWPPP. The Basic SWPPP will include an erosion and sediment control plan with temporary practices to be installed and maintained during construction. The temporary measures will be designed in accordance with the current NYSDEC standards. The project will implement at least 2 Better Site Design practices as required by City Code for sites smaller than 1 acre. Post-construction stormwater management practices are not required and the project will not change the hydrology of the site.

- Electric and Telecommunications - Improvements to provide electric and telecom services to the new building will be determined by the respective utility companies and coordinated with the project. The services are expected to be below grade in existing conduits that enter the site from an existing utility pole located on Oak Avenue at the northeast corner of the site. The existing systems include a transformer pad behind the existing building at the east edge of the site, and an existing below-grade vault located near the southeast corner of the site.
Natural Gas - Existing gas service to the site is from a low-pressure gas main on Oak Avenue with a service line running parallel to the existing electric conduits east of the building. The existing low-pressure service is expected to either be reused or replaced depending on the needs of the building and determinations by the gas utility company, NYSEG. Medium pressure gas service is available from a NYSEG main located approximately 150 feet south of the site on College Avenue but would require an extension of the main in the street and the installation of a meter and regulator assembly on the west face of the proposed building.

Because the project construction activities are not disturbing an area of land greater than 1 acre, a Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan will not be required for this project. All necessary erosion and sediment controls during construction will be implemented.

Construction Overview
- The project team is currently putting a construction management team together for the project, and we expect this process to be complete by early fall 2019. With their participation, construction phasing, staging areas, and access plans will be developed. All potential construction management candidates have worked in the City of Ithaca and are familiar with the process and regulations for building within an urban context.
- Clear, safe pedestrian access past the site, impact if any on local traffic patterns, and hours of construction will be identified. Anticipated noise levels during construction activities will abide by the City of Ithaca noise ordinance regulations.

Landscape Overview
- The landscape design development of 411-415 College Ave. was informed by a large-scale analysis of the existing site and its location at the nexus of campus, Collegetown, and the Cascadilla Gorge corridor. The site-scale proposal for the plaza is informed by a fundamental understanding of movement and rest in and near the site. The qualities of water as it rushes, eddies, and reflects during changes of elevation and season recall the iconic waterfalls and pools in the Cascadilla Gorge today, as well as the placid surface of the historic mill pond. The tension between movement and rest inspired the treatment of the edge between these two activities that enliven this space throughout the day and night. An understanding of the rhythm of daily life in the site relates to movement and rest in the site, as visitors stop by individually to collect themselves before or after their day over a quiet cup of coffee, meet up with friends over a shared meal, gather in large groups and make new acquaintances on the plaza in the setting sun and into the night.
- The proposed outdoor plaza space is going to be as large or larger than the existing outdoor seating and dining area that is known by many at this site. The proposed design allows for even greater flexibility for gathering and a pleasant environment that is comparable in many ways to the space that is enjoyed by many today. This design envisions movable tables and chairs that will accommodate individuals and groups to sit on tables, chairs, and seating walls.
- Proposed steps, seating walls, and planting areas will accommodate the grade change between the finished floor of the new building and the existing sidewalk. The elevational relationship between the bench lines creates a stacked seating, ‘amphitheater’ effect in the easternmost part of the plaza where
there is the most grade change. This area of the plaza, as well as some details of the plaza as a whole, is still in design development to potentially allow for additional outdoor seating in this area while accommodating grade change in a user-friendly way.

- The design of the plaza creates as much flexible open area as possible for dining and other activities while proposing user-friendly seating walls to define the edge of the plaza and the public sidewalk. The edge becomes a space in its own right, as one can sit facing the plaza or the street.
- The preliminary design of the plaza illustrates curvilinear seating walls that respond to the alignment of Oak Avenue while also playing on a water- and movement-inspired theme. Two curvilinear lines make up the site concept and can be used for seating. These two lines are occupiable seating walls, and each of the two lines have their own material identity. These back-to-back lines create interest and frame the space within the plaza and views out to the street.
- The seating wall line facing Oak Avenue is conceptually proposed as a cut stone seating wall with underlighting. This material references the Cascadilla Gorge corridor just across the street. The seating wall line facing the interior of the plaza is conceptually proposed to be made of a more contemporary material such as a manufactured wood or resin, potentially with a bold color accent. This line will define the edge of the plaza, framing gathering spaces for groups and individuals.
- Space for plantings is created where the two seating wall lines peel apart from each other. This further softens the edge between the site and the gorge, referencing the nearby planting palette.
- The fluidity of the seating walls complements the angularity of the Oak Avenue façade of the building to create a dynamic space, as the more regular patterning proposed within the plaza itself.
- The project will allow for clear passage of pedestrians past this site via a generously-scaled clear path of travel in a comparable way to the existing sidewalk.
MEMORANDUM OF COMMITMENT

This MEMORANDUM OF COMMITMENT is made this 1st day of November 2017 by Student Agencies Properties, Inc. ("Student Agencies"), a wholly-owned subsidiary of Student Agencies Foundation, Inc., an education-focused charitable organization with offices at 409 College Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850, in favor of the Common Council of the City of Ithaca, having offices at 108 East Green Street, Ithaca, New York ("City").

RECITALS:

WHEREAS, Student Agencies is the owner of certain real property located in the City of Ithaca, County of Tompkins and State of New York, known as 411-415 College Avenue, City of Ithaca, State of New York, Tax Map Parcel 64.-2-1 ("Site"); and

WHEREAS, Student Agencies understands and shares the community’s strong affinity for the corner of College Avenue and Oak Avenue; in particular, the outdoor space along the north side of the building located on the Site, which holds many lasting memories for generations of Ithacans and Cornellians; and

WHEREAS, Student Agencies recognizes the importance of the Site being occupied by a building that is contextually sensitive to the existing architectural and cultural fabric of the 400 block of College Avenue; and

WHEREAS, Student Agencies, having a longstanding and continuing commitment to being an engaged and contributing community member, wishes to develop the Site in a manner that gives the City of Ithaca, and current and future residents, a new space that thoughtfully blends new and old, and enables future generations of Ithacans and Cornellians to create their own lasting memories at the Site;

NOW, THEREFORE, unless and until the City designates the current buildings on the Site as individual landmarks or establishes a historic district in which the Site is located pursuant to the City of Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Ordinance or any similar law, which would materially alter the physical development potential of the Site, Student Agencies hereby makes the following commitments to the City:

1. Student Agencies commits to develop the Site in a way that includes an outdoor space that is comparable to the outdoor space that is currently located along the north side of the building located on the Site.

2. Student Agencies commits to develop the Site in a way that incorporates the following design elements, subject to all required municipal approvals and the requirements of applicable law:
   a. Continuation of the existing cornice line along the east side of the 400 block of College Avenue, including a setback for any floors above the cornice line.
b. Maintenance of the strong street wall along the east side of the 400 block of College Avenue.

c. Use of materials and colors on the street façade consistent with the existing structures along the east side of the 400 block of College Avenue.

d. Reference to the fenestration pattern along the east side of the 400 block of College Avenue.

e. Thoughtful integration of certain design elements from the current building (e.g. the lion’s head and/or Greek cross medallions).

f. Creation and placement of a plaque on the new structure commemorating the history of the Site.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the undersigned have caused this Memorandum of Commitment to be executed and delivered by its duly authorized representatives as of the date first set forth above.

STUDENT AGENCIES PROPERTIES, INC.

By: Kyle R. Karnes
Title: Chief Executive Officer

By: Luke Bushner
Title: President
STATE OF NEW YORK  
COUNTY OF TOMPKINS  

On this 26th day of October, 2017, before me, the undersigned, personally appeared Kylee Kinney, known to me or proved to me on the basis of satisfactory evidence to be the individual whose name is subscribed to the within instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same in his capacity and that by his signature on the instrument, the individual or the person upon behalf of whom the individual acted, executed the instrument.

Maury E. Mazza  
NOTARY PUBLIC

STATE OF NEW YORK  
COUNTY OF TOMPKINS  

On this 26th day of October, 2017, before me, the undersigned, personally appeared Mike Busower, known to me or proved to me on the basis of satisfactory evidence to be the individual whose name is subscribed to the within instrument and acknowledged to me that he executed the same in his capacity and that by his signature on the instrument, the individual or the person upon behalf of whom the individual acted, executed the instrument.

Maury E. Mazza  
NOTARY PUBLIC
Cut stone seating with underlight

Wooden bench with color accents
NOTE: 411-415 COLLEGE AVENUE IS LOCATED IN THE MU-2 ZONING DISTRICT
West Elevation of 400 Block of College Avenue

Partial East Elevation of 400 Block of College Avenue

411-415 College Avenue

Existing Conditions

September 24, 2019
Unarticulated 6 Story building competes in scale with rest of College Avenue
- Material change and step back of the top 2 stories brings the building down to the correct scale
- Continuing the datums from the existing buildings on College Ave ties building into existing context
- New building feels like a 4 story building with a penthouse
- North facade can be more monumental facing Cornell, and the gorge. Without threatening the scale and traditional

- More traditional tripartite influences.
- Possible lion heads associated with West facade

Turning the Corner and Evolving Over Time
- A youthful organization rooted in tradition.
- Architectural diction is symbolic of the organization.
411-415 College Avenue

North Elevation

September 24, 2019