ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, September 15, 2020. City Hall remains closed to the public. This meeting will be conducted remotely via the online platform Zoom, pursuant to the Governor’s Executive Order 202.1. A live stream is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtJN1P_RFaFW2IVCnTrDg.

Scheduled Public Hearings
There are two options to participate in a public hearing:

1. Submit comments by email no later than 4 p.m. on the day of the meeting (contacts below), and they will be read into the record. Each comment is limited to three minutes. Indicate in your email that the comment is for a public hearing.
2. To speak at the meeting, sign up and receive instructions through the contact(s) listed below.

General Public Comments
Send written comments to the contact(s) listed below. All comments received will be forwarded to the ILPC for their consideration. Written comments received well in advance of the meeting give the Commission time to fully consider them. A minimum of 15 minutes will be allotted at the beginning of the meeting to read comments, if needed. Please indicate if you would like your comments read into the record. Each comment is limited to three minutes. The Chair will make an effort to read as many comments as time permits.

All comments and questions can be emailed to Anya Harris at aharris@cityofithaca.org or Bryan McCracken at bmccracken@cityofithaca.org or call (607) 274-6550.

I. PUBLIC HEARINGS
A. 119 Heights Court, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Remove Concrete Walkway on the North Elevation and Install a New Red Brick Walkway.
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1216

B. 230 Wait Avenue, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Install Sections of 4’ Tall Black Metal Fence in the Side and Rear Yards.
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1218

C. DeWitt Park, DeWitt Park Historic District – Proposal to Remove a Stone and Bronze Monument Located in the Northwest Corner of DeWitt Park Known as the “White Settlers” marker.
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1220

II. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

III. NEW BUSINESS
• 430 West State Street – Advisory Review of Redevelopment Proposal
Planning Board site plan application materials can be found at:
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1186

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
IV. OLD BUSINESS

V. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

- 408 North Tioga Street, DeWitt Park Historic District – Condition review pursuant to Sections 228-14(B) and 228-15(C) of the Municipal Code
- 122 Wait Avenue, Cornell Heights Historic District – Schedule Site Visit

VI. ADJOURNMENT

ACCESSING ONLINE MEETING MATERIALS:
Online meeting materials, like applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness and supporting materials, are available electronically via the “Document Center” on the City web site (www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter), under “Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission” > “Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness” and in the relevant address folder. Please do not hesitate to contact our office if you have any questions or you need any assistance accessing the meeting materials.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 119 Heights Court is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated August 25, 2020, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owner Sofia Akber, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) four photographs documenting existing conditions; (3) a photograph of the proposed material; and (4) a landscape plan showing the proposed site alterations, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building Structure Inventory Form for 119 Heights Court, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the removal of a concrete walkway leading from the public sidewalk to the main entrances of the residence and the installation of a red-brick-paved walkway that connects the main entrances to the driveway and runs north along the east side of said driveway until it intersects with the public sidewalk, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on September 15, 2020, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.
As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Colonial-Revival-Style residence at 119 Heights Court was constructed between 1914 and 1915.

Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Principle #3 New construction located within an historic district shall be compatible with the historic character of the district within which it is located.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the removal of the concrete walkway (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the installation of a red-brick-paved walkway (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2, Principle #3, and Standard #9, the proposed red-brick-paved walkway (is/is not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not ]

With respect to Standard #10, walkway (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 1

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmcracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

08/25/2020
Date: ______________ Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): ______________

Sofia Akber
Applicant’s Name: __________________________ Phone: _________________________
607.793.0853

sevenof9@gmail.com
Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED):

119 Heights Court, Ithaca, NY 14850
Property Address: ____________________________

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): ____________________________

Owner’s Mailing Address: ____________________________

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☑ New Construction
☐ Addition
☐ Accessory Structure
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure

☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Signage
☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer's data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The changes concern the front yard entry area and walkways. The main change involves removing the straight walkway from the front door to the sidewalk with one that curves to the left towards the driveway, and then continues alongside the driveway to the sidewalk. There is also a material change from concrete to full brick (not veneers). In detail,

1) Replace the concrete entry area (photo 1) with one made of brick

2) Remove entirely the concrete walkway leading from the entry area to the sidewalk (photo 2), and cover with grass and/or other landscaping

3) replace the stepping stones leading from the entry area to the driveway (photo 3) with a brick walkway that continues alongside the driveway to the sidewalk (photo 4). The portion of the walkway alongside the driveway would be narrower than the original walkway mentioned in point 2) and would be for everyday use by pedestrians such as the mail carrier.

The proposed material is red brick (not veneers), preferably antiqued to match the vintage style of the neighborhood (photo 5). If antiqued brick can not be found, another red brick (in a dark red or terra cotta hue, not towards orange) would be used.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

This is part of a larger project to re-landscape the front yard that includes lining the frontmost part of the yard, adjacent to the sidewalk, with bushes for privacy. The goal is to have the front yard to feel like a larger more open space to enjoy.

Currently, this yard is divided into two small segments by this unattractive concrete walkway, precluding the desired continuous row of bushes and other landscaping.

Curving the walkway to the left towards the driveway would create the larger desired area. Additionally, this layout would be more consistent with that of neighboring homes, all of which have an undivided front yard, and the walkway directing one to the driveway. The five homes to the east (on both sides of the street) are also all lined with bushes along the sidewalk.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:
I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ___________________________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ___________ Date: 08/25/2020

____________________________________

STAFF USE ONLY:
Date Received: ______________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ___________
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger
DATE: 05/15/87

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y.
TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S):
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION: 119 Heights Court
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[ ]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Mark & Dorothy Nelkin
6. USE: Original: residential
   Present: residential
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[ ] No[ ]
   Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard[ ] b. stone[ ] c. brick[ ] d. board and batten[ ]
   e. cobblestone[ ] f. shingles[ ] g. stucco[ ] other:
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]
   b. wood frame with light members[ ]
   c. masonry load bearing walls[ ]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other
10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent[ ] b. good[ ] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]
11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site[ ] b. moved[ ] if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
       See Continuation Sheet

13. MAP:
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known[X]  b. zoning[ ]  c. roads[ ]
   d. developers[ ]  e. deterioration[ ]
   f. other:
15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ]  b. carriage house[ ]  c. garage[X]
   d. privy[ ]  e. shed[ ]  f. greenhouse[ ]
   g. shop[ ]  h. gardens[ ]
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet
16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ]  b. woodland[ ]
   c. scattered buildings[ ]
   d. densely built-up[ ]  e. commercial[ ]
   f. industrial[ ]  g. residential[X]
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet
17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet
18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: ca. 1914-1915
   ARCHITECT: unknown
   BUILDER: unknown
20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
   See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
   See Continuation Sheet

22. THEME:
   See Continuation Sheet
11.

15i. A small front lawn extends to Heights Court. There are full, unmanicured foundation shrubs obscuring portions of first floor of the main facade. There is a full ornamental tree in the front yard and tall conifers and shade trees surround the building on the east and west.

15j.

16h.

17. The building is situated on a small lot and is oriented perpendicular to Heights Court. A concentration of modest period residences and apartment buildings line both sides of the Street (east and west). The house is one of approximately 150 buildings in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District, an early-twentieth century residence park and suburban development in the northeast section of the city of Ithaca.

18. This two story residence has a cross gable roof and is arranged on an L-shaped floor plan. A two story addition with flat roof is tucked into the inside juncture of the L. The front-facing gable has slightly flared boxed eaves overhanging wall surfaces. Gable ends have no overhang. There are two wall dormers on the east elevation of this block. The building is covered in painted coursed wood shingles. There are two entrances side by side in this front-facing gable. A smaller simple glazed wood door with simple doorhood of open rafters on large paired brackets is placed at the center of this facade. Adjacent (to the right) is another simple glazed wood door in a round arched opening. A shallow arched doorhood of open rafters (no brackets) continues from the adjacent hood. Windows are varied. They include primarily 6/1 double-hung sash and small, randomly placed multi-pane casements. A ribbon of single pane casement windows is found on the first floor of the two-story wing. These windows are covered by a pent roof. Windows are shuttered.
20. This house was first occupied (1915) by Victor Gage, professor of engineering at Cornell University. James B. Sumner made his family home here from about 1917 through the 1940's. Sumner was a professor of biological chemistry at Cornell University. He first isolated and crystallized the enzyme in 1926 and later received the Nobel Prize for this achievement.


22.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 230 Wait Avenue is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated August 17, 2020, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owner Alexandria DeLorenzo, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) five photographs documenting existing conditions, the proposed locations and layout of the alterations, and the appearance of the proposed material; (3) a marked-up survey map also showing the locations of the proposed alterations; (4) a NYS Certificate of Capital Improvement for the proposed project; and (5) a quote from Atlas Fence for the proposed project, dated April 14, 2020, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 230 Wait Avenue, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the installation of several sections of the 4’ high Majestic three rail Montage fencing with matching gates at the driveway on the east elevation and the side yard on the west elevation, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on September 15, 2020, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.
As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Tudor-Revival Style residence at 230 Wait Avenue was constructed between 1927 and 1929 for Cornell University professor of Rural Education Clyde B. Moore.

Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

The purpose of the proposed sections of fence are to enclose the rear yard of the property. The proposed fence will match an existing fence installed at 102 Triphammer Road.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Principle #3 New construction located within an historic district shall be compatible with the historic character of the district within which it is located.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
Standard #10  New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the installation of sections of metal fence (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2, Principle #3, and Standard #9, the proposed fence (is/is not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]

With respect to Standard #10, the fence (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 1

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 8-17-2020 Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): 40271
Applicant’s Name: Alexandra Delorenzo Phone: 757-651-8737
Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): mom2snn@gmail.com
Property Address: 230 Wait Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850
Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): 
Owner’s Mailing Address: 1146 Waters Rd, Chesapeake, VA 23322

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
☐ New Construction
☐ Addition
☐ Accessory Structure
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure
☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Signage
☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

- Addition of fencing to enclose the side & backyard of our newly purchased house.
- Fencing is identical to our neighbors @ 102 Triphammer Rd (Susskind/Long) for uniformity.
- Looking at the survey of the property, the proposed fence will extend from the east side of the house, across the driveway, with double gates, along the trees that separate the Susskind/Long driveway from ours, to the east side of the garage to connect with the existing neighbor's fence (ie "metal fence" in survey). It will then be placed across the back edge (north) of the property and stop at the stone wall (from 111 Kelvin Place). It will restart at the southern edge of the stone wall (the stone wall is too beautiful to cover up with fencing!) and continue towards the street and connect to the side of the house at the back porch. A single gate will be placed at this location so there are two possible entrances to the backyard.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

- Addition of fencing to beautify the property, add decorative appeal, to keep "Mimi" the rescued greyhound safe, and to prevent individuals from cuttng across the backyard (the current situation).
- Our oldest son, Sammy, a Cornell student, will be living in the house for the next 2 years. My husband and I, proud Cornellians, plan to visit often. In 2022, we will retire to this amazing house and intend to continue to beautify it and restore it back to its former glory.
- I should like to think that the original owner, Professor Clyde B. Moore, would be pleased!
Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner's representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18"x23":

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMccracken@cityofithaca.org, 607-274-6555.

Applicant's Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☒ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ________________________________

Applicant's Signature (REQUIRED): ___________________________ Date: 8-17-2020

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: __________________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ________________
FRONT OF HOUSE FENCE WILL BE APPROX. WHERE MINivan IS
BACKYARD
NEIGHBOR'S FENCE
SAMMY, CORNELL
A&S 2022

"MIMI" THE GREYHOUND
After this certificate is completed and signed by both the customer and the contractor performing the capital improvement, it must be kept by the contractor. Copies of this certificate must be furnished to all subcontractors on the job and retained as part of their records.

Read this form completely before making any entries.

This certificate may not be used to purchase building materials exempt from tax.

Name of contractor (print or type)
ALEXSCOE, LLC DBA ATLAS FENCE

Name of customer (print or type)
ALEXANDRA H. DELORENZO

Address (number and street)
6852 MANLIUS CENTER ROAD

Address (number and street)
230 WATKIN AVE

City
EAST SYRACUSE

City
ITHACA

State
NY

State
NY

ZIP code
13057

ZIP code
14850

To be completed by the customer

Describe capital improvement to be performed:

4' High Majestic Zraile Montage fencing + gates

I certify that:

• I am the (mark an X in one) D owner D tenant of the real property identified on this form; and
• the work described above will result in a capital improvement to the real property as outlined in the instructions of this form; and
• this contract (mark an X in one) D includes D does not include the sale of any items that will not become a permanent part of the real property (for example, a free-standing microwave or washing machine).

I understand that:

• I will be responsible for any sales tax, interest, and penalty due on the contractor's total charge for tangible personal property and for labor if it is determined that this work does not qualify as a capital improvement; and
• I will be required to pay the contractor the appropriate sales tax on tangible personal property (and any associated services) when the property installed by the contractor does not become a permanent part of the real property; and
• I will be subject to civil or criminal penalties (or both) under the Tax Law if I issue a false or fraudulent certificate.

Signature of customer __________________________ Title __________________________ Date __________________________

To be completed by the contractor

I, the contractor, certify that I have entered into a contract to perform the work described by the customer named above, and that I accept this form in good faith. (A copy of the written contract, if any, is attached.) I understand that my failure to collect tax as a result of accepting an improperly completed certificate will make me personally liable for the tax otherwise due, plus penalties and interest.

Signature of contractor or officer __________________________ Title __________________________ Date __________________________

This certificate is not valid unless all entries are completed.
# RESIDENTIAL FENCING CONTRACT

**Customer Copy**

**Syracuse Business Forms 315.694.0200**

**NAME**: Alexia Delorenzo

**ADDRESS**: 230 W. 2nd Ave. Utica, NY 13502


**DATE**: 4/18/20

---

**ALL CONTRACT NO.**

**TYPES OF FENCING**

- Complete indoor showroom
- Professional grade basketball systems

**NAME**

THIS CONTRACT DATED BELOW FOR MATERIALS AND LABOR TO BE SUPPLIED BY ATLAS FENCE, HEREINAFTER REFERRED TO AS THE CONTRACTOR AT THE SOLE REQUEST AND ORDER OF:

**DATE**

**ADDRESS**

**INSTALLATION ADDRESS**

**DIRECTIONS**

**EMAIL ADDRESS**

HEREINAFTER REFERRED TO AS OWNER FOR WORK TO BE PERFORMED AT PREMISES SET FORTH ABOVE, SUBJECT TO ALL OF THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS AS SET FORTH ON BOTH SIDES OF THIS AGREEMENT AS FOLLOWS:

---

**STYLE**

- "- Professional Grade Basketball Systems

**TOTAL FEET**

- **APPROX START DATE**
- **APPROX FINISH DATE**

**DATE**

**HOME PHONE**

**WORK PHONE**

**CELL PHONE**

**PIPE GAUGE, COLOR**

**TOTAL FEET**

**Corner Posts**

**Walk G.P.**

**WALK GATES**

**DRIVEWAY GATES**

**SLIDE GATES**

**TENSION WIRE**

**BOTOM RAIL**

**PRIVACY SLATS**

**COLOR**

---

Any contractor, subcontractor, or material man who provides home improvement goods or services pursuant to your home improvement contract and who is not paid, may have a valid legal claim against your property known as a mechanic's lien. Any mechanic's lien filed against your property may be discharged. Payment of the agreed-upon price under the home improvement contract prior to filing of a mechanic's lien may invalidate such lien. The owner may contact an attorney to determine his rights to discharge a mechanic's lien.

---

**CONDITION OF PREMISES:**

- PROPERTY STAKES?
- LINE CLEARED?
- UNDERGROUND ROCK?
- UNDERGROUND CABLES, PIPES?
- STEEP GRADES?
- DIGGER ACCESSIBLE?

**SPECIAL INSTRUCTIONS:**

- LEVEL ON TOP (may require fill underneath fence by customer)?
- FOLLOW GROUND?
- STEP FENCE?
- FABRIC/BOARDS ON OUTSIDE?

**PREPARATION NECESSARY:**

- SURVEYOR TO LOCATE LINES?
- LINES TO BE CLEARED?
- REMOVE OLD FENCE?
- HAUL AWAY?
- HOLE THRU CONCRETE/ROCK?
- PERMIT REQUIRED?

**REMARKS:**

- **DATE**
- **OWNER'S CONTRACTOR**

---

**TERMS: NET ON COMPLETION**

**AGREED PRICE BASED ON ABOVE FOOTAGE:**

**COUNTRY OF INSTALLATION:**

**CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT:**

**SALES TAX RATE:**

**TAX:**

**PREINSTALLMENT:**

**BALANCE (DUE ON COMPLETION):**

**NOTE:** The Foreman is Required to Pick Up Balance On Completion. ANY CHANGES TO THIS CONTRACT MAY RESULT IN PRICE CHANGE.

---

**ENERBANK APPROVAL/EXP. DATE**

---

**CUSTOMER COPY**

DATE

OWNER'S CONTRACTOR

SUBJECT TO ALL TERMS AND CONDITIONS ON REVERSE SIDE.
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y

TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S):

2. COUNTY: Tompkins

3. STREET LOCATION: 230 Wait Avenue

4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[X]

5. PRESENT OWNER: Jennifer H. Shea

6. USE: Original: residential

Present: residential

ADDRESS: same

7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[X] No[ ]

Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:

a. clapboard[ ] b. stone[ ] c. brick[ ] d. board and batten[ ]

e. cobblestone[ ] f. shingles[X] g. stucco[ ] other:

9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:

(if known)

a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]

b. wood frame with light members[X]

c. masonry load bearing walls[ ]

d. metal (explain)

e. other

10. CONDITION:

a. excellent[ ] b. good[X] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]

11. INTEGRITY:

a. original site[X] b. moved[ ] if so, when?

c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

See Continuation Sheet
14. THREATS TO BUILDING:
   a. none known[X]
   b. zoning[ ]
   c. roads[ ]
   d. developers[ ]
   e. deterioration[ ]
   f. other:

15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ]
   b. carriage house[ ]
   c. garage[X]
   d. privy[ ]
   e. shed[ ]
   f. greenhouse[ ]
   g. shop[ ]
   h. gardens[ ]
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ]
   b. woodland[ ]
   c. scattered buildings[ ]
   d. densely built-up[ ]
   e. commercial[ ]
   f. industrial[ ]
   g. residential[X]
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: ca. 1927-1929

   ARCHITECT: unknown

   BUILDER: unknown

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
   See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
   See Continuation Sheet

22. THEME:
   See Continuation Sheet
11.

15i. The house is nearly concealed behind a tall hedgerow on Wait Avenue. There is a small front lawn with a full ornamental tree and foundation shrubs around the house. There are fully-grown conifers and shade trees north of the site.

15j.

16h.

17. This house is situated at the heavily trafficked intersection of Wait Avenue and Triphammer Road. Other period houses (most of them of an earlier construction) are found to the north, east and west. The building is one of approximately 150 buildings in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District, an early-twentieth century residence park and suburban development in the northeast section of the city of Ithaca.

18. This one and one-half story Tudor Revival residence features steeply pitched cross gables with no eaves in gable ends. The roof of the side facing gable (east facade) hangs low over a recessed entryway. The house is sheathed in coursed wood shingles (painted). A shed dormer projects from the east facade at the roof juncture. A tall outside brick chimmney extends through the shallow eave also along this elevation. The main entrance is through the recessed entry at the intersection of the cross gables. There is also an undistinguished doorway adjacent to the entryway (east facade of the side gable). Windows are primarily paired and ribbon, multi-pane casements.

20. This house was built for Clyde B. Moore, professor of rural education at Cornell University. Moore lived here through the 1970's.

21. Ithaca City Directories; Cornell University Staff Directories

22.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, DeWitt Park is located in the DeWitt Park Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1971, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1971, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness dated August 28, 2020 was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by the City of Ithaca, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) two photographs documenting existing conditions, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the DeWitt Park Historic District National Register Nomination Form, and the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, the proposed project involves the removal of a bronze and stone monument in the northwest corner of DeWitt Park known as the “First White Settlers” marker, and the donation of the bronze plaque to the History Center in Tompkins for accession into their collection, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on September 15, 2020, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the DeWitt Park Historic District is 1820-1930.

As indicated in the National Register of Historic Places Inventory – Nomination Form, DeWitt Park was laid out by, and later named for, New York State’s first Survey General, Simeon DeWitt, in the early-19th century as the community’s “public square. To ensure DeWitt Park became the center of the burgeoning village, DeWitt donated lots around it for a school, a church, and other civic uses.
Constructed within the period of significance of the DeWitt Park Historic District and possessing a high level of architectural integrity, the DeWitt Park is a contributing element of the DeWitt Park Historic District.

The proposal under consideration involves the removal of a marker installed by the Cayuga Chapter of the Daughters of the American Revolution (DAR) to commemorate Ithaca’s “First White Settlers” in 1933. The marker consists of a bronze plaque mounted to a stone boulder. The text upon the plaque reads: The First White Settlers in Ithaca Were Revolutionary Soldiers Jonathan Woodworth and Robert McDowell in 1788; Cabin Sites Near This Marker. The intent of the proposal is to remove this marker, which presents incorrect and culturally insensitive information.

The marker was installed outside the DeWitt Park Historic District’s period of significance and, therefore, does not possess historic materials or features that are subject to protection under the Principles enumerated in Section 228-5 of the Municipal Code or the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. However, the marker does have value as a representative of its historic context, the flawed perspectives of previous generations, and Ithaca’s growth in cultural sensitivity in the decades following its installation. Installed by the DAR in 1933, the marker reflects the organization’s focus on Americanization and the promotion of an idealized version of American history, a history that often marginalized the experiences of indigenous peoples, African Americans, formerly enslaved individuals, and women. As our community became more socially and culturally aware in the decades after its installation, the marker has become a local symbol of exclusion, oppression, and injustice. Its proposed removal represents the community’s acknowledgement of and reconciliation with this historic legacy.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.
Standard #2  The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9  New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

As a non-contributing element, the ILPC’s evaluation of the proposed removal is limited to the assessment of the impact of the proposed work on adjacent historic structures and on the DeWitt Park Historic District as a whole, with the guiding principle being that the proposed work must not negatively impact the historic aesthetic quality of neighborhood.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the removal of the marker [will/will not] remove distinctive materials and [will/will not] alter features and spaces that characterize the DeWitt Park Historic District.

RESOLVED, that, based on findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of DeWitt Park and the DeWitt Park Historic District as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) the criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following condition(s):

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 1

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner's representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff, any deviation from the approved plans, including, but not limited to, changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses may result in the issuance by the building department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bdmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 08/28/20  Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): N/A

Applicant’s Name: City of Ithaca  Phone: 274-6550

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): bdmccracken@cityofithaca.org

Property Address: DeWitt Park

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): First Presbyterian Church

Owner’s Mailing Address: 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
- New Construction
- Addition
- Accessory Structure
- ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- Signage
- Demolition
- ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer's data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):
The applicant proposes removing a stone and bronze monument located in the northwest corner of DeWitt Park. Installed by the Cayuga Chapter of the Daughters of the American Revolutionary in 1933, the monument is a large stone boulder with a bronze plaque mounted to its face. The plaque reads: The First White Settlers in Ithaca Were Revolutionary Soldiers Jonathan Woodworth and Robert McDowell in 1788; Cabin Sites Near This Marker. The monument will be gifted to the Tompkins Center of Historic and Culture for inclusion in their permanent collection.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):
The applicant wishes to remove the monument for two reasons: the individuals noted on the plaque may not be the first settlers of European descent in the area, and the monument insensitively ignores the Gayogoh:ñö people's claims to and occupancy of the lands that became the City of Ithaca during this "settlement" period. The plaque notes Jonathan Woodorth and Robert McDowell as the first "White" settlers in the area, however, this statement cannot be validated through historical research. In fact, most historical records indicate that the Yaple, Dumond, and Hinepaw families were the first non-indigenous inhabitants of the area that would become the City of Ithaca.

The lands of the Gayogoh:ñö (Cayuga Nation), a member of the six-nation Haudenosaunee ("People of the Longhouse"), were located roughly within the watershed of Cayuga Lake and included the present day City of Ithaca. Like the other native tribes in the Central New York region, the Gayogoh:ñö were driven out of the area during the Revolutionary War period. At the conclusion of the war, New York State began negotiations with members of the Gayogoh:ñö remaining in the area to attain formal title to their lands. The tribe signed the Treaty of Albany on February 25, 1789 and ceded most of its traditional lands in and around Cayuga Lake to the government, opening up the area to European settlers. The legality of this treaty is still disputed today. The tribe’s remaining lands, a 100 square mile reservation on the north end of Cayuga Lake, were sold to the State of New York in 1895.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

- photographs of existing conditions
- site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
- drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
- description of design details and materials to be used
- samples of proposed materials
- scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
- historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
- statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
- other (specify): ____________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ____________________________ Date: ____________

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ________________
Staff Review: □ yes □ no Approved: □ yes □ no Referred to ILPC: □ yes □ no
ILPC Review: □ yes □ no
Date of Public Hearing: ____________
September 1, 2020

To the ILPC,

There is a monument in Dewitt Park, dedicated in 1933 by the Daughters of the American Revolution (DAR), a stone mounted with a plaque that purports to recognize the first two white settlers in Ithaca. This monument is of questionable historic accuracy at its root; but more importantly, in choosing to recognize two white men, it sends the intentional message that this land belongs to white people. Its purpose is to exclude the Indigenous people who were the stewards of this land, and Black people and people of color who have long been members of this community.

I have received many complaints from residents of Ithaca regarding the offensiveness of this monument and the exclusionary message it sends. It is time to elevate and amplify a more accurate and inclusive history of Ithaca.

Because Dewitt Park is part of the Dewitt Historic District, I am hereby requesting a certificate of appropriateness from the ILPC for the removal of the DAR monument, which the City will donate to The History Center for their permanent collection.

And then we can get to work to highlight a more accurate and inclusive history of this place.

Sincerely,

+[Signature]

Svante L Myrick

“An Equal Opportunity Employer with a commitment to workforce diversification.”
DeWitt Park Historic District

DeWitt Park was known as the Public Square until 1869.

STREET AND NUMBER:

CITY OR TOWN:

STATE:

Code: 36

COUNTY:

Code: 109

CLASSIFICATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>OWNERSHIP</th>
<th>STATUS</th>
<th>ACCESSIBLE TO THE PUBLIC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>District</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Object</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Acquisition</td>
<td>In Process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Being Considered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occupied</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unoccupied</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Preservation work in progress</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Occupied</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unoccupied</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unrestricted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PRESENT USE (Check One or More as Appropriate)

- Agricultural
- Commercial
- Educational
- Entertainment
- Government
- Industrial
- Military
- Museum
- Park
- Private Residence
- Religious
- Scientific
- Transportation
- Other (Specify)
- Comments
- Yes: Restricted
- Unrestricted
- No

OWNER OF PROPERTY

OWNER'S NAME: Various

STREET AND NUMBER:

CITY OR TOWN:

STATE:

Code: 36

LOCATION OF LEGAL DESCRIPTION

COURTHOUSE, REGISTRY OF DEEDS, ETC:

Tompkins County Court House

STREET AND NUMBER:

320 North Tioga Street

CITY OR TOWN:

Ithaca

STATE:

New York

Code: 36

REPRESENTATION IN EXISTING SURVEYS

TITLE OF SURVEY:

See attached sheet

DATE OF SURVEY:

Federal

State

County

Local

DEPOSITORY FOR SURVEY RECORDS:

Tompkins County Court House

STREET AND NUMBER:

320 North Tioga Street

CITY OR TOWN:

Ithaca

STATE:

New York

Code: 36

*All exteriors are accessible to the public; however, the interiors of many private houses are not.
The DeWitt Park Historic District comprises the city block in which the park is located and portions of the surrounding blocks, with structures fronting on North Cayuga Street, East and West Court Street, North Tioga Street, and East and West Buffalo Street. The area also includes two houses that face eastward onto Sears Street which runs parallel to and midway between Cayuga and Tioga Streets.

The park itself involves about one-third of its block and is bounded by North Cayuga and East Buffalo as well as by public buildings to the north and east.

The southern boundary of DeWitt Park and its environs is located one block north of East State Street, a major commercial street in Ithaca. This location has permitted the area to become one of mixed use, involving governmental, educational, professional, religious, and residential functions, all of which coexist harmoniously and serve to enrich the city visually, culturally, and economically.

The architecture is predominantly 19th and early 20th century eclectic; however, the Public Library and Ithaca Savings and Loan Association are two noteworthy contemporary buildings carefully designed to contribute to the existing environment. Particularly along the east side of North Tioga Street many private residences have been converted to professional offices with great sensitivity regarding the existing exteriors, often involving little more than repainting and selection of a suitable sign identifying the building's new use.
The DeWitt Park historic district constitutes an environment of visual richness, architectural variety, and urban unit that greatly enhances the character of Ithaca's downtown area. It also serves as an effective example of planning within a pre-existing framework in terms of new architectural additions and adaptive uses.

The district is a focal point for cultural, social, educational, political, and religious functions, a handsome setting for the ongoing activities of the community which enters the lives of those who work and live in the area as well as those who only occasionally use it.

Historically the park dates back to the early days of Ithaca and was known as the Public Square. Forming part of its north boundary is the old Tompkins County Court House, the "oldest surviving court house of the Gothic Revival period in the state of New York and the oldest public building in Tompkins County," according to Bullock. (This building was nominated for the National Register July 24, 1970.)

The "Bank of Newburgh," 106 East Court Street, built in the 1820's, served as an early bank for the town of Ithaca and then as the home of one of its prominent bankers. Boardman House is also associated with an illustrious resident, Douglas Boardman, first dean of the Cornell Law School. This building too, has been nominated for the Register.

Architecturally prominent are the DeWitt Junior High School, built in 1912 by William Henry Miller, Ithaca's prominent architect; the Old Court House; and the Williams-Fisher House, 306 North Cayuga, a sensitively designed turn-of-the-century eclectic residence.

The area as a whole constitutes an integral part of Ithaca's history, having been developed by the town's founder, Simeon DeWitt, in the early 1800's, and is significant, as well for its architectural character.
See attached sheet.

### 10. GEOGRAPHICAL DATA

**Latitude and Longitude Coordinates Defining a Rectangle Locating the Property**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corner</th>
<th>Latitude</th>
<th>Longitude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NW</td>
<td>42° 26' 35&quot;</td>
<td>76° 30' 0&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NE</td>
<td>42° 26' 35&quot;</td>
<td>76° 29' 48&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>42° 26' 25&quot;</td>
<td>76° 29' 48&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW</td>
<td>42° 26' 25&quot;</td>
<td>76° 30' 0&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Approximate Acreage of Nominated Property:** 18 acres approximately

**List All States and Counties for Properties Overlapping State or County Boundaries**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>County</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 11. FORM PREPARED BY

**Name and Title:** Margaret Marriott

**Organization:** Historic Ithaca and Tompkins County, Inc.

**Street and Number:** Box 151, Ithaca

**State:** New York, Code 36

### 12. STATE LIASON OFFICER CERTIFICATION

As the designated State Liaison Officer for the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 (Public Law 89-665), I hereby nominate this property for inclusion in the National Register and certify that it has been evaluated according to the criteria and procedures set forth by the National Park Service. The recommended level of significance of this nomination is:

- National [ ]
- State [x]
- Local [ ]

**Name:** Chairman, N.Y.S. Historic Trust

**Date:** 13 VIII 71

### NATIONAL REGISTER VERIFICATION

I hereby certify that this property is included in the National Register.

**Name:** Chief, Office of Archeology and Historic Preservation

**Date:** 10/26/71

**Attest:** Keeper of The National Register

**Date:**
6. Representation in existing surveys:

   By Simeon DeWitt.

b. New Topographical Atlas of Tompkins County, New York, 1866,
   published by Stone and Stewart, Philadelphia, 1866. This
   atlas includes a map of Ithaca on pp. 42-43, in which
   the present DeWitt Park is listed as the "Public Square."
   The Presbyterian, Baptist, and Episcopal churches and
   Second Tompkins County Court House and also listed on this
   map.

c. Map of the Corporation of Ithaca. Surveys taken by J. F.
   Bradley, Civil Engineer and Surveyor, 1868.

DeWitt Park and many of the buildings in this district were
included in the Historic Ithaca Field Inventory. They were
recorded in 1868. The information is deposited with:

Historic Ithaca
Box 151
Ithaca, New York 14850

9. Major Bibliographical References

Ahlfeld, John Roger. The First Century of the Physical
Development of Ithaca, New York. Unpublished Master's

Bullock, Orin M., Jr. Evaluation and Restoration Feasibility
Study of the Old Court House... Ithaca, New York, 1970.

DeWitt Park Open House brochure, October 25, 1970. Sponsored
by Historic Ithaca.

Ruffner, Clifford, H., Jr. Study of Greek Revival Architecture
in the Seneca and Cayuga Lake Regions. Unpublished thesis
Cornell University, 1939.

Selkreg, John H., Ed. Landmarks of Tompkins County, New York.

Smith, Ralph C. Speech before the Annual Meeting of
Historic Ithaca on February 13, 1969.
9. Major Bibliographical References (Continued)

Historic Ithaca Field Inventory, survey on the DeWitt Park area by Gary L. Menges, April 1968.

Tompkins County Division of Assessment records, Court House, Ithaca, New York.
DeWitt Park and Buildings Immediately Adjacent

DeWitt Park. The oldest and most important open space in Ithaca. It is bounded on the north and east by two churches, the Old Court House, the Ithaca College Theater building and the Boardman House. Within the park are three memorials—World War I and II Honor Rolls defining the park's center and a monument just south of the Presbyterian Church honoring the Oregon Mission of 1834 bearing the inscription which begins, "The Oregon Mission sent out by First Presbyterian Church of Ithaca in 1834 in response to search of Nez Perce Indians for white man's book from Heaven...."

DeWitt Park serves as a center for religious, political and cultural activities and as a restful urban green space for all who care to use it.

First Presbyterian Church. A massive stone structure with double apses in the Romanesque style built in 1900. It was designed by J. Cleveland Cady, architect of the Old Metropolitan Opera House in New York City, and is the third Presbyterian Church on the site.

The interior is distinguished by a broad, coffered barrel vault resting on polished yellow marble columns with Byzantine capitals. Light streaming through the stained glass aisle windows gives the interior a serene, spacious quality; the windows in the western apse are Pre-Raphaelite in design.
The Old Court House or Second Tompkins County Court House.

Stands at the northeast corner of the park near the Presbyterian Church and First Baptist Church. Designed by John F. Maurice and completed in 1854, it manifests the simple, restrained lines of the early Gothic Revival style. This is the second court house, replacing an earlier Greek Revival building, and was itself replaced in function by the present court house constructed in 1932. Land for the structure was given by Simeon DeWitt—the deed for it is the first one recorded in Tompkins County.

The Old Court House now contains county offices and the DeWitt Historical Society Museum. More complete information can be gained from its National Register nomination form of July 24, 1970.

The building is of brick, covered with smooth plaster and later covered with stucco, probably in the 1920's. The courtroom, which is on the second floor, originally extended to the ceiling and still bears its original hammer beams which were covered over when a new ceiling was installed to conserve heat; other renovations were made in 1894 by William Henry Miller, in the neo-colonial style.

First Baptist Church. Designed by William Henry Miller and built in 1890, this is a massive rusticated Romanesque style stone structure. The exterior is marked by heavy wood doors with iron hinges and a tall chime tower with battered and rounded southwest corner.

The wooden ceiling of the interior is like an inverted ship's hull, resembling the vault of the nearby Episcopal Church.
MEMORANDUM

From: Bryan McCracken, Secretary, Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission  
To: Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission  
Date: September 9, 2020  
Subject: 430 West State/MLK Jr. Street Redevelopment Proposal – Advisory Involvement

The purpose of this memo is to provide background information on the materials that follow. In 2013, the City of Ithaca Common Council considered up-zoning portions Seneca, State, and Green Streets to allow for increased density in the heart of the City. As part of the planning process for this proposed zoning change, the study area was surveyed to identify properties and resources that may possess architectural or historical value. A report titled “Historic Resources in the area of downtown Ithaca proposed for rezoning” was prepared by City Historian Mary Tomlan and was submitted to the ILPC and Common Council for review and consideration. This report, which identifies 27 properties of historic value, resulted in the intensive level survey of seven properties on West State and South Albany Streets that would later be designated in the Downtown West Historic District. It has also resulted in the intensive-level study of at least five other individual resources and may result in the expansion of the National Register-listed Ithaca Downtown Historic District or individual nominations. A copy of Tomlan’s report is attached for your reference.

430 West State/MLK Jr. Street, known today as the Mama Goose building, was among the architectural resources identified in Tomlan’s report. According to the report, it is a three-story brick building that likely dates from the last third of the nineteenth century based on the brick work and detailing of the upper stories. This building has a strong architectural presence, contributes to the overall character of the neighborhood and reflects the expansion of Ithaca’s commercial core along West State Street during the late-19th and early-20th centuries. Intensive-level research on the history of the building has not yet been completed.

The Planning and Development Board is currently reviewing a proposal to redevelop this property that includes the retention of the historic west and east facades of the building. This project will have a significant impact on this potentially historic resource, and as such, the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission has been given the opportunity to comment on the proposal. A project narrative and renderings of the proposed building are attached for review and consideration by the Commission. The full catalogue of project materials can be found at the following link:  
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1186
Historic Resources in the areas of downtown Ithaca proposed for rezoning
compiled by Mary Tomlan, City Historian, February 3, 2013

The following report is provided as a response to the proposed rezoning of areas of downtown Ithaca, as presented at the Planning & Development Board meeting on December 18, 2012, and at the Planning & Economic Development Committee meeting on January 9, 2013. At its core are the results of an elementary “windshield” survey of historic resources that are within the areas proposed for rezoning and are neither designated landmarks nor within designated historic districts.

All buildings have been considered with respect to their historical associations, their architectural design and stylistic character, and the integrity of their fabric, and have been generally evaluated within the contexts of their immediate settings, their location to the east or west of the Ithaca Commons and their roles in the story of the greater community. While a modicum of research has been undertaken, there have been no detailed investigations of primary sources (e.g., deeds, archival materials), and assessments have largely drawn on the surveyor-author’s background knowledge of local and architectural history. Every effort has been made to present a balanced report, in spite of the varying degrees of historical information included.

The survey conducted under the above-stated conditions has identified twenty-seven (27) properties in the areas to the east and west of the Ithaca Commons as noteworthy historic resources. In addition, fourteen (14) properties in the same areas have been noted as “supporting cast,” whose roles vary from contributing to the general character of an area in combination with more noteworthy structures, to marking a site that is worthy of note but without particular historic integrity of fabric, or to being contributing modern statements of urban design.

Most, if not all, of the 27 buildings identified as noteworthy have been altered in some manner and to varying degrees, whether by new siding, replacement windows or storefront, a modern addition, or the removal of a balustrade or a porch. In all cases, it has been determined that a substantial proportion of the original fabric remains so that the historic character may be understood if not also appreciated.

Some general comments may be made about the 27 buildings listed below. None represents a style earlier than the Italianate and none appear to have been constructed prior to the 1860s. That there was earlier development can be understood from several sources—historic maps (e.g., 1851), photographic records (e.g., the 1954 assessment records) and the physical record of extant buildings of poor condition and greatly compromised integrity (e.g., Greek Revival-style structures on West Green Street and on West State Street, the former having a proportionally deep entablature and the latter being of substantial size).

The area to the west of the Commons includes a number of dwellings that can be identified as Italianate in style, whether with brackets, window caps or a Florentine window applied to a gable-roofed form more typical of the Greek Revival, or whether of
more traditional hip-roofed Italianate form. There are a number of former residences that exhibit various later nineteenth-century styles, including those that might be considered examples of the Eastlake or Queen Anne modes, their detailing reflecting the use of woodworking machinery in the production of porch supports or gable screens, and their composition displaying a picturesque asymmetry. Some dwellings of the early twentieth century display Classical Revival elements while others have more simplified Craftsman forms. Most of the residential structures noted here have been appropriated for commercial use, whether for offices, with minimal exterior intervention, or for retail or service functions, with an addition at the side or on the front of the original building.

Most of the noteworthy commercial or industrial buildings reflect two general periods of construction. There are several that date from the 1870s or 1880s; constructed of brick, most display the use of that material for detailing such as window caps and cornices, some with elaborate examples of corbelling. Several buildings erected for commercial or industrial use date from the first quarter of the twentieth century, and display varied but equally characteristic forms. There is one service station, its historical stylistic reference possibly dating to its construction in 1940. The list of noteworthy structures includes individual examples of religious, governmental, and fraternal use.

Some of the buildings deemed noteworthy were erected to serve the broader Ithaca community, such as the telephone exchange, the Catholic Church and the buildings erected by the Elks and Eagles fraternal organizations. Others were location-oriented, such as the No. 5 fire station, two drugstores, and dwellings for persons whose businesses were either in the west end or in the central business district.

The buildings identified in this list of noteworthy historic resources include those reported to have been the work of a number of noted local architects or firms—A. B. Dale, A. B. Wood, John M. Wilgus, Clinton L. Vivian, Vivian & Gibb, Arthur N. Gibb, and Gibb & Waltz—as well as an Auburn architect named John Alnutt.
East of the Ithaca Commons:

101-107 N. Aurora through 304 E. State/MLK Jr. Streets

This group of nineteenth and early twentieth century commercial buildings is anchored by the corner Wanzer Block, of 1905, designed by local architect Arthur N. Gibb as a link between the adjacent buildings on North Aurora and East State/MLK Jr. Streets.

314-320 E. State/MLK Jr. Street

The Carey Building was erected in 1926-27 immediately east of the entrance to the Strand Theater and in front of the theater proper, with four commercial spaces on the ground floor and offices above. It was designed by Edgar D. Townsley of the Driscoll Brothers & Company construction firm, its Tudor Renaissance style adopted to blend with that of the theater, which had been built about ten years earlier. The building was initially identified with the H. A. Carey Company, an insurance firm, and is now popularly associated with Mayers, which has occupied space on the ground story since the latter 1960s. The building retains the earlier window enframements, glazing, and decorative stone panel bearing its name.
The building that currently serves as home to the Community School of Music and Arts was erected in 1928-30 by the Ithaca Aerie No. 1253, Fraternal Order of Eagles. As designed by architect Arthur N. Gibb, it contained bowling alleys in the basement, various social and meeting rooms as well as an auditorium on the upper floors, and a roof garden (since enclosed), with commercial rental space on the ground story. In the decades since 1956, when the Eagles placed the building on the market, it has served as a City Hall Annex, the T. G. Miller’s Sons Paper Company, and the Unicorn nightclub. Its primary façade combines intricate decorative detailing with simple forms and plain surfaces.

Supporting cast:

121 N. Aurora Street

Though perhaps more suburban than urban in character, the one-story structure erected in 1969 for the home furnishings store, Contemporary Trends, conveys a message of thoughtful design through its creative use of a limited palette of materials and forms.

306-308 E. State/MLK Jr. Street

The Roy H. Park Building dates from 1991, and replaced its predecessor on the site, the White Studio Building of 1916, and the building at 105-107 North Aurora Street, both of which were destroyed by fire in early 1989. Designed by the firm of HOLT Architects, with Robert O’Brien the principal-in-charge, the Park Building presents an East State Street façade that is compatible with the Wanzer Block on the corner while extending behind that building to the earlier façade of the Aurora Street block.
West of the Ithaca Commons:

113 N. Geneva Street

The large, towered edifice of Ohio sandstone housing the Church of the Immaculate Conception has served the Roman Catholic community in Ithaca since its construction in 1896-98. As designed by architect A. B. Wood, the church’s presence at the corner of Geneva and Seneca Streets is marked by its primary tower and steeple, while the three Gothic-arched entrances, circular gable window and subordinate tower complete the image of a traditional religious structure.

110 S. Geneva Street

Though the mid-1950s addition of a modern-style entrance wing and the removal of a balustrade atop its broad front porch have compromised the integrity of this former residence, the elegance of its original Colonial Revival design remains, conveyed by its basic symmetry and such classical details as the large Palladian window on the north façade, the corner pilasters and the relief decoration on some of its window surrounds. Erected in 1899 for insurance agent Daniel E. Marsh from plans by the local architectural firm of Vivian & Gibb, it was later purchased by the Herson family and has served the Herson Funeral Home since the mid-1930s.
108 S. Albany Street

This substantial two-and-a-half-story brick dwelling was reportedly designed by Auburn architect John Alnutt, and was constructed in 1899 for Lehigh Valley Railroad conductor William Carey. Noteworthy details include the stone lintels and a decoratively shingled front gable. An earlier second-story front porch has been removed, though a doorway remains at that level. Past uses of the house include a funeral home and a tourist home.

110 S. Albany Street

This large frame residence was erected in 1888 for dry goods merchant Francis M. Bush from plans by local architect John M. Wilgus. It is noteworthy for its picturesque composition employing shingled and clapboard siding and for its multiple porches (including one at the third-story level), at least one of which may have been added in an 1899 remodeling by its successive owner, Charles M. Williams. The building has more recently seen office use, and currently serves as home to Taitem Engineering, which firm has installed a significant array of solar panels on the south roof slope.
112 N. Plain Street

This one-and-a-half-story frame house combines Italianate detailing with a gabled-roofed form typical of Greek Revival dwellings. Its distinguishing characteristics are its Florentine-style front gable window and broad, bracketed eaves. The porch that wraps around the northeast corner of the house seems to be a later addition. Further research is necessary to clarify specifics regarding the history of the house.

110-112 S. Plain Street

This double house was erected in 1890 by local contractor Jacob Peters, who occupied one of the units for most of the decade. The house is distinctive in design, with a mansard-roofed main block and a steeply roofed second-story central bay supported by substantial brackets that terminate in gargoyles. While Sanborn maps indicate that the house was of frame construction with a masonry veneer, the history of the stone facing on the first story is not known. Peters, who had received some architectural training in his native Switzerland, would construct another distinctive dwelling for himself in 1899, located at 327 South Geneva Street.
406 W. Green Street

This hip-roofed Italianate house, long associated with members of the Reed family, was substantially rehabilitated by Ithaca Neighborhood Housing Services in the 1980s.

121 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

The one-story building on a tall basement was erected in 1901-2 for the New York & Pennsylvania Telephone Company. Designed by architect Clinton L. Vivian, its façade of tan pressed brick is accented by a shallow entrance portico and by a blind colonnade (with pilasters) just below the cornice. Metal fire doors were installed to protect the side windows and interior equipment, given the closeness of the structure to the west; their housings are extant above the windows.
136 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

The façade of this narrow, two-story brick building reflects its original construction for the Torrent Hose Company No. 5, with a single doorway and a broad opening for fire apparatus (though neither door is original). Originally constructed in 1882 from plans by local architect A. B. Wood, it received a rear addition and a new façade in 1916. The structure was sold by the City in 1993 and was remodeled to serve for a time as the Firehouse Theatre.

138-140 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

Although its window and cornice detailing is relatively plain, and its State Street storefronts and side façade have been altered, the sizeable three-story Crozier Block marks what was generally the western end of the most concentrated portion of the downtown commercial district. It was erected in 1886, reportedly from plans by architects Dale & Wilgus, for Richard Crozier, whose home was across Geneva Street to the west and whose grocery store was a block to the east on the opposite side of State Street.
The construction of the building for the Ithaca Lodge No. 636, B.P.O.E. in 1915-16 marked a significant step among fraternal organizations, which had generally been housed in the upper stories of downtown commercial blocks. Termed “the Elks Home” in the perspective view of the design by the architectural firm of Gibb & Waltz, the building included meeting rooms, an expansive porch and a roof garden. Its dark brick walls are accented by a combination of classical and rustic elements. The building has been home to the Cornell Daily Sun since 2003.

The large house was erected as the home and office of physician and surgeon Hardy T. Rhodes in 1903, designed by architect Arthur N. Gibb. The simple hip-roofed rectangular form of the house and disciplined use of materials are given interest by the tall, asymmetrically placed chimney, the entrance porch with its segmental arched pediment and similarly roofed vestibule, varied window groupings, and strong first-story cornice. Its hip-roofed garage, compatible in style, was added in 1908.
310 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

This frame house was erected in 1880 for J. W. Tibbetts, whose Forest City Mixed Paint works were located several blocks to the west at the corner of Meadow Street. The design, reportedly by local architect A. B. Wood, features pierced gable screens and highly articulated porch posts. The large brick carriage barn with its metal roof shingles is also noteworthy.

314 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

This sizable frame dwelling is noteworthy for its somewhat “sculpted” form, with its broad roof sweeping over the expansive corner porch and bearing a low, eyebrow dormer window, and with portions of the second story on the front and east sides bracketed over angled portions of the first story. The house, designed by local architect A. B. Wood, was erected in 1885-86 for DeForest Williams, then superintendent of the Ithaca Glass works. It has more recently served as the home of Planned Parenthood.
317 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

In spite of its later siding, the house erected in 1892 for boot and shoe merchant Charles M. Stanley from plans by local architect A. B. Dale apparently retains much of its original character, with its first and second story porches, gable detailing, decorative iron roof cresting on ridge. The steeply roofed bay at southeast corner may have been the addition reported to have been made in 1895.

402 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

This simple rectangular building, with its dark orange-red tapestry brick walls and tile roof, was constructed in 1912 as a pharmacy for druggist Eugene A. Putney, whose upstairs residence was accessed from a side entrance on North Plain Street. Putney’s pharmacy would remain in operation here until about 1940; the following occupant, the Hart Pharmacy, continued at this location until the later 1970s.
412 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

Though altered with a Colonial Revival front porch and asbestos siding, this frame house displays several classic characteristics of the Italianate style, its broad eaves bearing dentil trim and being supported by elaborate scrolled brackets with pendants.

430 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

This three-story brick building likely dates from the last third of the nineteenth century, based on the brickwork of its window caps and the bracket-like corbelling of its cornice. Specifics of the building’s history have not be ascertained, but in the late nineteenth century a portion of the ground story is known to have accommodated retail use while a larger proportion of the building served various functions for the Williams Bros. Foundry that occupied a substantial area to the east. The building saw various additions and other changes c.1965-70 to serve Bishop’s.
502 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

Though its State Street storefront has apparently gone through several remodelings, the corbelled brickwork of the cornice and upper-story window caps, as well as the iron tie-rod ends remain as characteristic of commercial buildings of the 1870s. The building served about twelve years as George E. Putney’s drugstore, beginning in 1877.

514-516 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

This tall, narrow brick structure was erected in 1874 for the Atwood Bros. fruit drying business, the “A” near the cornice witnessing to this history. Inside were two evaporators, each reportedly holding 65 trays above a furnace for the drying of fruit, particularly apples. Operation of this use seems to have ended by the late 1880s.
The substantial double house at the southeast corner of Plain Street was erected in 1893 for Dr. J. W. Brown House, who occupied the side. Its composition centers the two entrances within a single broad arched recess, with a second-story roofed balcony above.

The Seneca Esso Service Station opened in September 1940, and continued to serve this use until the mid-1970s. Though further specifics of the building’s history and design have not been ascertained, it remains noteworthy as one of few stations in Ithaca that date from the first half of the twentieth century.
407 W. Seneca Street

This frame building was erected in 1923 by Ithaca Bottling Works, whose name may still be seen painted on the east side of the building. This business continued until 1974, though during that period it changed from the manufacture of various sodas to the distribution of beverages. In more recent times it served as the location of the store, 15 Steps, and it is currently home to the firm of CSP Management.

515 W. Seneca Street

This frame residence with reserved classical detailing was erected in 1894-95 for George J. Dixon, whose Dixon & Robinson lumber and coal business was located farther west on Seneca Street.
Supporting cast:

107 S. Albany Street
109 S. Albany Street

These houses, which likely date from the 1910s, are simpler in form and/or detailing than those opposite at 108 and 110 S. Albany Street, but their similar scale and presence of front gables helps to create a harmonious mid-block grouping. Though all four buildings currently serve non-commercial uses, they retain substantial residential character.

107-109 S. Plain Street

The light tan brick of this residential building was a material choice consistent with its likely late nineteenth century construction. The asymmetrical form of the building illustrates one means by which a double house can be given expression more akin to that of a single-family dwelling.

536 W. Green Street

Though the Greek Revival house at this address has later siding and the front addition was not designed for compatibility, this site deserves note as the home of the Forest City Lodge, Elks Club, a fraternal organization of African-Americans, since the early 1960s.
210 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

This dwelling is noted as one of few with a mansard roof extant in this area to the west of the Commons. Its integrity has been compromised with later siding and a commercial addition at the front.

307 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

Though simple in form and materials, this residential building is compatible as part of the grouping of houses near the southwest corner of State and Albany Streets, all occupying part of the earlier Titus property.

408 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

While the detailing of this former dwelling is of interest, its history has not been sorted out, as the building may have undergone several periods of alteration; if its history could be ascertained, this building might be considered compatible with houses adjacent to west.
416 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

Though a modern commercial addition has altered its street façade, the Italianate house on this lot is recognizable as a pair with the more intact example next door at 412 W. State, having the same window and eaves detailing and a two-story bay on the east side.

417 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

The tall one-story masonry structure remodeled for the Kitchen Theatre in 2010 is distinguished by its new, intersecting glazed entrance pavilion.

428 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

A State Diner was opened at this address in 1936 or 1937, a commercial history worth noting for both this location and type of dining establishment.
512 W. State/MLK Jr. Street

Though it has had a commercial addition in front, this former residence retains the familiar gable-roofed form with bracketed Italianate style eaves.

511-513 W. Seneca Street

This house may be that removed from the site of the former Post Office at Tioga and Buffalo Streets, and remodeled following its move. If this history could be confirmed, it would be worth noting this example of such a move, which was not uncommon as the central part of the city was modernized and more intensively developed.
430-444 West State Street

Project Narrative

Development Overview

Arnot Ithaca 2, LLC is proposing a five-story, mixed-use building in the heart of the West State Street Corridor. The project site is on the northeastern corner of the intersection of West State Street and Corn Street. The development will include approximately 130 units and 5,500 SF of commercial space for up to three tenants. The Owner’s intention is to develop a vibrant mixed-use urban infill project that will enhance the State Street corridor, provide the community with additional housing, and act as a much-needed catalyst for appropriate development in the West End.

This development marks a new chapter for the West State Street Corridor, we understand the importance of contextually sensitive design that facilitates a safe, vibrant future for the area and builds on its historic character. Our plans call for the demolition of the existing, bland and rapidly deteriorating buildings, however we plan to save the façade of the brick structure on the corner and incorporate this reminder of the area’s history into the new development. The new commercial frontage will face West State Street and is located directly adjacent to the State Diner. The existing surface parking along West State will be removed to facilitate a lively and safe pedestrian experience along the street. Indoor tenant amenity spaces and a small outdoor plaza will occupy the corner of Corn and West State Street. The development includes roughly 50 parking spaces (accessed from Seneca Street) in addition to secure bicycle parking and storage.

Within the last two years there have been no developments occurring within 200’ of our site. The building materials include a concrete (and/or steel) podium with 4 levels of wood construction above. As recommended by the Ithaca Green Building Policy, we plan on achieving a high level of sustainability and energy efficiency.

Existing Conditions

The property currently hosts a three-story late 19th century brick building and additional one- and two-story buildings to the east. The existing gross building area is approximately 35,000 SF primarily dedicated to retail and commercial uses. The one- and two-story buildings are deteriorating and the existing surface parking lot along West State Street creates a less than ideal pedestrian environment.

Zoning and Variances

This property straddles the CBD-52 and B-2d zones and our proposal conforms to nearly all of the requirements put forth by the City. The majority of the new structure is within CDB-52, except for a wing that extends North towards West Seneca Street and falls in the B-2d zone. The CBD-52 zone on the south side of the property has a height limit of 52’, with a requirement of a 12’ floor to floor height for the first floor and 10’ floor to floor above. We intend to seek a variance to increase our building height in the B-2d zone from 40’ to 42’ to allow our floor plates to align, which is critical to ensuring the feasibility of construction and the success of the project. Without the variance the first-floor heights would be incongruent on the ground floor, ultimately affecting floor alignment throughout the structure. We intend to comply with all other zoning requirements.
Impact on the neighborhood

The Applicant understands the importance of planning documents -- they are not only a representation of the vision set forth by the City and community, but they provide the blueprint for successful futures of our neighborhoods. We studied Ithaca’s 2015 Comprehensive Plan to understand the goals of the neighborhood to ensure that 430-444 West State Street can help to promote the City’s vision.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ithaca Comprehensive Plan</th>
<th>Goals for 430-444 West State Street</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reimagine underutilized parcels</strong></td>
<td>Redevelop a property that is currently comprised of deteriorating buildings and surface parking into a vibrant site in the heart of the West End.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Improve pedestrian facilities and bike facilities</strong></td>
<td>Improve pedestrian experience through street fronting commercial spaces, widened sidewalks and a public patio. Ensure bike parking will be available for tenants and customers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preserve character</strong></td>
<td>Maintain existing brick facade on the corner of Corn and W State Street.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Slow traffic</strong></td>
<td>Considering inclusion of a pedestrian bumpout on the corner of Corn Street to encourage reduced traffic speeds and decrease the crossing distance for pedestrians.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Improve connections to the waterfront area</strong></td>
<td>Transform the north 400 block of State Street into an inviting pedestrian corridor, thus strengthening the visual and experiential connection that links the urban core west to the waterfront.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Structural Narrative

Based on a geotechnical exploration of the subgrade soils, the foundation for 430-444 West State Street will be supported by piles. The piles are anticipated to be installed to depths of around 80 feet in order to bear on the gravel layer that exists at that elevation. The size and the quantity of the piles is yet to be determined.

The structure above the steel piles will consist of concrete pile caps and grade beams, which will support a one-way concrete slab within conditioned space and will support the concrete columns and/or bearing walls above. The column spacing shall be +/- 28 ft max. The grade beams will also support any shear walls occurring at the first floor level. The asphalt in the parking area will not be supported on the grade beams and is expected to be constructed on adequate fill. The grade beams are expected to be between 2 ft and 4 ft deep depending on the location of the grade beams and pile caps are expected to be 3 ft thick. The podium that will support the apartments above is planned to be 12” pre-cast plank w/ 3" composite topping bearing on steel or cast in place concrete beams.
PROPOSED BUILDING MATERIALS
DESIGN DEVELOPMENT
09/02/2020

1. CORRUGATED METAL PANEL I
   LOCATION: COMMON FACADE / BUILDING PERIMETER

2. CORRUGATED METAL PANEL II
   LOCATION: RECESSSED CENTER @ SOUTH FACADE / BUILDING PERIMETER

3. MODULAR BRICK
   LOCATION: COMMON FACADE / BUILDING PERIMETER

4. GLASS / GLAZING
   LOCATION: UNIT WINDOWS & STOREFRONT SYSTEMS

5. GRANITE BASE
   LOCATION: STOREFRONT BASE @ BRICK WALL

6. CAST-IN-PLACE CONCRETE BASE
   LOCATION: STOREFRONT BASE @ METAL PANEL WALL