Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)

Notice of Meeting & Agenda

The regular monthly meeting of the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission will be held at 5:30 p.m., Tuesday, June 11, 2019, in Common Council Chambers, Third Floor, City Hall, 108 E. Green Street, Ithaca, NY.

I. Public Hearings
   A. 110-12 Heights Court, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Remove Concrete Landscape Stairs Near the West Property Line.
   B. 112 Edgecliff Pl, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Install a Wood Railing Along a Landscape Stair.
   C. 115 The Knoll, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Install a Wood Monument Sign at the Southwest Corner of the Intersection of Barton Place and The Knoll and Banner Signs on Four Lampposts.

II. Public Comment on Matters of Interest

III. Old Business
   • [if any]

IV. New Business
   • Stewart Avenue Brick Paving, East Hill Historic District – Discussion

V. Approval of Minutes
   • 05.14.19

VI. Administrative Matters

VII. Adjournment

Out of consideration for the health of other individuals, please try to refrain from using perfume/cologne and other scented personal care products at City of Ithaca meetings. Thank you for your cooperation and understanding.

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 110-12 Heights Court is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated May 16, 2019, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owner Heights Court Apartments, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) three photographs documenting existing conditions, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 110-12 Heights Court, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves removing a set of concrete landscape stairs near the west property line, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on June 11, 2019, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Colonial-Revival Style building at 110-12 Heights Court was constructed as the main barn for the Edward G. Wyckoff estate in 1898 and was moved to its current location and converted into apartments in 1912.
Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the removal of the landscape stair (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,
RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
Date: **5/16/19**  Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): **38947**

Applicant's Name: **Heights Court Apartments**  Phone: **607-257-0313**

Applicant's E-Mail address (REQUIRED): **bennikimballrealestate@gmail.com**

Property Address: **110-112 Heights Court Ithaca, NY 14850**

Owner's Name (if different from Applicant): 

Owner's Mailing Address: **186 Pleasant Grove Road Ithaca, NY 14850**

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

- [ ] New Construction
- [ ] Addition
- [ ] Accessory Structure
- [ ] ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- [ ] Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- [ ] Signage
- [ ] Demolition
- [ ] ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

**Submittal Requirements**

All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

**STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:**

Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See *City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines* for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

**ILPC REVIEW:**

Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the **last Tuesday of the month**, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by *thorough* documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer's data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Removal of (1) set of concrete stairs, to left of retaining wall.

Grading of area, after removal of said stairs, to blend in with existing slope.

Area will then be seeded for grass or appropriate ground cover.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Stairs were damaged during the process of reinforcing the retaining wall. Stairs are not ancillary to the property structures.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner's representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $10.50 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18"x23":

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMccCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant's Statement:
I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☑ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ___________________________

Applicant's Signature (REQUIRED): [Signature]
Date: 5/16/19

Property Manager

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ____________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no  Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no  Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ____________
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Qty</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Permit #</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Extended Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A8020-2555</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Building Permit</td>
<td>38947</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>110-12 Heights Court</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Price $35.00

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Check #</th>
<th>Payment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5/21/2019</td>
<td>3552</td>
<td>$35.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Payment $35.00
Balance Due
Staff Notes – 110-12 Heights Ct, Cornell Heights Historic District
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission Meeting – June, 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Address:</strong> 110-12 Heights Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic Name:</strong> NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Owner:</strong> J. Michael Kimball 186 Pleasant Grove Rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Year Purchased:</strong> 1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date of Construction:</strong> 1898; 1912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Architect/Builder:</strong> Unknown/Driscoll Bros</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic District/Individual Landmark:</strong> Cornell Heights Historic District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Period of Significance:</strong> 1898-1937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Local Designation:</strong> 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>State and National Register Listings:</strong> 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Significance:</strong> Architectural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resources:</strong> Apartment Building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic Structure Inventory Form:</strong> Attached</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incentive Programs:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Local Property Tax Exemption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ State Homeowner Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ State Commercial Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Federal Commercial Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. Staff Photographs of Existing Conditions

Figure 1: Project Site - View North

Figure 2: Detail
B. Evaluation/Review Criteria and Relevant Design Guidelines Sections

Standards and Principles

**Principle #2** The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

**Standard #2** The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

**Standard #9** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

*City of Ithaca Historic District and Landmark Design Guidelines*

**Site Materials and Features** *(p.77)*
The character of a property or historic district is defined not just by its structures but by the context within which those structures exist. For that reason, work that affect the site of a locally designated historic property is subject to review and approval by the ILPC and/or its staff. This includes, but may not be limited to, repair, replacement, rehabilitation, reconstruction and alteration of hardscape features such as walks drives, fences, steps, retaining walls, site lighting, patios, and outbuildings.

**Fencing and Walls** *(p. 81)*
Fences and wall are often desired to mark a boundary or to keep people and animal either in, or out, of the enclosed space. Due to Ithaca’s topography, walls are also frequently used to manage dramatic changes in grade. Historic fences and wall are character-defining features and, as such, should be maintained. These existing features should also be used to provide guidance for the appropriate placement and appearance of any new fence or walls proposed for a designated historic site.

Fences and wall can be found in a variety of materials, styles and degrees of ornamentation. As with other site features, the degree of ornamentation should relate to that present on the primary historic structure. Historic landscaping and retaining walls abound in Ithaca’s historic district and range from simple, rustic, dry-laid stone to formal tooled stone with colored and tuck-pointed mortar.

**C. Issues and Considerations**

- Historic significance of the retaining wall and landscape stair. The landscape stair was likely installed at the same time as the adjacent concrete retaining wall. The construction date of the retaining is not known; however, cast-in-place concrete was a
material used for structural and finish applications during the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and examples of this material can be found in the foundations of other properties within district. The noted stone retaining wall on the NYS Building/Structure Inventory Form for 110-12 Heights Crt is likely a mistake;

- Visual impact of the landscape stair removal and the restoration of the slope.
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger
DATE: 05/15/87
YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y.
TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S):
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION: 110-112 Heights Court
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public
   b. private
5. PRESENT OWNER: Carles G. Arnold
6. USE: Original: barn
   Present: apartment building
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC:
   Exterior visible from public road: Yes
   Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard
   b. stone
   c. brick
   d. board and batten
   e. cobblestone
   f. shingles
   g. stucco
   other:

9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints
   b. wood frame with light members
   c. masonry load bearing walls
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other

10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent
    b. good
    c. fair
    d. deteriorated

11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site
    b. moved
    if so, when? ca. 1912
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
    See Continuation Sheet

13. MAP:
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known[X]  b. zoning[ ]  c. roads[ ]
   d. developers[ ]  e. deterioration[ ]
   f. other:
15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ]  b. carriage house[ ]  c. garage[ ]
   d. privy[ ]  e. shed[ ]  f. greenhouse[ ]
   g. shop[ ]  h. gardens[ ]
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet
16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ]  b. woodland[ ]
   c. scattered buildings[ ]
   d. densely built-up[ ]  e. commercial[ ]
   f. industrial[ ]  g. residential[X]
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet
17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet
18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE
---------
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1898
   ARCHITECT: unknown
   BUILDER: Driscoll Bros.
20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
   See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
   See Continuation Sheet
22. THEME:
   See Continuation Sheet
11. A high stone wall with full manicured shrubs above extends along the sidewalk and conceals portions of the first floor from the street. The house is surrounded to the north, east, and west by tall conifers.

15i. This house sets back on a rise above Heights Court as the street makes its descent to Highland Avenue. The building is surrounded by other modest period residences and apartments on the south, east, and west. It is one of approximately 150 buildings in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District, an early-20th century residence park and suburban development in the northeast section of the city of Ithaca.

18. This two-story apartment building is arranged on a modified U-shaped floor plan. The extreme ends of the U open onto two-story open verandas with full-length squared corner porch supports and slender Tuscan columns on wood piers. The building is surmounted by a low hipped roof with boxed eaves. There is a wide frieze wrapping around the building and egg and dart molding under the eave. The house is covered in clapboard on the first floor and coursed wood shingles on the second floor. All corners have decorative wooden pilasters (second floor). The main doorway is centered along the south facade. It features a pedimented doorhood supported by slender Tuscan columns set on wooden pedestals. The door is set in a paneled door surround. Windows are mostly double-hung sash with diamond paning in a smaller upper sash. There are also some smaller diamond paneled casement windows. There is a small centrally placed dormer on the main elevation. It is flanked by two high brick interior chimneys. There is a two-story rear wing (north facade) with two-story open porch and rear entry and a small one-story screened porch with hipped roof projecting from the west facade.

20. This apartment building was originally constructed as the main barn to the Edward G. Wyckoff estate. It was moved to its present location and converted for use as an apartment building about 1912. At the time of construction the Ithaca Daily Journal reported that the barn was 50 X 67 feet with a basement and sub-basement. The basement was to be used for a horse room and was to contain four
single stalls, four box stalls and a heating and carriage house. The sub-basement was to be used for cows. The upper part of the barn was to be designed in the Colonial style in harmony with the Wyckoff mansion and was to contain a parlor, three bedrooms, a kitchen and bathroom; the rear part being used for a hay loft.

RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 112 Edgecliff Pl is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated May 14, 2016, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owner Georg Hoffstaetter, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) a photograph of existing site features; (3) a rendering of the proposed alteration; and (4) three sheets of materials information, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building Structure Inventory Form for 112 Heights Court, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the installation of a wood guardrail along an existing set of fieldstone landscape stairs, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on June 11, 2019, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, 112 Heights Court was constructed in 1927.
Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the installation of a guardrail along a landscape stair (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2 and Standard #9, the proposed guardrail (is/is not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the
property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]

With respect to Standard #10, the guardrail (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

PLEASE PRINT OR TYPE

Date: 05/14/2019  Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): ___________________________

Applicant’s Name: Georg Hoffstaetter  Phone: 6072573190

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): ghoffsta@gmail.com

Property Address: 112 Edgecliff Place

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): same as applicant

Owner’s Mailing Address: same as property address

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☐ New Construction
☐ Addition
☐ Accessory Structure
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure
☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Signage
☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
ELECTRONIC SUBMISSIONS: You must provide electronic versions of **ALL** submitted documents. LARGE FILES: Incoming e-mails to the City must be under 10 MB in size (incl. message envelope), so either provide CD-ROM, flash/thumb drive, use a free file-sharing website, like: [www.hightail.com](http://www.hightail.com), [www.dropbox.com](http://www.dropbox.com), [www.google.com/drive](http://www.google.com/drive), etc., or split documents into smaller parts and send multiple e-mails/files to: cpyott@cityofithaca.org and/or bmccracken@cityofithaca.org

Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

A natural stone stairway following the hill to the south side of the house is to receive a railing.

The type of the railing will be mission style, as to fit to the style of the house. It will be identical to the railing that has been approved around the platform with a hot tub on the west side of the house.

The railing is to be 36 inches high. Photographs from the identical railing style around the hot tub are attached, as are examples of the building materials.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The railing is not required, as evaluated by a city inspector in conjunction with a recent renovation. But I would like to install a fence none the less to increase safety.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $10.50 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:
I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify):

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ________________________________ Date: 05/14/2019

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ________________________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ________________
Stair Parts | Model # 4191R-056-HD00L | Internet # 202088483 | 55 in. x 5 in. Unfinished Oak Box Newel

⭐⭐⭐⭐ (2) | Write a Review + | Questions & Answers (3) +
6045 16 ft. Unfinished Poplar Shoe Rail
## Property Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address:</th>
<th>112 Edgecliff Place</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Historic Name:</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner:</td>
<td>Georg Hoffstaetter  112 Edgecliff Place  Ithaca NY 14851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Purchased:</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date of Construction:</td>
<td>1927 (perhaps earlier)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architect/Builder:</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic District/Individual Landmark:</td>
<td>Cornell Heights Historic District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period of Significance:</td>
<td>1898-1937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Designation:</td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State and National Register Listings:</td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significance:</td>
<td>Architectural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources:</td>
<td>Apartment Building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic Structure Inventory Form:</td>
<td>Attached</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incentive Programs:</td>
<td>☑ Local Property Tax Exemption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☑ State Homeowner Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ State Commercial Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☐ Federal Commercial Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. Staff Photographs of Existing Conditions

Figure 1: View of Project Site from the Driveway (View West)

Figure 2: View of Project Site from Adjacent Property (View East)
B. Evaluation/Review Criteria and Relevant Design Guidelines Sections

Standards and Principles

**Principle #2** The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

**Standard #2** The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

**Standard #9** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

**Standard #10** New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

*City of Ithaca Historic District and Landmark Design Guidelines*

Site Materials and Features (p.77)
The character of a property or historic district is defined not just by its structures but by the context within which those structures exist. For that reason, work that affects the site of a locally designated historic property is subject to review and approval by the ILPC and/or its staff. This includes, but may not be limited to, repair, replacement, rehabilitation, reconstruction and alteration of hardscape features such as walks, drives, fences, steps, retaining walls, site lighting, patios, and outbuildings.

**Fencing and Walls** (p. 81)
(*The Design Guidelines do not expressly cover railing along landscape stairs. As these types of railings have many of the same properties as a fence, I’ve include the guidelines for the installation of new fences in historic districts.*)

Fences and wals are often desired to mark a boundary or to keep people and animals either in, or out, of the enclosed space. Due to Ithaca’s topography, walls are also frequently used to manage dramatic changes in grade. Historic fences and walls are character-defining features and, as such, should be maintained. These existing features should also be used to provide guidance for the appropriate placement and appearance of any new fences or walls proposed for a designated historic site.

Fences and walls can be found in a variety of materials, styles and degrees of ornamentation. As with other site features, the degree of ornamentation should relate to that present on the primary historic structure. Fence materials that may be appropriate include wood, iron, steel, or
aluminum, all of which are available in a wide variety of configurations and picket styles. Vinyl and chain link fencing are generally not appropriate as they do not adequately relate to historic materials.

The degree of transparency and the height of the fence are critical considerations. Fences must not obscure the historic resource itself or interfere with historic views or overlooks, and must not alter the rhythm and solid-to-void ratio of the landscape. For this reason the introduction of front yard fencing will generally not be considered appropriate in the absence of numerous existing examples of such fencing in a particular area and setting. The most common placement of fences in Ithaca’s historic districts is at the side or rear yards. Fencing in these locations is generally less visible to the public and varies greatly in height, material degree of ornamentation, and style, ranging from the more open picket styles in wood or metal to wood privacy fences. Even in these locations, the use of simple, traditional fencing options is the most appropriate. Landscaping can be used to soften the appearance of fencing, as well as augment the screening effect provided by more open fence styles.

C. Issues and Considerations

- The proposed guardrail is not required by the NYS Building Code;
- The compatibility of the proposed wood material and guardrail detailing with respect to the materiality and detailing of the historic property;
- The visibility of the improvement from publicly accessible locations and its impact on historic view shields, including from the Stewart Avenue bridge and other locations across the gorge;
- The reversibility of the guardrail installation.
**BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM**

NYS OFFICE OF PARKS, RECREATION & HISTORIC PRESERVATION
DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
(518) 474-4079

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger DATE: May 15, 1987

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

---

### IDENTIFICATION

1. **BUILDING NAME(S):**
2. **COUNTY:** Tompkins **TOWN/CITY:** Ithaca **VILLAGE:**
3. **STREET LOCATION:** 112 Edgecliff Place
4. **OWNERSHIP:** a. public [ ] b. private [X]
5. **PRESENT OWNER:** Jason Pettengill **ADDRESS:** same
6. **USE:** Original: residential Present: residential
7. **ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC:** Exterior visible from public road: Yes [ ] No [X]
   Interior accessible: Explain

### DESCRIPTION

8. **BUILDING MATERIAL:**
   a. clapboard [ ] b. stone [ ] c. brick [ ] d. board and batten [ ]
   e. cobblestone [ ] f. shingles [X] g. stucco [ ] other:

9. **STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:**
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints [ ]
   b. wood frame with light members [X]
   (if known)
   c. masonry load bearing walls [ ]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other:

10. **CONDITION:**
    a. excellent [ ] b. good [X] c. fair [ ] d. deteriorated [ ]

11. **INTEGRITY:**
    a. original site [X] b. moved [ ] if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

12. **PHOTO:**

13. **MAP:**

---

*(An Equal Opportunity Agency)*
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known □ b. zoning □ c. roads □
   d. developers □ e. deterioration □
   f. other:

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn □ b. carriage house □ c. garage □
   d. privy □ e. shed □ f. greenhouse □
   g. shop □ h. gardens □
   i. landscape features: see continuation sheet
   j. other:

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land □ b. woodland □
   c. scattered buildings □
   d. densely built-up □ e. commercial □
   f. industrial □ g. residential □
   h. other: Large fraternity house immediately to west

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation sheet

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE
19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: ca. 1927 (building appears to be older)
   ARCHITECT: unknown
   BUILDER: unknown

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE
   See continuation sheet

21. SOURCES:
   See continuation sheet

22. THEME:
112 EDGECLIFF PLACE

11.

15i. The property is not formally landscaped. Tall shade trees and conifers along the foundation of the house nearly conceal all elevations from view.

17. This building is situated on a steep sloping hillside immediately below the grade of Stewart Avenue. Edgecliff Place appears more of a private drive than a public roadway. A large apartment building and smaller private residence are located immediately east of the house and a large fraternity house is found at the foot of the hill to the west. Number 112 Edgecliff Place is one of approximately 150 buildings in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District.

18. This house is built into a hillside. It is two stories high on a full-story basement exposed to the south and west. The building is surmounted by a side-facing gabled roof with jerkin-headed gable. Open eaves with exposed rafters overhang wall surfaces. The first floor is covered in stucco and the second floor is sheathed in coursed wood shingles. Windows are varied including mostly 6/1 double-hung sash on the second floor and multi-paned banded casements on the first floor. There are also banded casements in the gables and, on the west facade, a tripartite window with multi-paned sidelights and transom. The main entrance, probably along the east elevation, is concealed behind tall shade trees and conifers.

20. This house was built for George Chamberlain, a professor at Cornell University. The Jason Pettengill family has resided here for at least the past thirty years.

21. Ithaca City Directories

22.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 115 The Knoll are located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated May 30, 2019, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by STREAM Collaborative on behalf of property owners Chesterton House, Inc., including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) six sheets of drawings illustrating the proposed alterations, dated May 30, 2019, titled Signage: Chesterton House – 115 The Knoll, and labelled A-1, A-2, A-3, A-4, and A-5, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 115 The Knoll, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the installation of a wood-constructed monument sign at the southwest corner of the intersection of Barden Place and The Knoll, and four banners mounted to four existing lampposts, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on June 11, 2019, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.
As indicated in the New York Building Structure Inventory Form, the Arts and Crafts Style residence at 115 The Knoll was designed by the locally prominent architecture firm of Gibb and Waltz and constructed between 1908 and 1909.

Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the installation of the proposed monument sign and banners (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the
property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2, and Standard #9, the proposed monument sign and banners railings (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]

With respect to Standard #10, the proposed monument sign and banners (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken  |  Ph: 607-274-6555  |  bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Please print or type

Date: 5/30/2019  Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): 38826

Applicant’s Name: STREAM Collaborative  Phone: 607.216.8802
Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): noah@streamcolab.com

Property Address: 115 The Knoll

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): Chesterton House, Inc
Owner’s Mailing Address: 118 Anabel Taylor Hall, Ithaca, NY 14853

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☐ New Construction  ☑ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Addition  ☑ Signage
☐ Accessory Structure  ☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure  ☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

Staff-Level Review:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC Review:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

Applicant proposes to install banner signs on lamp-posts along its entrance driveway and proposes placing a ground mounted monument sign on City property at the intersection of the Knoll and Barton Place. The monument sign will have an 11.25sf sign panel supported by wood posts, with the bottom of the sign panel 24" above grade to keep it above snow. (see drawing submission)

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The Knoll, which is a dead-end street, is minimally maintained by the City and looks like a private driveway. Motorists cannot see Chesterton House from Barton Place making it difficult to locate. The proposed sign is deemed necessary for wayfinding.

Banner signs are to create a sense of arrival and identity at the Chesterton House - Sophia House complex and are located on private property.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $10.50 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcrACKEN@CITYOFlTHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☑ photographs of existing conditions
☑ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☑ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☑ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): __________________________________________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ____________________________ Date: 5 2 1

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no  Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no  Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: _____________
Natural cedar posts and sign, treated with a natural sealer. Lettering and trim will be made from 1/4" black and red PVC. Note: design is to scale.

Sign layout by Hughey signs
Banner Sign Locations as seen from The Knoll

Banner Sign Locations as seen from parking area

Banner Key

PRELIMINARY
NOT FOR CONSTRUCTION
Banner Detail - “Chesterton House”

Banner Detail - tag line

BANNERS 1 & 2

Daring to discuss the important and amusing
Events

Residences

Courses

“Gratitude is happiness doubled by wonder.”

- G.K. Chesterton
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger
DATE: 05/15/87

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y. 
TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S):
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION: 115 The Knoll
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[ ]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Delta Rho
6. USE: Original: residential
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[ ] No[ ]

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL: a. clapboard[ ] b. stone[ ] c. brick[ ] d. board and batten[ ]
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM: a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]
11. CONDITION: a. excellent[ ] b. good[ ] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]
10. INTEGRITY:
   a. original site[ ] b. moved[ ] if so, when?
   c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
      See Continuation Sheet
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known[ ] b. zoning[ ] c. roads[ ]
d. developers[ ] e. deterioration[ ]
f. other:

15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ] b. carriage house[ ] c. garage[ ]
   d. privy[ ] e. shed[ ] f. greenhouse[ ]
   g. shop[ ] h. gardens[ ]
   i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet
   j. other: See Continuation Sheet

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ] b. woodland[ ]
   c. scattered buildings[ ]
   d. densely built-up[ ] e. commercial[ ]
   f. industrial[ ] g. residential[ ]
   h. other: See Continuation Sheet

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1908-1909

   ARCHITECT: Gibb & Waltz

   BUILDER: Joseph Campbell

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
   See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
   See Continuation Sheet

22. THEME:
   See Continuation Sheet
11.

15i. A large parking area occupies the property immediately in front of the house. There is no formal landscaping but tall conifers surround the house to the north and south.

15j.

16h.

17. This building is located on a high knoll at the southwest corner of the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District. The house has a direct line of site to the south end of Cayuga Lake and the valley stretching southward. The building is set back from any public road but is accessible from a short drive off Barton Place. There are four other major buildings (some architect designed) scattered atop The Knoll.

18. This two and one-half story Arts and Crafts residence features a red tile gabled roof with flared eaves and exposed roof rafters overhanging wall surfaces. A two-story wing (later compatible addition) projects southward from the main facade. A cross gable intersects the main house at the north end of the main (east) facade. A red tile pent roof encloses the gable here and also the gable on the north elevation. The house is constructed of rough-cut, random-coursed stone on the first floor and is covered in stucco on upper floors. There is contrasting wood trim with false exposed floor beams between first and second floors. A large, one and one-half story gabled wall dormer with Tudor false half-timbering overhangs the main entrance. It rests on heavy paired wood brackets. The doorway is simple and is flanked by two, high recessed single pane windows with stone sills. All other first floor windows also have windows with stone sills as well as splayed stone lintels and feature mostly single, paired, and banded 1/1 double-hung sash. The two-story south wing has ribbons of casement windows on first and second floors. Upper floor windows elsewhere include 4/1, 6/1, and 8/1 double-hung windows or single and multi-pane casements or pivot windows. A small shed dormer is sandwiched between the wall dormer and cross gable of the main facade. There is a one-story side entry porch at the north end of the main facade. It has a flat roof with extended rafters.
This house was built for Eugene E. Haskell, former Dean of the College of Civil Engineering at Cornell University. Haskell lived here until about 1918. Subsequently the house was occupied by Cornell University sororities. Alpha Omicron Pi located here from the 1920's through the 1950's. The Delta Phi Epsilon Sorority has occupied the house since that time.

Ithaca Daily Journal, 14 July 1908; 10 October 1908; 4 December 1908; 21 September 1909; Ithaca City Directories
### Property Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Address:</strong></th>
<th>115 The Knoll</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic Name:</strong></td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Owner:</strong></td>
<td>Chesterton House, Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>118 Anabel Taylor Hall, Cornell U</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ithaca, NY 14853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Year Purchased:</strong></td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Date of Construction:</strong></td>
<td>1908-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Architect/Builder:</strong></td>
<td>Gibb and Waltz/Joseph Campbell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic District/Individual Landmark:</strong></td>
<td>Cornell Heights Historic District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Period of Significance:</strong></td>
<td>1898-1937</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Local Designation:</strong></td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>State and National Register Listings:</strong></td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Significance:</strong></td>
<td>Architectural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resources:</strong></td>
<td>Residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic Structure Inventory Form:</strong></td>
<td>Attached</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incentive Programs:</strong></td>
<td>[ ] Local Property Tax Exemption</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[ ] State Homeowner Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[ ] State Commercial Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[ ] Federal Commercial Tax Credit:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. Staff Photographs of Existing Conditions

*Figure 1: View from the South of the Intersection of Barton Pl and The Knoll*

*Figure 2: View from the North of the Intersection of Barton Pl and The Knoll*
Figure 3: View West of Lampposts

Figure 4: View East of Lampposts
B. Evaluation/Review Criteria and Relevant Design Guidelines Sections

Standards and Principles

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10 New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

City of Ithaca Historic District and Landmark Design Guidelines

Site Materials and Features (p. 77)
The character of a property or historic district is defined not just by its structures but by the context within which those structures exist. For that reason, work that affect the site of a locally designated historic property is subject to review and approval by the ILPC and/or its staff. This includes, but may not be limited to, repair, replacement, rehabilitation, reconstruction and alteration of hardscape features such as walks, drives, fences, steps, retaining walls, site lighting, patios, and outbuildings.

When considering changes to site materials and features, it is important to ensure that those changes are consistent not only with the individual historic structure itself but with the historic character of the area as a whole. The most significant features of a site typically include: parking, drives, sidewalks, and patios; fencing and walls; light; accessory structures; and signs.

Signs (p. 88)
Signs are valuable means of advertising a business and gain exposure to new customers. By relying on the architecture of a structure and its surroundings to determine the most appropriate sign sizes, locations, and materials, signs can be effectively used at historic properties without compromising either the character of the structure or area or the intent of advertising exposure.

Location (p. 89)
Freestanding signs not attached to the building may be appropriate, provided the yard is of adequate depth to avoid blocking significant architectural features of the structure or other character-defining features of the property.
Size
Once a location is proposed, a determination may be made as to the appropriate size of the sign. There is often a range of appropriate sizes. To satisfy the requirements of the Landmarks Ordinance, the size of the sign must be in keeping with the scale of the property.

Materials and Detailing (p. 90)
Once a sign's location and size have been determined, the final step is determining the appropriate materials and details. The proposed sign should complement the existing structure in its texture, material and detailing. This does not mean that the material used can only be one that is found on the structure. For instance, metal painted sign boards are common on many commercial structure and provide a flat, finished sign with a low sheen and longevity that is appropriate to many traditional architectural settings. However, a metal box sign with plastic insert and internal illumination does not fit in with the texture and materials common in historic property or districts. The details of the proposed sign should relate to the historic structure in their shape or form and degree of ornamentation. An elaborately ornamental sign, for example, would be inappropriate on a simple vernacular structure. The key is to select a material and design that complements the historic character of the structure and area while achieving the intended advertising function.

C. Issues and Considerations

- Compatibility of the proposed monument sign’s materials and detailing with the historic structure. Of particular focus is the use of black and red PVC and the detailing of the posts;
- The compatibility of the size, scale, and material of the proposed monument sign with respect to the proposed location and other landscape signs within the historic district;
- The compatibility of the number, size, and locations of the proposed banner signs;
- The reversibility of the monument and banner signs.