ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, May 19, 2020. City Hall remains closed to the public. This meeting will be conducted remotely via the online platform Zoom, pursuant to the Governor’s Executive Order 202.1. A live stream is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtJN1P_RFaFW2IVCnTrDg.

Scheduled Public Hearings

There are two options to participate in a public hearing:

1. Submit comments by email no later than 4 p.m. on the day of the meeting (contacts below), and they will be read into the record. Each comment is limited to three minutes. Indicate in your email that the comment is for a public hearing.

2. To speak at the meeting, sign up and receive instructions through the contact(s) listed below.

General Public Comments

Send written comments to the contact(s) listed below. All comments received will be forwarded to the ILPC for their consideration. Written comments received well in advance of the meeting give the Commission time to fully consider them. A minimum of 15 minutes will be allotted at the beginning of the meeting to read comments, if needed. Please indicate if you would like your comments read into the record. Each comment is limited to three minutes. The Chair will make an effort to read as many comments as time permits.

All comments and questions can be emailed to Anya Harris at aharris@cityofithaca.org or Megan Wilson at mwilson@cityofithaca.org or call (607) 274-6550.

I. PUBLIC HEARINGS
   A. 106 Highland Avenue, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Replace Second-Story Balcony Railing and Two French Doors
      Application materials are available for review at: https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1168

II. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

III. NEW BUSINESS

IV. OLD BUSINESS

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   • 04/21/20

V. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

VII. ADJOURNMENT

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 106 Highland Avenue is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated April 30, 2020 was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owner Susan Lewis, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) three photographs of the existing doors and a photo of the existing railing; (3) two contractor estimates; and (4) two photographs of the proposed railing design (located at 308 Fall Creek Drive, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 106 Highland Avenue, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves (1) the replacement of the deteriorated railing on the second-story balcony with a code-compliant wood railing and balusters; and (2) the replacement of two damaged French doors leading to the balcony with fiberglass patio doors with double-paned glass lights with interior grids, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant has provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on May 19, 2020; now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.
As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the Tudor Revival Style residence at 106 Highland Avenue was constructed between 1923-1925 for George L. Coleman, director of the University band and orchestra. The home’s one-story side wing and second-story balcony project southward from the main façade and features ribbons of multi-pane casements.

Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. When the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the replacement of the second-story balcony railing and the replacement of the two wood balcony doors (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property.

With respect to Principle #2 and Standard #6, as shown in the photographs of existing conditions, the severity of the deterioration of the wood balcony railing requires its replacement and is required by NYS Residential Code. The proposed new work (will/will not) match the old in color, texture, and material and (will/will not) be compatible with the old in design and other visual qualities.

With respect to Principle #2 and Standard #6, as shown in the photographs of existing conditions, the severity of the damage of the wood French style balcony doors (requires/does not require) their replacement. The proposed new work (will/will not) match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.

Also with respect to Principle #2, and Standard #9, the proposed wood railing (is/is not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment.

With respect to Principle #2, and Standard #9, the proposed fiberglass patio doors with double-paned class with internal grids (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment.

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0
Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmcrcrcken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

4/30/2020

Date: ______________ Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): ______________

Applicant’s Name: ___________________ Phone: 607-227-3700

Susan L. Lewis

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): sllewis@lightlink.com

Property Address: 106 Highland Ave., Ithaca, NY 14850

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): ___________________

Owner’s Mailing Address: same as above

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☐ New Construction
☐ Addition
☐ Accessory Structure
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure
☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Signage
☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.

Page 1 of 3
sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.

**Description of Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):
See Attached

**Reasons for Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):
See Attached
Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCE PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:
I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

- [ ] photographs of existing conditions
- [ ] site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
- [ ] drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
- [ ] description of design details and materials to be used
- [ ] samples of proposed materials
- [ ] scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
- [ ] historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
- [ ] statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
- [ ] other (specify): Roofing proposal from Hale Roofing; Description of replacement patio doors from Carvalho Construction

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): Susan Lewis  Date: 4/30/2020

STAFF USE ONLY:
Date Received: __________
Staff Review:  yes  no  Approved:  yes  no  Referred to ILPC:  yes  no
ILPC Review:  yes  no
Date of Public Hearing: __________
Continuation Sheet:

Description of Proposed Change:

The house has a 3-season 10 x 27 sunporch with access to the roof via french patio doors from 2 upstairs bedrooms. There is a balustrade. All the repairs are associated with the sunporch and access to it.

The flat roof over the sunporch has had on-going active leaking and is seriously deteriorated. Hale Roofing has been contracted to replace the roof, in coordination with Carvalho Construction for the carpentry required, including replacement of the deteriorated balustrade and french doors.

Reason for Change:

The flat roof of the sunporch has had ongoing active leaking and requires replacement. Hale Roofing has been contracted to do a tear-off and replacement with a new EPDM roof, coordinating with Carvalho Construction who will do the carpentry, including rebuilding the ballustrade and replacing the french patio doors. The roofing proposal with specifications will be provided to accompany the application.

The ballustrade is deteriorated with missing railings and a dislocated support post. It must be rebuilt in coordination with the reroofing. Because the current design does not meet code, a design that meets code and is appropriate for the period of the house must be decided upon and approved by the LPDC. I propose a design similar to the wood ballustrade on the sunporch of 308 Fallcreek Drive which is also a stucco home and I think is similar in period. Bryan McCracken suggested that the interior staircase gives clues to the appropriate design. The banister in my home is very simply designed with a simple square flat-topped newel post and unpainted railing with painted rectangular ballusters. Just this Tuesday I was notified that the railing system must be upgraded to code and I haven't yet had the chance to ask Lew Carvalho to revise his proposal. I know it will be much more costly in both materials and labor than replacement in-kind.

The french patio doors that lead from two bedrooms to the roof and open outward have warped over time and can not be secured or locked. As a result, strong winds can catch the doors flinging them open and against the side of the house. The door from the southeast bedroom was already damaged and during a windstorm in early winter, it was flung so violently against the side of the house that it was completely broken apart. The door from the southwest room looks good by comparison, but it is also damaged and must be tied from the inside or the wind flings it open and slams it repeatedly against the side of the house. If these doors were in sound functional condition I would not consider replacing them. Given that they do need to be replaced, I propose insulated patio doors with double-paned glass and the same multi-paned french door appearance. They would be able to be painted to match my trim. The contractor's description of the proposed doors will be provided to accompany the application.

Pictures of the conditions described will be provided to accompany the application.
**Quote**

**Number:** E19-0000121  
**Date:** October 26, 2019

**Bill To:**  
Susan Lewis  
9186 Booth Road  
Trumansburg, NY 14886 (Phone: 607-227-3700)

**Ship To:**  
Sunroom Carpentry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Tax 1</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Demolition labor &amp; materials; to remove outside handrails from balcony roof; remove 2 exterior single panel entry doors and cover with sheathing in preparation of roof replacement by others.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>398.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Framing labor; to re-frame deck over sunroom; after roofers remove roof system and wood deck, so they can finish their work.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,440.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Framing materials; dimensional lumber, joist hangers, and fasteners.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,646.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Door &amp; trim labor; to install 2 exterior pre-hung doors and trim; interior and exterior.</td>
<td></td>
<td>720.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 - ThermaTru 2 3/4”x6” Smooth Star exterior outswing fiberglass 15 lite patio doors w/ flat grids inside argon filled low E clear safety glass, double bore, 6-9/16” composite jambs and sills, exterior: Bamboo Forest; interior: Alaskan Storm; SS hardware.</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,263.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Installation materials; shims, 100% clear silicone, pvc interior casing, and fasteners.</td>
<td></td>
<td>223.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor to rebuild window sills, jambs, casing, and install 3 new windows on each end of sun porch.</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,600.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 - Andersen 400 series 3522410 AA double hung windows w/ 4 over 4 Picture grids inside high performance low E glass, insect screen, exterior: Forest Green; interior: pine hardware: Stone, &amp; 6-9/16” pine jambs @ $68.01 each.</td>
<td></td>
<td>4,098.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Installation materials; shims; 100% clear silicone, pvc exterior sill and casing, interior #1 clear pine casing and jill, and fasteners.</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,757.43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thank you for allowing us to quote your project!

"Though the job be big or small, do it right or not at all"
August 12, 2019

Susan Lewis
106 Highland Ave.
Ithaca, NY 14850

Re: New EPDM roof over the south facing flat roof area.

We propose the following scope of work:

1. Remove existing railings, roof system and the wood deck down to the joists.
2. Install ¾” CDX plywood over wood joists.
3. Mechanically Fastened Carlisle ½” HD SecurShield Insulation over the ¾” CDX plywood.
4. Install a .060 mil EPDM Fully Adhered roof system in accordance with the manufacturer’s specifications.
5. Properly flash all roof penetrations, parapet walls and tie-in to the existing building in accordance with the manufacturer printed details.
6. Install new 24 ga. edge metal the roof perimeter.
7. Leave the grounds and roof free from all debris created by this work.
8. Furnish a Hale Roofing Two Year Labor only warranty.

Cost: Thirteen Thousand Six Hundred Dollars $13,600.00

Exclusions:

- Asbestos abatement.
- Gutters and downspouts.
- Structural repairs.
- Modification to the existing two (2) doors that allow access to the roof. 
  *This is required for installation of the new roof system.*
- Repairs to fascia or soffits.
- Interior work
- Painting
- Masonry
- Reinstallation or flashing of railings.

Respectfully submitted,

Steve Hale
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger
DATE: 05/15/87

YOUR ADDRESS: 108 E. Green St., Ithaca, N.Y.
TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713

ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

IDENTIFICATION

1. BUILDING NAME(S):
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION: 106 Highland Avenue
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public[ ] b. private[ ]
5. PRESENT OWNER: Richard Lewis
6. USE: Original: residential
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes[ ] No[ ]
   Interior accessible: Explain

DESCRIPTION

8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard[ ] b. stone[ ] c. brick[ ] d. board and batten[ ]
   e. cobblestone[ ] f. shingles[ ] g. stucco[ ] other:

9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM: (if known)
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints[ ]
   b. wood frame with light members[ ]
   c. masonry load bearing walls[ ]
   d. metal (explain)
   e. other

10. CONDITION:
    a. excellent[ ] b. good[ ] c. fair[ ] d. deteriorated[ ]

11. INTEGRITY:
    a. original site[ ] b. moved[ ] if so, when?
    c. list major alterations and dates (if known):
       See Continuation Sheet

13. MAP:
THREATS TO BUILDING: a. none known[X]  b. zoning[ ]  c. roads[ ]  
d. developers[ ]  e. deterioration[ ]  
f. other:

15. RELATED OUT BUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn[ ]  b. carriage house[ ]  c. garage[ ]  
d. privy[ ]  e. shed[ ]  f. greenhouse[ ]  
g. shop[ ]  h. gardens[ ]  
i. landscape features: See Continuation Sheet  
j. other: See Continuation Sheet

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land[ ]  b. woodland[ ]  
c. scattered buildings[ ]  
d. densely built-up[ ]  e. commercial[ ]  
f. industrial[ ]  g. residential[X]  
h. other: See Continuation Sheet

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   See Continuation Sheet

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE
   (including interior features if known):
   See Continuation Sheet

SIGNIFICANCE

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1923-1925

   ARCHITECT: unknown
   BUILDER: unknown

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:
   See Continuation Sheet

21. SOURCES:
   See Continuation Sheet

22. THEME:
   See Continuation Sheet
11. The house is surrounded by tall, fully grown shade trees and conifers. There are a few foundation shrubs along the main facade and a small front lawn extending to Highland Avenue.

16h.

17. This house is situated at the southern end of Highland Avenue where it overlooks Roberts Place. There is a large Classical Revival apartment house to the north and the grounds of a large fraternity house to the east. There are a number of period homes nearby to the south along Fall Creek Drive. 106 Highland Avenue is one of approximately 150 buildings in the proposed Cornell Heights Historic District.

18. This small, two-story Tudor Revival residence has a steep pitched red tile gabled roof with front-facing gable. The roof hangs low over first floor windows along the north elevation. A one-story side wing with flat roof (balcony above) and ribbons of tall multi-pane casements projects southward from the main facade. The house is covered in stucco and a stucco chimney extends along the center wall of the main facade. A small gabled entry porch features a simple tudor arched entrance. There are square wood porch supports and wooden wainscotted benches facing inward. Windows are mostly 6/1 double-hung sash in wooden enframements. A full-height wall dormer with shed roof is located along the north facade. There is a hooded side entrance here.

19. This house was built for George L. Coleman, director of the University band, orchestra, and instrumental clubs at Cornell University. The house was subsequently occupied during the 1930's, 1940's, and 1950's by university pastors of the First Congregational Church.

21. Ithaca City Directories; Cornell University Staff Directories

22.