NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 5:30 p.m. on Tuesday, April 21, 2020. City Hall remains closed to the public. This meeting is being held pursuant to the Governor’s Executive Order 202.1.

A live stream is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtjN1P_RFaFW2IVCnTrDg. If you are a member of the public who wants to follow the meeting but do not want to make comments, please simply watch the live stream. If you are a member of the public wishing to make a comment, you should also follow the meeting via the live stream, as well as join the meeting via Zoom. (You will be placed in a waiting room until the Chair opens the public comment period.)

To join the meeting with a smartphone, tablet, or computer go to https://zoom.us/j/92673617267?pwd=b2s3WHFFS3JMOGE0UWUxYW9YZWC3Zz09
Or dial in by telephone at +1 646 558 8656 US
Meeting ID: 926 7361 7267
Password: 010679

Written comments can also be emailed to Anya Harris at aharris@cityofithaca.org or sent via USPS to Planning Division; 108 E. Green St.; Ithaca, NY 14850. Please indicate if you would like them to be read into the record. Thank you.

I. PUBLIC HEARINGS
   A. 225 Fall Creek Drive, Cornell Heights Historic District – Proposal to Replace the Driveway Paving Material, Install a Two-Car, 18- by 24-foot Parking Area on the East Side of the Existing Driveway, Install New Flagstone Walkways on the West Elevation, Install a New 16- by 28-foot Flagstone Patio on the South Elevation, and Install a 12- by 20-foot Flagstone-Paved Area on the North Elevation of the Existing Garage.

   Application and supporting materials can be found at: https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1159

II. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

III. NEW BUSINESS

IV. OLD BUSINESS

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
   • 03/19/2020

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Out of consideration for the health of other individuals, please try to refrain from using perfume/cologne and other scented personal care products at City of Ithaca meetings. Thank you for your cooperation and understanding.

If you have a disability and would like specific accommodation in order to participate, please contact the City Clerk’s Office at 274-6570 by 12:00 p.m., no later than 2 days (not including weekends and holidays) before the meeting.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 225 Fall Creek Drive is located within the Cornell Heights Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1989, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1989, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated April 3, 2020, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by property owners Reilly Coch and Flannery Hysjulien, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) a proposed site plan; and (3) four photographs documenting existing conditions, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the New York State Building Structure Inventory Form for 225 Fall Creek Drive, and the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the replacement of the existing asphalt driveway with XXX, the replacement and expansion of an existing asphalt-paved parking area with XXX, the replacement of a concrete walkway on the west elevation with stone, the installation of a new stone walkway on the west elevation, the installation of a 16- by 20-foot stone patio on the south elevation, and the replacement of the three-tab asphalt shingle roofing with XXX, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the replacement of three-tab asphalt shingle roofing with XXX architectural-style shingles has been determined to be an in-kind repair by the ILPC, and as such, was administratively approved by the Secretary of the Commission on April 8, 2020, as authorized by the City of Ithaca Landmark and Historic District Design Guidelines, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on April 21, 2020, now therefore be it
RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s Cornell Heights Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the Cornell Heights Historic District is 1898-1937.

As indicated in the New York State Building Structure Inventory Form, the Colonial-Revival Style residence at 225 Fall Creek Drive was one of several homes in the historic district designed by Cornell University professor of architecture, John T. Parsons. This house was built in 1901.

Constructed within the period of significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the Cornell Heights Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Principle #3 New construction located within an historic district shall be compatible with the historic character of the district within which it is located.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the
property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10  New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the replacement of the driveway, replacement and expansion of the parking area, replacement of a walking and the installation of another, and the installation of a patios (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (but will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

Also with respect to Principle #2, Principle #3, and Standard #9, the proposed expanded parking area, walkway and patio (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not ]

With respect to Standard #10, expanded parking area, walkway and patio (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the Cornell Heights Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 1
Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 04/03/2020  Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): (submitted 04/02/2020)

Applicant’s Name: Reilly Coch & Flannery Hysjulien  Phone: (607) 379-3746
rwoch@mac.com

Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED):

Property Address: 225 Fall Creek Drive, Ithaca, NY 14850

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): as above

Owner’s Mailing Address: as above

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

☐ New Construction  ☐ Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
☐ Addition  ☐ Signage
☐ Accessory Structure  ☐ Demolition
☐ ALTERATION: Primary Structure  ☐ ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
**Description of Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):

1. Replacement of asphalt driveway with asphalt or gravel.
2. Modification and replacement of existing parking area.
3. Replacement of concrete rear walkway with flagstone.
4. Installation of new walkway to parking area.
5. Installation of flagstone patio off gorge-facing porch.
6. Replacement of shingle roof.

**Reasons for Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):

1. The asphalt has deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced. We favor a historical look with either gravel or asphalt with Portland cement coating.
2. The existing parking area does not permit a vehicle to turn around. Given the high frequency of pedestrians on the South side of Fall Creek Drive, it is desirable to allow vehicles to turn around and exit the property in a forward direction.
3. The current walkway has severely buckled due to tree roots and must be replaced. We propose to match the new walkway with the existing flagstone leading to the front of the house.
4. It is desirable to have a direct path from the existing walkway to the new parking area.
5. The portion of the yard adjacent to the gorge has never been landscaped, as it is surrounded by hemlock trees. We propose to add a flagstone patio in this area for aesthetic reasons.
6. The existing roof has at least 2 leaks and must be replaced as soon as possible.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRAKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☐ photographs of existing conditions
☐ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☐ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☐ description of design details and materials to be used
☐ samples of proposed materials
☐ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☐ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☐ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☐ other (specify): ___________________________________________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ________________________________ Date: 4/8/20

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ______________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no  Approved: ☐ yes  ☐ no  Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes  ☐ no
ILPC Review:  ☐ yes  ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: _____________
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM
NYS OFFICE OF PARKS, RECREATION & HISTORIC PRESERVATION
DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
(518) 474-0479

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY
UNIQUE SITE NO. 10940.08/561
QUAD ______________________ SERIES ______________________
NEG. NO. ______________________

YOUR NAME: Judith Dulberger DATE: March 1987
YOUR ADDRESS: 108 Green St., Ithaca, N.Y. TELEPHONE: (607) 272-1713
ORGANIZATION (if any): Ithaca Dept. of Planning & Development

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S): 225 Fall Creek Drive
2. COUNTY: Tompkins TOWN/CITY: Ithaca VILLAGE:
3. STREET LOCATION: South side Fall Creek Dr. opposite Highland Ave.
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public □ b. private □
5. PRESENT OWNER: ______________________ ADDRESS: ______________________
6. USE: Original: residential Present: residential
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes □ No □
   Interior accessible: Explain ______________________

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL: a. clapboard □ b. stone □ c. brick □ d. board and batten □
   e. cobblestone □ f. shingles □ g. stucco □ other:
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM: ______________________ (if known)
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints □
   b. wood frame with light members □
   c. masonry load bearing walls □
   d. metal (explain) ______________________
   e. other ______________________
10. CONDITION: a. excellent □ b. good □ c. fair □ d. deteriorated □
11. INTEGRITY: a. original site □ b. moved □ if so, when?
   c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

12. PHOTO: 13. MAP:  

[Image of a house and a map of the area]
14. THREATS TO BUILDING:  a. none known  XX  b. zoning  □  c. roads  □  
d. developers  □  e. deterioration  □  
f. other:  

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:  
a. barn  □  b. carriage house  □  c. garage  □  
d. privy  □  e. shed  □  f. greenhouse  □  
g. shop  □  h. gardens  □  
i. landscape features: fully-grown fir trees; some foundation shrubs  
j. other:  and plantings  

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING  (check more than one if necessary):  
a. open land  □  b. woodland  □  
c. scattered buildings  □  d. densely built-up  □  e. commercial  □  
f. industrial  □  g. residential  ☑  
h. other:  Rear facade opens on to Fall Creek gorge; main  
facade opposite suspension foot bridge across gorge  

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:  
(Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)  
225 Fall Creek Drive is one of approximately 145 structures in the proposed Cornell Heights  
Historic District, an early-twentieth planned residential park and suburban development in the  
northeast section of the city of Ithaca.  

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE  (including interior features if known):  
This is a symmetrical, 2-story, 3-bay Colonial Revival residence with side gables and a 1-story  
screened porch extending from the southeast facade. The building features a simple central  
entrance portico with a flat roof supported by wooden Doric columns. A double doorway is flanked by  
leaded side-lights and pilasters. The building’s central bay rises to a second floor bay window  
and to a large central gabled dormer with Palladian window above. A wide eave board surrounds the  
building which is sided with wooden shingles on the second floor and clapboard on the first floor.  

SIGNIFICANCE  
There is a first floor bay window to the left of the main *(see below)  

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION:  1901 ————  

ARCHITECT:  John T. Parsons (Cornell University, College of Architecture)  

BUILDER:  unknown  

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:  
This was one of the earliest structures erected in the Cornell Heights residential park. It was  
built for David Hoy, Registrar for Cornell University. Hoy lived here through the early 1920's.  
Other occupants have included Lane Cooper and Howard B. Meek at various times throughout the  
1930's and early 1940's. Both Cooper and Meek were professors at Cornell University. In 1946,  
Harold E. B. Speight, dean of students at Cornell, is listed as the occupant at 225 Fall Creek Drive  
in Ithaca city directories.  
*(Part 18 continued): entrance. Second floor windows are 9/1 double-hung sash; first floor  
windows are a combination of 9/1 and 12/1 double-hung sash.  

21. SOURCES:  Ithaca City Directories  
Sanborn Insurance Maps 1893-1924)  
Carol U. Sisler, Enterprising Families (Ithaca, N.Y.: Enterprise  
Publishing, 1986)  

22. THEME: