## COMMUNITY LIFE COMMISSION

**AGENDA ITEM:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Voting Item?</th>
<th>Presenter(s)</th>
<th>Time Allotted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Call to Order</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Chair, Lisa Swayze</td>
<td>15 Mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Agenda Review</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Review and Approval of Minutes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Statements from the Public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Commission Response</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Art: 3 proposals: &quot;Giraffe Box&quot; by Rusty Keeler, &quot;Aikido&quot; by Melody Often and &quot;The 'Other' World&quot; by Annabelle Popa;</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Megan Wilson, Senior Planner</td>
<td>15 Mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing: No item on Agenda</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth: No item on Agenda</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communities: IC Strategic Planning</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Carly McClinsey</td>
<td>15 mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability: Plastic Bag Ban</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Thomas Shelley</td>
<td>30 Mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Look Ahead: Agenda Review</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15 Mins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting Wrap-Up</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>7:30 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Announcements</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Next Meeting Date: April 22, 2019</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Review Agenda Items for Next Meeting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4 Adjourn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Notes:

The Community Life Commission is charged with providing the Common Council, appropriate committees thereof, the City's quasi-judicial boards, and staff with advisory research, public input, and analysis for ensuring that the City of Ithaca remains a desirable place to live, work, and visit.

If you have a disability that will require special arrangements to be made in order for you to fully participate in the meeting, please contact the City Clerk at 274-6570 at least 48 hours before the meeting.

Out of consideration for the health of other individuals, please refrain from using perfume/cologne and other scented personal care products at City of Ithaca meetings. Thank you for your cooperation and understanding.
Regarding the two proposed Murals for Dryden Road Garage and Seneca Road Garage.

These are very large murals and therefore they 'set mood' in and around the garages. People see/feel this atmosphere at the beginning and end of each day.

I feel that the proposed scene for Dryden Road communicates fighting, violence, and abuse and I think it is very 'disquieting' in this regard, and inappropriate.

Regarding the proposed scene for the Seneca Garage - as an example the large mural of the flowers currently on the east end of Seneca Garage is very emotionally uplifting, serene, and calming. It has a very pleasant vibe. It sets a very nice mood for the day, or at the end of a long day.

The proposed underwater scene for Seneca is moving in the right direction and more consistent with the flowers. However, the yellow sea creature is really creepy, and unfortunately so much dominates the scene that it overshadows the peaceful elements of the work.

I do creative writing, painting and sculpture, and understand that artists want to express themselves - but this is art that impacts the emotions of hundreds of our patrons on a daily basis and I would vote that it be more 'mainstream' and uplifting to the patrons and public as a whole.

Please, I hope you carry my concerns forward.

1. I would not like the fighting scene at all. I would ask that if anything is done at Dryden Garage it would be something inspiring and uplifting (we have enough violence these days).
2. Alter the seascape with an attractive species in place of the scary yellow fish.

Thank you for the opportunity to voice my concerns,

Peter Messmer
Director of Parking

I do not object to any of the murals.

Carol Mallison

I do not have strong feelings either way about the first proposal, giraffe box. The third proposal, Other World is not only beautiful but thought provoking. I have mixed feeling about the second proposal. It could be thought provoking but I have mixed feelings about a mural showing violence of any kind.
We like the Aikido Garage Wall.

We think that the "The Other World" mural is a bit gloomy and the eel looks angry. If the fish were either native to NY or the fish were fun and colorful we would like it, but presently it is not inspiring us to help the ocean as the artist would like. The artists' previous work is much more fun and whimsical, why isn't this one like those?

Thank you very much,
Erica

Normally you ask for input and I don't respond because I typically like the proposals. Unfortunately I am only responding because I think proposal #3 is displeasing and off putting. I would be sad to see such a angry, mean looking eel on the side of the Seneca St garage forever. I like the concept of being under water but wonder whether the main water animal could be something not so grim (ex: dolphin). If the artist wants to depict the trouble that the ocean is in, then she is better off being more direct and painting garbage under/on the ocean.

I would like to mention how much I LOVE the previous work of Annabelle and I wish she could do something more detailed like those examples. Those are amazing!

The other two are alright but nothing spectacular like some of the other Ithaca murals.

Sorry for responding with only negativity.

Good luck.

Renee Andrews, Lab. Tech.
City of Ithaca
Water Treatment Plant

I wanted to respond on behalf of the DIA to indicate that all three pieces are well done and should make an appreciable positive difference to their immediate locales. I am particularly impressed with the piece submitted for the Seneca Garage.

Thanks for continuing to program for more public art.

Gary Ferguson
Downtown Ithaca Alliance
all great ideas

Pat Kraft
Collegetown property and business owner
To: Community Life Commission

From: Megan Wilson, Senior Planner
     Alex Phillips, Planner

Date: March 13, 2019

RE: 2019 Murals – Round 1 Recommendations

As you know, the Community Life Commission (CLC) agreed to change the City's mural review process last fall. The change in procedures established two deadlines for proposals (February 15th and May 15th) that would allow final approval to happen during warmer months for painting. A Mural Subcommittee was also established to undertake a more detailed review of proposals, collect public comments, and make a recommendation on proposals to the CLC. After reviewing the subcommittee’s work, the CLC will make its formal recommendation to the Common Council. Common Council is ultimately responsible for approving artwork to be installed on City property.

The first deadline under these new procedures was February 15, 2019, and five proposals were submitted. Planning staff worked with CLC member Rusty Keeler to establish the 2019 Mural Subcommittee, which included Jim Garmhausen (mural artist), Samantha Hillson (former Public Art Commission member), John Spence (Executive Director, Community Arts Partnership), and Jay Stooks (mural artist). The group met for its initial review of the proposals on February 26th and asked staff to circulate three of the proposals for public comment. These proposals were: "Giraffe Box" by Rusty Keeler (electrical box at NE corner of S. Albany St. & S. Titus Ave.); "Aikido" by Melody Often (Dryden Road Parking Garage); and "The 'Other' World" by Annabelle Popa (Seneca Street Parking Garage). The subcommittee also asked staff to work with the remaining two artists to identify alternative locations for their proposals and encourage them to resubmit in May.

The Mural Subcommittee met again on March 12th to review public comment. The public response to the proposals was mixed. Members made the following comments and recommendations on individual proposals:

1 Rusty Keeler submitted a mural proposal in February and did not serve on the Mural Subcommittee for Round 1. He will join the group for the second round of proposals in May.
“Giraffe Box” by Rusty Keeler (Electrical Box at S. Albany Street & S. Titus Avenue)
Public comment on this proposal was neutral. This particular electrical box is scheduled for replacement within the next few years. The subcommittee recommends approval of this proposal for the current City-owned box.

“Aikido” by Melody Often (Dryden Rd. Parking Garage)
The proposal is not intended to communicate or promote violence or fighting. It is intended to highlight a relationship and the role of power. It features a powerful female African-American figure, which is often absent from public art. The artist’s work is of high quality, and the proposal features bold colors that will enliven the space. That said, the subcommittee acknowledged that there is a lot of openness surrounding this piece and much is left to personal interpretation. While it is good to have art that is thought-provoking and encourages conversation, there should be a way to learn more about the design and the artist’s intent. The subcommittee recommends this proposal for approval but also recommends that access to the artist’s statement be provided.

“Other World” by Annabelle Popa (Seneca Street Parking Garage)
Most negative comments about this proposal were focused on the eel. The subcommittee did not find the design to be frightening and disagreed with asking the artist to alter her design, noting that asking an artist to change the central component of a design is to ask for a new design altogether. The artist’s work is of high quality, colorful and bold and is worthy of a prominent location. The subcommittee recommends this proposal for approval for the exterior of the Seneca Street Parking Garage at the corner of N. Tioga Street and E. Seneca Street.

Planning staff will attend the March 18th Community Life Commission meeting to discuss the proposals and the review process and seek the Commission’s recommendation on the three recommended proposals. The proposals and the submitted public comments are attached for your review. If you have any questions prior to the meeting, please contact us at mwilson@cityofithaca.org or aphillips@cityofithaca.org.
PROPOSAL # 1:

GIRAFFE BOX

NE CORNER OF S ALBANY & S TITUS
Electric box location

RUSTY KEELER
GIRAFFE BOX
PROPOSAL # 1:

GIRAFFE BOX

This corner is a high traffic area for cars and pedestrians/dog walkers and a “welcome to Ithaca” point for daily commuters. I thought it would be fun to set a playful tone for drivers as they drive into the city and also have a deeper layer of positivity for people walking close to the box.

MATERIALS

- Brushes
- Paint
  - Yellow Paint
  - Brown Paint

BUDGET

- $40

Dimensions

- n/a
PROPOSAL #1:

GIRAFFE BOX

PREVIOUS WORKS
RUSTY KEELER
PROPOSAL #2:

AIKIDO GARAGE WALL

DRYDEN ROAD GARAGE
114 Dryden Rd, Ithaca, NY, 14850

MELODY OFTEN
AIKIDO GARAGE WALL
PROPOSAL # 2:

AIKIDO GARAGE WALL

An Aikido mural showing the gentle use of power on wall at bottom of Dryden Rd. Collegetown Garage.

MATERIALS

- Brushes
- Ladders
- Stirrers
- Dropcloth
- Buckets
- Water Jugs
- Rags
- Paint
  - Blue Paint
  - Yellow Paint
  - Red or Brown Paint
  - Black Paint
  - White Paint

BUDGET

$500

DIMENSIONS

n/a
PROPOSAL # 2:

AIKIDO GARAGE WALL

PREVIOUS WORKS
MELODY OFTEN
PROPOSAL #3:
THE ‘OTHER’ WORLD

SENeca STREET GARAGE
215 N Tioga St, Ithaca, NY, 14850

ANNABELLE POPA
THE ‘OTHER’ WORLD
THE ‘OTHER’ WORLD

“The Other World” is a mural depicting life underwater. Often throughout history civilizations have ‘fetishized’ and objectified other cultures in order to benefit from them without giving back to support culture - I feel we are now doing the same to ocean life. While there are countless of fundraisers and companies claim that they help fund research to help the oceans, we need to take matters in our own hands and instead of throwing money at the problem, help in any little way we can. It is easy to destroy something when it is out of sight. I hope this mural will make viewers feel that they are physically in the ocean which will keep it in their frame of mind.

MATERIALS
- Montana 94 Spray Cans
- Brushes
- Acrylic Ink
- Tarp

BUDGET
- $300

DIMENSIONS
- n/a
PROPOSAL # 3:

THE ‘OTHER’ WORLD

PREVIOUS WORKS
MELODY OFTEN