ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION (ILPC)

NOTICE OF MEETING & AGENDA

The regular monthly meeting of the ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION will be held at 6:00 p.m. on Tuesday, February 15, 2022. This meeting will be held remotely as permitted by legislation S.50001 and A.40001, which extends virtual access to public meetings granted by the Governor’s Executive Order 202.1.

A live stream is available at https://www.youtube.com/channel/UC7RtJN1P_RFaFW2IVCnTrDg. If you are a member of the public who wants to follow the meeting but do not want to make comments, please simply watch the live stream. If you are a member of the public wishing to make a comment, you should also follow the meeting via the live stream, as well as join the meeting via Zoom. (You will be placed in a waiting room until the Chair opens the public comment period.)

To join the meeting with a smartphone, tablet, or computer go to https://zoom.us/j/92673617267?pwd=b2s3WHFFS3JMOGE0UWUxYW9YZWc3Zz09
Or dial in by telephone at +1 646 558 8656 US
Meeting ID: 926 7361 7267
Password: 010679

Written comments can also be emailed to Anya Harris at aharris@cityofithaca.org or sent via USPS to Planning Division; 108 E. Green St.; Ithaca, NY 14850. Please indicate if you would like them to be read into the record.

I. PUBLIC HEARINGS

A. 625 University Avenue, University Hill Historic District – Proposal to Rehabilitate the West Porch, Including the In-kind Replacement of the Columns, Pilasters, and Balustrades, Repair of Deteriorated Entablature Elements, Repointing Stone Masonry, and Installation of Metal Guardrails.
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1425

B. 309 North Tioga Street, DeWitt Park Historic District- Proposal to Replace 25 Aluminum Sash Windows on the North and South Elevations with Vinyl, Double-Hung Insert Units.
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1426

II. PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS OF INTEREST

III. NEW BUSINESS

- Downtown West Historic District – Lighting Discussion [Anisa Mendizabal, Community Development Planner, Ithaca Urban Renewal Agency, to attend.]

IV. OLD BUSINESS

- 223 South Albany Street, Henry St. John Historic District – Retroactive Requests for Approval: Removal of 1-Over-1 Wood Sash in Six Windows on the South Elevation and Installation of Six, 1-Over-1 Vinyl Insert Units in the Same Location; and Removal of a Wood Entrance Door
on the West Elevation and the Installation of a Fiberglass Entrance in the Same Location
[Application TABLED – 12/20/21]
https://www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter/Index/1404

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
• December 2021 and January 2022

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS
• 2021 Staff Approval Report
• 2021 Annual Report to the Mayor and Common Council [under separate electronic cover]

VII. ADJOURNMENT

ACCESSING ONLINE MEETING MATERIALS:
Online meeting materials, like applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness and supporting materials, are available electronically via the "Document Center" on the City web site (www.cityofithaca.org/DocumentCenter), under "Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission" > "Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness" and in the relevant address folder. Please do not hesitate to contact our office if you have any questions or you need any assistance accessing the meeting materials.

"An Equal Opportunity Employer with commitment to workforce diversification."
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 625 University Avenue is located within the University Hill Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 2003, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, dated January 25, 2022, was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Catherine A. Blakemore on behalf of property owner Richmond Property Group, including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) eight photographs documenting existing conditions; (3) a letter from City Housing Inspector Julie Daum, dated June 3, 2021, regarding Housing Code violations at the subject property; and (4) four drawings prepared by HOLT Architects and titled “Cover Sheet,” G001 (July 29, 2021), “West Balcony Plans, Elevations, and Details,” A101.1 (July 29 2021), “Demolition Plan and Elevations and Masonry Restoration,” AD101 (January 25, 2022), and “West Balcony Plans, Elevations, and Details,” A101 (January 25, 2022), and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has reviewed the entry in the annotated list of properties included within the University Hill Historic District for 625 University Avenue, and the City of Ithaca’s University Hill Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, as stated in the narrative Description of Proposed Change(s), the project involves the rehabilitation of the west porch, including: the replacement of 10 wood columns, 2 wood pilasters, and 5 sections of wood balustrade; the installation of a metal guardrail system above the replaced sections of wood balustrade; the repair or replacement of deteriorated or missing elements of the entablature; and repointing the rusticated stone masonry piers and installation of through flashing beneath the cast stone caps, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant (has/has not) provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on February 15, 2022, now therefore be it
RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

The period of significance for the area now known as the University Hill Historic District is identified in the City of Ithaca’s University Hill Historic District Summary Significance Statement as 1867-1927.

As indicated in the entry in the annotated list of properties included within the University Hill Historic District, the Renaissance Revival Style building at 625 University Avenue was constructed as the Alpha Tau Omega Lodge in 1901. It was extensively remodeled in the Colonial Revival Style 1908 after a fire that destroyed the building’s original roof.

Constructed within the period of significance of the University Hill Historic District and possessing a high level of integrity, the property is a contributing element of the University Hill Historic District.

In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction, or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Principle #2 The historic features of a property located within, and contributing to the significance of, an historic district shall be altered as little as possible and any alterations made shall be compatible with both the historic character of the individual property and the character of the district as a whole.

Principle #3 New construction located within an historic district shall be compatible with the historic character of the district within which it is located.

Standard #2 The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property will be avoided.

Standard #6 Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. When the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a
distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard #9  New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard #10  New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

With respect to Principle #2, Standard #2, and Standard #9, the rehabilitation of the west porch (will/will not) remove distinctive materials (and will/and will not) alter features and spaces that characterize the property. [If “will” describe feature or space and how it will be inappropriately altered]

With respect to Principle #2 and Standard #6, as shown in the submitted existing conditions photographs, the severity of the deterioration of the columns, pilasters, and railings requires their replacement. The proposed new work (will/will not) match the old in design, color, texture, material and other visual qualities.

Also with respect to Principle #2, Principle #3, and Standard #9, the proposed metal guardrails (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not ]

With respect to Standard #10, the proposed metal guardrails (can/cannot) be removed in the future without impairment of the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment. [if “cannot”, describe why it cannot]

RESOLVED, that, based on the findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the University Hill Historic District, as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further,

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further
RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 0

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff any deviation from the approved plans, including but not limited to changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses, may result in the issuance by the Building Department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date: 1/25/2022</th>
<th>Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): TBD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Applicant’s Name: Catherine A. Blakemore</td>
<td>Phone: 315.651.2726</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): <a href="mailto:crb@holt.com">crb@holt.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Property Address: 625 University Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): Sarah Layton</td>
<td>Richard Property Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner’s Mailing Address: 333 North Alabama Street</td>
<td>Suite 220</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):

- [ ] New Construction
- [ ] Addition
- [ ] Accessory Structure
- [ ] ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- [ ] Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- [ ] Signage
- [ ] Demolition
- [ ] ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

**Submittal Requirements**

All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

**STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:**

Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See *City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines* for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

**ILPC REVIEW:**

Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by *thorough* documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer's data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.
Description of Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The project includes restoration and modification of the 1st Floor West Balcony wood balustrades, columns, including bases and capitals as well as repairs/restoration of the entablature directly above up to the 2nd Floor roof deck drip edge. The work entails complete replacement of all wood columns (10 total), wood pilasters (2 total) and wood balustrades (5 total). Replacement components will be painted solid wood to match all existing profiles, shapes and sizes. The replacement balustrades will be modified by adding a painted welded metal guardrail system to the top the wood balustrade to correct a safety deficiency cited by the City of Ithaca, Building Division as noted on the attached House Inspection, dated June 03, 2021. The embedded (concealed) HSS tube section is needed to stiffen the metal guardrail frame and also to resist a linear load of 50 pounds per linear foot (plf) per BCNYS 1607.8.1 and a concentrated load in any direction of 200 pounds (lbs) per BCNYS 1607.8.1.1.

Repair and restoration of the entablature includes removal on non-historic replacement moldings and trim with new to match the existing historic moldings and trim. It also includes repair or replacement of water-damaged elements, again to with new to match the existing historic moldings and profiles. Elements with minor water damaged will be repaired in-place with wood preservative and consolidant products before being primed and painted. Elements with severe water damage will be repaired with a Dutchman or replaced depending on the extent of deterioration.

The project also includes masonry restoration. The masonry restoration scope includes 100% repointing of all stone masonry joints within project limit lines, including the capstones to ensure the structural integrity of the stone masonry below the wood columns. The capstones will be temporarily removed to accommodate the installation of thru-wall flashing to prevent moisture from migrating inside the stone masonry piers/walls below.

Reasons for Proposed Changes (use additional sheets if necessary):

The Richmond Property Group contracted with HOLT Architects on behalf of the Alpha Tau Omega Fraternity requesting architectural and engineering services to develop permit drawings that would allow for the cited violations on the attached House Inspection, dated June 03, 2021 to be corrected. HOLT Architects along with Consulting Structural Engineers Jensen BRV developed that attached permit drawings, dated 29 July 2021 that included adding a steel guardrail system behind the existing wood balustrade in order to correct the cited guardrail height deficiency. This design was developed because the existing wood balustrades and columns did not have the structural integrity/capacity to support the current submitted design due to their age and condition. After receiving a bids for the 29 July 2021 permit drawings the Owner decided restructure the project to include restoration/replacement of existing wood balustrades and columns so that the steel guardrail system needed to resolve the cited guardrail height deficiency could be downsized and integrated with the wood balustrade system as per the 25 January 2022 project scope and design being submitted for review and consideration. Attached are
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is be *plainly visible* from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

**Applicant’s Statement:**

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

- [ ] photographs of existing conditions
- [ ] site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
- [ ] drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
- [ ] description of design details and materials to be used
- [ ] samples of proposed materials
- [ ] scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
- [ ] historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
- [ ] statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
- [ ] other (specify): ____________________________________________________________

**Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED):** [Signature] **Date:** 1/25 2022

**STAFF USE ONLY:**

Date Received: ________________

Staff Review: [ ] yes [ ] no Approved: [ ] yes [ ] no Referred to ILPC: [ ] yes [ ] no

ILPC Review: [ ] yes [ ] no

Date of Public Hearing: _____________
EXISTING CONDITIONS PHOTO
June 3, 2021

Richmond Property Group, Attn. M. Higgins  
333 N. Alabama Street  Suite 220  
Indianapolis, IN 46204

RE: Inspection of 625 University Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850

Dear M Higgins,

An inspection was scheduled for your building at 625 University Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850, Alpha Tau Omega on, June 3, 2021 for a Certificate of Compliance inspection.

I have listed below the conditions that do not meet the health and safety standards of the Multiple Residence Law (MRL), City of Ithaca Municipal Housing Code (HC), NYS Building Code (BC), NYS Fire Code (FC), NYS Property Maintenance Code (PMC), and/or other applicable codes:

**General:**

1. The building's west exterior siding (wood shingles) require maintenance, the paint had deteriorated. Additionally, the west porch fascia board and column paint is required to be repaired where peeling. The north porch pipe rail paint and the window sills located in rooms #307 and #204 had deteriorated as well. Please repair "in kind" (matching appearance), due to the historic designation of the property. (PMCNYS 304.2) (HC 210-16B) *(VID: 6)*

2. The stair handrail and porch guardrail height were found to be noncompliant. The east porch handrail measured approx. 23 inches above the nosing of the stair and the east porch guardrail measured approx. 26 inches above the porch floor. The west porch guardrail measured approx. 28 inches above the porch floor. They are required to be a minimum height of 30 inches above the nosing and/or floor surface respectively, please repair. Note that a Building Permit and ILPC approval are required for any exterior alterations, due to the historic designation of the property. *This Conditional item is required to be completed by 8/6/2021 as per the April 2020 signed Compliance plan. Or you may pursue a NYS variance. If you decide to apply for a NYS variance, please contact the Housing Inspector for further details.* (PMCNYS 307.1) *(VID: 2)*
RE: Inspection of 625 University Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850

Common 1FL - 01st Floor, Porch, Exterior:

3. The top stair tread had deteriorated on the east porch floor and two boards were broken in the same location on the north porch floor, repair and maintain stair treads on both porches as required. (PMCNYS 304.10) (HC 210-14A) (VID: 4)

4. The top left newel post had deteriorated with exposed nails on the east porch, repair as required. Please note that repairs must be made "in kind" (matching appearance), due to the historic designation of the property. (PMCNYS 304.10) (HC 210-13B) (VID: 5)

Please note that a Certificate of Compliance cannot be issued if there is an outstanding warrant/ticket for a violation of any section of the Exterior Property Maintenance Code of the City of Ithaca. To verify that there is not an outstanding warrant/ticket, please call City Court at (607) 216-6660.

I have scheduled a re-inspection on **7/2/2021**, at **8:00 AM**. However, if this time is inconvenient or not acceptable, please call the Building Department at least seven (7) days prior to the scheduled re-inspection. If this re-inspection is scheduled for the receipt of forms and the forms are returned to our office prior to the re-inspection date, this appointment will be canceled upon receipt of the required forms.

Since we must inspect all areas of the building, the tenants’ permission is required to enter their apartment for this inspection. It is the Building Department's policy to not enter a tenant’s apartment without 24 hours notice.

Please remember that there is a fee associated with this inspection. The fee schedule includes a basic room fee, administrative fee, and a violation charge. These charges are outlined in the Ithaca Housing Code (HC), Section 210-43F. The document is available online or by calling the Building Department at 274-6508 and requesting the above document. To view the complete Housing Standards Ordinance visit www.cityofithaca.org and select "City Code".

Thank you for your cooperation.
Richmond Property Group, Attn. M. Higgins
333 N. Alabama Street   Suite 220
Indianapolis, IN 46204

RE: Inspection of 625 University Avenue, Ithaca, NY 14850

Julie Daum
Housing Inspector

Enclosure
cc: Cornell University
# BALCONY AND PORCH ALTERATIONS AT

**625 UNIVERSITY AVENUE**  
**ALPHA TAU OMEGA**  
**ITHACA, NEW YORK 14850**

---

**HOLT Architects, P.C.**  
Architects, Planners, and Interior Designers  
619 W. State Street, Ithaca, New York 14850  
132 E. Jefferson Street, Syracuse, New York 13202  
Tel 607.273.7600  
www.holt.com

---

## PROJECT LOCATION PLANS

---

## DRAWING LIST

**GENERAL**  
G001 COVER SHEET

**ARCHITECTURAL**  
A051.1 WEST BALCONY PLANS, ELEVATIONS AND DETAILS - PRINT IN COLOR  
A051.2 EAST PORCH PLANS, ELEVATIONS AND DETAILS - PRINT IN COLOR

---

## PROJECT INFORMATION

**DATE:** 29 JULY 2021  
**JOB NUMBER:** 2021-074  
BUILDING USE CLASSIFICATION: RESIDENTIAL R2

---

**G001**
# BALCONY AND PORCH ALTERATIONS AT

## 625 UNIVERSITY AVENUE

### ALPHA TAU OMEGA

**ITHACA, NEW YORK 14850**

HOLT Architects, P.C.
Architects, Planners, and Interior Designers
619 W. State Street, Ithaca, New York 14850
132 E. Jefferson Street, Syracuse, New York 13202
Tel 607.273.7600  www.holt.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROJECT LOCATION PLANS</th>
<th>DRAWING LIST</th>
<th>PROJECT INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G001  COVER SHEET</td>
<td>A001  ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN</td>
<td>DATE: 25 JANUARY 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A010  DEMOLITION PLAN</td>
<td>A011  BUILDING PLANS AND ELEVATIONS</td>
<td>JOB NUMBER: 2021-074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A012  MASONRY PLAN</td>
<td>A015  RESIDENTIAL R2</td>
<td>BUILDING USE CLASSIFICATION:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*West Balcony Plans, Elevations and Details*
625 University (625 Stewart Ave.) 1901 Photo 61
Alpha Tau Omega Lodge

Description:
This two-and-one-half story largely symmetrical Italian Renaissance-style residence, with shallow pitch hipped-roof and broadly overhanging eaves, was built as a fraternity. A flat-roof porch is set back from the façade on the west elevation. A central eyebrow roof dormer punctuates the roof. The shorter, flared third story, which is covered in wood shingle siding, has a series of seven one-over-one sash windows evenly spaced on the front façade. A horizontal wood band separates the second and third stories. A trio of slender one-over-one sash windows is centered in the shingle-sided, flared second story and is flanked by larger matching windows. Each window features window surround with pilasters topped by prominent crown molding. A central portico on the first story dominates the façade. Grouped Tuscan columns resting on rusticated ashlar piers support the portico, which has a second-story railing above. Half-height square posts with decorative tops support the simple square baluster railing. The double entrance door with a transom and dentil molding above is sheltered by the portico and flanked by sidelights, pilasters and fluted engaged columns. The first story is covered in yellow brick and has flat brick arches above the windows. Large one-over-one sash windows flanked by slender matching windows are located on each side of the portico on the first story. The fieldstone foundation has a large stone arch west of the portico.

The large west elevation porch has grouped Tuscan columns resting on rusticated ashlar piers. A square baluster railing stretches between the piers, and a matching railing encloses the roof of the porch. A large, square bay window with pilasters dominates the east elevation. Square baluster railing is located on the flat roof of the bay window. A small, hipped-roof entry porch covers a secondary entrance, also on the east elevation.

Significance:
Contributing.

Alpha Tau Omega is architecturally significant as one of the group of Italian Renaissance-style fraternities constructed at Cornell during the beginning of the twentieth century. With its block-like massing, center entrance portico, and gentle-pitched hipped-roof with broad eaves the building displays the prominent elements of the Italian Renaissance style. The classically detailed grouped Tuscan columns set on rusticated ashlar piers at the entrance, and use of eyebrow dormers usually associated with the Colonial Revival style, date from a later remodeling following a 1908 fire that destroyed the structures original gambrel roof, with gambrel-roofed dormer, and attic portions of the house. These changes create a more eclectic example of the style. The structure has retained a high level of architectural integrity.
This building is historically significant as a representative example of the numerous fraternity buildings constructed at the west border of the Cornell campus at the beginning of the twentieth century to fulfill Cornell’s increasing residential needs. This building is sited immediately west of the Cornell campus on land purchased in 1860 by Ezra Cornell’s eldest son and a Governor of New York State, Alonzo Cornell, from Jeremiah Beebe, Ezra Cornell’s early employer. Alonzo sold this lot at the corner of University and Stewart Avenues to the Alpha Tau Fraternity in 1900, just prior to the sale of the remaining nine-acre holding to the Treman family for the construction of three family homes.
RESOLUTION: Moved by XXX, seconded by XXX.

WHEREAS, 309 North Tioga Street is located in the DeWitt Park Historic District, as designated under Section 228-3 of the City of Ithaca Municipal Code in 1971, and as listed on the New York State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1971, and

WHEREAS, as set forth in Section 228-4 of the Municipal Code, an Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness dated January 25, 2022 was submitted for review to the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC) by Katrina Thaler Medeiros on behalf of property owner TBA, Inc., including the following: (1) two narratives respectively titled Description of Proposed Change(s) and Reasons for Changes(s); (2) a letter from Jeff Bergey at South Seneca Windows to the property owner concerning the condition of the windows; (3) three photographs documenting existing conditions; and (4) one sheet of product literature on 1000 Series Vinyl Windows, and

WHEREAS, the ILPC has also reviewed the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form for 309 North Tioga Street, and the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, and

WHEREAS, the proposed project involves replacing 25 aluminum sash windows on the north and south elevations with vinyl, double-hung insert units, and

WHEREAS, the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness is a Type II Action under the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act and the City Environmental Quality Review Ordinance for which no further environmental review is required, and

WHEREAS, the applicant has provided sufficient documentation and information to evaluate impacts of the proposal on the subject property and surrounding properties, and

WHEREAS, a Public Hearing for the purpose of considering approval of the Application for Certificate of Appropriateness was conducted at the regularly scheduled ILPC meeting on February 15, 2022, now therefore be it

RESOLVED, that the ILPC has made the following findings of fact concerning the property and the proposal:

As identified in the City of Ithaca’s DeWitt Park Historic District Summary Statement, the period of significance for the area now known as the DeWitt Park Historic District is 1820-1930.

As indicated in the New York State Building-Structure Inventory Form, the commercial building at 309 North Tioga Street was constructed in 1975.

Constructed outside of the period of significance of the DeWitt Park Historic District, the property is a non-contributing element of the DeWitt Park Historic District.
In consideration of this and all approvals of proposals for alterations, new construction or demolition in historic districts, the ILPC must determine that the proposed exterior work will not have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical or architectural significance and value of either the landmark or, if the improvement is within a district, of the neighboring improvements in such district. In considering architectural and cultural value, the Commission shall consider whether the proposed change is consistent with the historic value and the spirit of the architectural style of the landmark or district in accordance with Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code. In making this determination, the Commission is guided by the principles set forth in Section 228-6B of the Municipal Code, as further elaborated in Section 228-6C, and by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and in this case specifically the following principles and Standards:

Standard #9 New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

As a non-contributing structure, 309 North Tioga Street, by definition, does not possess historic materials or features that are subject to protection under the Principles enumerated in Section 228-5 of the Municipal Code or the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. The ILPC’s evaluation of the proposed work is therefore limited to the assessment of the impact of the proposed work on adjacent historic structures in the district and on the DeWitt Park Historic District as a whole, with the guiding principle being that the proposed work must not further reduce the compatibility of the non-contributing structure with its historic environment.

With respect to Standard #9, the proposed windows (are/are not) compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the historic environment. [if “not”, describe qualities of the project that are not compatible and in what ways they are not]

RESOLVED, that, based on findings set forth above, the proposal (will/will not) have a substantial adverse effect on the aesthetic, historical, or architectural significance of the 309 North Tioga Street and the DeWitt Park Historic District as set forth in Section 228-6, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission determines that the proposal (meets/does not meet) the criteria for approval under Section 228-6 of the Municipal Code, and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ILPC (approves/denies) the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following condition(s):
RECORD OF VOTE:
Moved by: 0
Seconded by: 0
In Favor: 0
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Absent: 0
Vacancies: 1

Notice: Failure on the part of the owner or the owner’s representative to bring to the attention of the ILPC staff, any deviation from the approved plans, including, but not limited to, changes required by other involved agencies or that result from unforeseen circumstances as construction progresses may result in the issuance by the building department of a stop work order or revocation of the building permit.
APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Ithaca Landmarks Preservation Commission (ILPC)
Planning & Economic Development Division
City of Ithaca, 108 E. Green St., 3rd Floor, Ithaca, NY 14850
Bryan McCracken | Ph: 607-274-6555 | bmccracken@cityofithaca.org
www.cityofithaca.org/boardscommittees/ilpc/index.cfm

Date: 1/25/2022  Building Permit Application # (REQUIRED): 40358

Applicant’s Name: Kat Viana Telhamiairos  Phone: 607-272-8314
Applicant’s E-Mail address (REQUIRED): ktmedeiros@ithakaandthule.com

Property Address: 309 N. Tioga Street 1/310 W. Aurora Street

Owner’s Name (if different from Applicant): TBA, Inc.
Owner’s Mailing Address: 309 N. Tioga Street, 2nd Floor, Ithaca NY 14850

Proposed Work Includes (check all that apply):
- [ ] New Construction
- [ ] Addition
- [ ] Accessory Structure
- [ ] ALTERATION: Primary Structure
- [ ] Site Changes (paving, fencing, patios, etc.)
- [ ] Signage
- [ ] Demolition
- [ ] ALTERATION: Accessory Structure

Submittal Requirements
All documents are to be sent to the attention of Bryan McCracken at the above address.

STAFF-LEVEL REVIEW:
Submit one (1) hardcopy and one (1) electronic copy of application and attachments. See City of Ithaca Historic District & Landmark Design Guidelines for a description of work that is eligible for this expedited review process.

ILPC REVIEW:
Submit eleven (11) hardcopies and (1) one electronic copy of application form and all attachments. Complete applications must be received by 4:00 p.m. on the last Tuesday of the month, 14 days prior to the regular ILPC meeting at which the application will be reviewed. ILPC meetings are held the second Tuesday of each month.

Applications must be accompanied by thorough documentation of existing conditions and proposed changes, including (as applicable): photographs of existing conditions; site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change; drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation; description of design details and materials to be used (manufacturer’s data sheets may be used); samples of proposed materials; scale drawings of any proposed signs including colors, typeface, and illumination details; historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition; and a statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element that is proposed for replacement due to deterioration.

Page 1 of 3
ELECTRONIC SUBMISSIONS: You must provide electronic versions of ALL submitted documents. LARGE FILES: Incoming e-mails to the City must be under 10 MB in size (incl. message envelope), so either provide CD-ROM, flash/thumb drive, use a free file-sharing web site, like: www.hightail.com, www.dropbox.com, www.google.com/drive, etc., or split documents into smaller parts and send multiple e-mails/files to: aharris@cityofithaca.org and/or bmccracken@cityofithaca.org.

**Description of Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):

SEE ATTACHED.

**Reasons for Proposed Changes** (use additional sheets if necessary):

SEE ATTACHED.
TBA Inc.
Application for Certificate of Appropriateness
ILPC
January 25, 2022

Description of Proposed Changes and Reasons for the Change:

Applicant/Owner proposes to replace 25 windows (glass and window frame/panes) on the first and second floors on the North and South sides of the building located on the North Aurora Street side. The South side of the building faces the Unitarian Church and a parking lot. The North side of the building faces a parking lot and North Aurora Street.

The purpose for the window replacement is to improve energy efficiency with thicker glass panes and to replace existing and dilapidated window frames. The frames need to be replaced because they have deteriorated to such an extent that the windows are no longer insulated and have gaps between the frames and the interior and exterior walls which allows air to seep into the building from the exterior. Windows are cloudy from glass failure and condensation and the glass panes freeze or frost over in cold weather. Please see Letter from South Seneca Windows and pictures of windows and frames for further information about the poor condition of the existing windows.

Applicant/Owner proposes to replace with double hung vinyl window, (see spec sheet), Energy Star Qualified Windows with Low E/Argon Glass, with half screens in same size as the existing windows. The windows will be flush with the exterior of the building and have white trim, which is the current trim color.

The Applicant respectfully requests that the ILPC grants a Certificate of Appropriateness for Applicant/Owner’s Window Replacement project to allow for these very important energy efficient upgrades, with no real changes to the appearance or character of this non-contributing building to the historic district.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Respectfully submitted,

Katrina Thaler Medeiros

TBA Inc.
— REQUIRED PUBLIC NOTIFICATION —

Upon application for a Certificate of Appropriateness, a public notice of the proposal must be posted by the owner or owner’s representative on the property for a minimum of 10 days. This notice must remain in place until a decision to approve or deny the Certificate of Appropriateness has been made. The notice must be placed at or near the property line in the front yard, so it is plainly visible from the street, and, in cases where a property has frontage on more than one street, an additional sign must be placed at or near the property line on any additional street frontage.

Standard signs for this purpose are available for purchase from the City of Ithaca, Division of Planning and Economic Development, at a cost of $15.00 each. Alternatively, an applicant may create their own signs, as long as the following required content is included and the signs have dimensions of at least 18”x23”:

PROPOSED EXTERIOR OR SITE ALTERATIONS TO THIS PROPERTY WILL BE REVIEWED BY THE ITHACA LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION ON [INSERT DATE], BEGINNING AT 5:30 p.m. IN [INSERT LOCATION OF MEETING]. PUBLIC COMMENT MAY BE SUBMITTED IN ADVANCE OF, OR DURING, THE ABOVE-REFERENCED PUBLIC HEARING. FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT: BMcCRACKEN@CITYOFITHACA.ORG, 607-274-6555.

Applicant’s Statement:

I understand incomplete applications cannot be processed and will result in delay. This application is complete to the best of my knowledge and includes the following attachments (check all that apply):

☑ photographs of existing conditions
☑ site plans showing location and dimensions of proposed change
☑ drawings or sketches showing proposed changes on each affected elevation
☑ description of design details and materials to be used
☑ samples of proposed materials
☑ scale drawings of any proposed signs, including colors, typeface, and illumination details
☑ historic photographs, if the intention of the project is to return a property to a documented prior condition
☑ statement from a qualified contractor or design professional attesting to the physical condition of any element proposed for replacement due to deterioration
☑ other (specify): ____________________________

Applicant’s Signature (REQUIRED): ____________________________ Date: 1/25/2022

STAFF USE ONLY:

Date Received: ____________________________
Staff Review: ☐ yes ☐ no  Approved: ☐ yes ☐ no  Referred to ILPC: ☐ yes ☐ no
ILPC Review: ☐ yes ☐ no
Date of Public Hearing: ________________
Dear Jeff,

Upon review of the windows at this location, we found them to be in significantly disrepair. They are steel frame, very inefficient, single pane with the glazing cracking, allowing for the single pane glass to potentially fall out and brake/injure someone. It is with these issues and concerns that we have provided the estimate for replacement of these windows.

Warm regards,

Jerry Bergey
Picture of first floor windows showing poor condition of window and frames – windows are basically frozen over with frost.
Picture of existing window frames showing poor condition of window frames.
Right side of Building shot from Aurora Street looking at building showing 11 of the windows that Applicant wishes to replace.
Our most popular 1000 Series window gives you a high quality, yet affordable window that is built for many years of enjoyable use. This mechanical window features a sturdy vinyl frame and reinforced aluminum sash corners.

- **Windows tilt in for easy cleaning** (except picture window).
- **Half screen is standard in windows** with a sliding sash. Full screen is optional.
- **Multi-chambered profiles provide greater insulation and energy efficiency.**
- **7/8” insulated glass with Guardian ClimaGuard Low E glass and Argon gas-filled units increases energy efficiency.**
- **Health Smart dual seal Super Spacer® warm edge insulated glass unit practically eliminates condensation and glass failures.**
- **Continuous dual weather-stripping on all contact points prevents air leaks through cracks.**
- **True sloped sill diverts water away from the interior of the home.**
- **Light Lift™ balance system for easy operation. Windows open and close with less than half the force of other windows.**
- **Limited lifetime warranty gives you protection for as long as you own your home and is transferable to a subsequent owner.**

1. Constant force system operation.
2. Deluxe night latch for safety and security.
4. Super Spacer helps protect against harmful condensation.
5. Triple weather strip at sill area.
6. Extruded ergonomic large lift rail.
7. Multi-chamber frame and sash creating an insulated air chamber.
8. Dual seal 7/8” high performance insulated glass.
9. Dual cam action lock and keeper system.
10. Dual weather stripping provides energy tight seal.
11. True sloped seal.
12. 100% virgin grade A-first generation vinyl.

**Colors (Interior/Exterior)**
1. White/White
2. Beige/Beige
3. Sand Tone/Sand Tone
4. Brown/Brown
5. Light Oak/White
6. Dark Oak/White
7. Light Oak/Beige

**Options**
1. Obscure Glass
2. Tinted Glass
3. Triple Pane
4. Nailing Flange (with or without J)
BUILDING-STRUCTURE INVENTORY FORM

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

UNIQUE SITE NO.: 109-40-1079801

DIVISION FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION
NEW YORK STATE PARKS AND RECREATION
ALBANY, NEW YORK (518) 474-0479

YOUR NAME: Mary Donohue
DATE: 10/30/76

YOUR ADDRESS: 111 Cascadilla Avenue
TELEPHONE: 277-0486

ORGANIZATION (if any): Landmarks Commission of Ithaca, NY

IDENTIFICATION
1. BUILDING NAME(S): Thaler and Thaler Law Office
2. COUNTY: Tompkins
3. STREET LOCATION: 309 N. Tioga St.
4. OWNERSHIP: a. public □  b. private □
5. PRESENT OWNER: Manley & Richard Thaler
6. USE: Original: Law Office
Present: Law Office
7. ACCESSIBILITY TO PUBLIC: Exterior visible from public road: Yes □ No □
Interior accessible: Explain Open during business hours

DESCRIPTION
8. BUILDING MATERIAL:
   a. clapboard □  b. stone □  c. brick □  d. board and batten □
   e. cobblestone □  f. shingles □  g. stucco □  other: metal panel wall
9. STRUCTURAL SYSTEM:
   a. wood frame with interlocking joints □
   b. wood frame with light members □
   c. masonry load bearing walls □
   d. metal (explain) STEEL SKELETAL SYSTEM
   e. other □
10. CONDITION:
   a. excellent □  b. good □  c. fair □  d. deteriorated □
11. INTEGRITY:
   a. original site □  b. moved □  if so, when?
   c. list major alterations and dates (if known):

12. PHOTO:

13. MAP:

EAST COURT
N. TIoga ST.

HP-1
14. THREATS TO BUILDING: 
   a. none known ☑
   b. zoning ☐
   c. roads ☐
   d. developers ☐
   e. deterioration ☐
   f. other: ____________

15. RELATED OUTBUILDINGS AND PROPERTY:
   a. barn ☐
   b. carriage house ☐
   c. garage ☐
   d. privy ☐
   e. shed ☐
   f. greenhouse ☐
   g. shop ☐
   h. gardens ☐
   i. landscape features: ____________
   j. other: Parking lot on west side (front facade)

16. SURROUNDINGS OF THE BUILDING (check more than one if necessary):
   a. open land ☐
   b. woodland ☐
   c. scattered buildings ☐
   d. densely built-up ☑
   e. commercial ☑
   f. industrial ☐
   g. residential ☐
   h. other: ____________

17. INTERRELATIONSHIP OF BUILDING AND SURROUNDINGS:
   (Indicate if building or structure is in an historic district)
   The building was included in the DeWitt Park Historic District which was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1971. The surrounding area includes a mixture of public and commercial buildings.

18. OTHER NOTABLE FEATURES OF BUILDING AND SITE (including interior features if known):
   The parking lot of this building was occupied by two residential structures, 309 and 311 North Tioga Street. (See attached sheet) 309 North Tioga is attached to the Prudential Building which faces on to Aurora Street and it was built as a two-story addition on the rear of the Prudential Building.

SIGNIFICANCE

19. DATE OF INITIAL CONSTRUCTION: 1975

   ARCHITECT: ________________

   BUILDER: ________________

20. HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL IMPORTANCE:

   (none)

21. SOURCES:

22. THEME:
## 2021 Staff Approvals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>HD or Individual</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Scope of Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1/20/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>407-409 E Seneca St</td>
<td>metal pipe rail installation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/8/2021</td>
<td>Downtown West</td>
<td>314 W State St</td>
<td>dumpster enclosure in the rear yard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/9/2021</td>
<td>Henry St. John</td>
<td>321 S Geneva St</td>
<td>in-kind roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/19/2021</td>
<td>DeWitt Park</td>
<td>207 E Court St</td>
<td>replace window glass with tempered glass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4/7/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>418 E Seneca</td>
<td>air source hear pump installation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/4/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>115 Heights Ct</td>
<td>in-kind roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/7/2021</td>
<td>University Hill</td>
<td>Llenroc, 100 Cornell Ave</td>
<td>localized copper flashing and slate roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/8/2021</td>
<td>University Hill</td>
<td>Llenroc, 100 Cornell Ave</td>
<td>in-kind window well replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/8/2021</td>
<td>Henry St. John</td>
<td>322 S Geneva St</td>
<td>install rear porch railing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/8/2021</td>
<td>Henry St. John</td>
<td>322 S Geneva St</td>
<td>installation of rear yard fence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/24/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>109 Triphammer</td>
<td>replace 2 doors and 5 windows</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/28/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>112-114 Ferris Pl</td>
<td>CofA extension request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/28/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>115 Orchard Pl</td>
<td>repave parking area and relocate side yard fence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/28/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>205 Thurston Ave</td>
<td>in-kind replacement of 2nd-story porch railing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/6/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>101 Orchard Pl</td>
<td>install screen panels on south porch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/8/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>504 Thurston Ave</td>
<td>modify railings existing fire escape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/27/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>608 E Seneca St</td>
<td>in-kind flat roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/12/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>900 Stewart Ave</td>
<td>in-kind rubber roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/13/2021</td>
<td>University Hill</td>
<td>625 University Ave</td>
<td>installation of pipe railing for code compliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/17/2021</td>
<td>DeWitt Park</td>
<td>207 E Court St</td>
<td>installation of a rear yard fence and gate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/20/2021</td>
<td>University Hill</td>
<td>625 University Ave</td>
<td>in-kind soffit repair and localized shingle replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/17/2021</td>
<td>Henry St. John</td>
<td>218 S. Albany St</td>
<td>in-kind roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/30/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>109 Glen Pl</td>
<td>in-kind roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/1/2021</td>
<td>Henry St. John</td>
<td>206 S. Geneva St</td>
<td>air source heat pump installation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/3/2021</td>
<td>DeWitt Park</td>
<td>308 N. Cayuga St</td>
<td>in-kind soffit replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/15/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>116-116.5 Heights Court</td>
<td>in-kind roof asphalt shingle roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/15/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>117 Triphammer Rd (non contributing)</td>
<td>in-kind front door replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/4/2021</td>
<td>Henry St. John</td>
<td>309 W. Green St</td>
<td>in-kind flat roof replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/5/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>225 Fall Creek Dr</td>
<td>install range hood vent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Address</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/12/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>802 East Seneca Street</td>
<td>in-kind chimney brick replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/22/2021</td>
<td>Cornell Heights</td>
<td>120-26 Westbourne Ln</td>
<td>in-kind asphalt shingle and membrane roofing replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/9/2021</td>
<td>East Hill</td>
<td>505 East State Street</td>
<td>in-kind asphalt shingle roofing replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/15/2021</td>
<td>DeWitt Park</td>
<td>215 N. Cayuga St</td>
<td>repointing of red sandstone water table</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>